# Journal of Materials Chemistry A

Accepted Manuscript



This is an *Accepted Manuscript*, which has been through the Royal Society of Chemistry peer review process and has been accepted for publication.

Accepted Manuscripts are published online shortly after acceptance, before technical editing, formatting and proof reading. Using this free service, authors can make their results available to the community, in citable form, before we publish the edited article. We will replace this Accepted Manuscript with the edited and formatted Advance Article as soon as it is available.

You can find more information about *Accepted Manuscripts* in the **Information for Authors**.

Please note that technical editing may introduce minor changes to the text and/or graphics, which may alter content. The journal's standard <u>Terms & Conditions</u> and the <u>Ethical guidelines</u> still apply. In no event shall the Royal Society of Chemistry be held responsible for any errors or omissions in this *Accepted Manuscript* or any consequences arising from the use of any information it contains.



www.rsc.org/materialsA

## Journal of Materials Chemistry A

### ARTICLE

Cite this: DOI: 10.1039/x0xx00000x

Received 00th January 2015, Accepted 00th January 2015

DOI: 10.1039/x0xx00000x

www.rsc.org/

## Chromate conversion coated aluminium as lightweight and corrosion-resistant current collector for aqueous lithium-ion batteries

Saman Gheytani,<sup>a</sup> Yanliang Liang,<sup>a</sup> Yan Jing,<sup>a</sup> Jeff Q. Xu,<sup>b</sup> and Yan Yao<sup>\*ac</sup>

Aqueous batteries constructed using non-flammable water-based electrolytes have the potential to improve the safety and reduce the cost of energy storage to enable mass adoption of electric vehicles. The use of low-cost and lightweight aluminium foil as current collectors in aqueous batteries is tempting but also challenging due to corrosion reactions. Here we report chromate conversion coated (CCC) aluminium foil as corrosion-resistant current collectors in aqueous lithium-ion battery cathodes. CCC aluminium-based electrodes show better cycling stability and higher Coulombic efficiency than those fabricated on stainless steel and titanium foils. Furthermore, CCC aluminium foil suppresses oxygen evolution at high potentials. The plausibility to use such lightweight corrosion-resistant current collectors for aqueous batteries marks an important step toward low-cost, high-energy, and safe energy storage.

**Keywords:** Aqueous lithium-ion battery, corrosion, chromate conversion coating, oxygen evolution reaction

#### 1. Introduction

Aqueous lithium-ion batteries (ALIBs) combining the 'rockingchair' principle of conventional LIBs and the use of low-cost, non-flammable water-based electrolytes are promising technologies over organic electrolyte-based lithium-ion batteries (LIBs) in terms of safety, flexibility in electric vehicle design, and system cost reduction.<sup>1,2</sup> The aggressive nature of aqueous environment raises high requirement for the electrochemical stability of the components of the ALIBs including electrode and current collector materials.<sup>3</sup> In the past two decades, many progresses have been made towards developing stable cathode and anode materials compatible with aqueous electrolytes.<sup>4</sup> In contrast, less study has been performed focusing on the development of current collectors. To date, only well-known corrosion-resistant materials such as titanium<sup>5</sup>, stainless steel (SS)<sup>6</sup>, nickel<sup>7</sup>, and platinum<sup>8</sup> have been used as current collectors in ALIB studies. Table 1 compares the price and areal weight of these materials alongside aluminium which is the well-established current collector in conventional non-aqueous LIBs.9 Aluminium appears to be the best candidate because light-weight and lowcost materials as current collector is critical for enabling viable and practical applications.<sup>9</sup> However, aluminium is prone to corrosion in aqueous environments,<sup>10</sup> especially under applied potential when reaction and ionic migration are accelerated.<sup>11</sup> Many methods have been developed in the past to prevent aluminium corrosion based on isolating surface

with barrier coating to suppress the cathodic reaction of corrosion by limiting the diffusion of the electrolyte to the surface.<sup>12</sup>

Table	1. Compa	rison of	f price	and	areal	weight	of	various	materia	ls
used as	collector	in com	mercial	l bat	teries.	a				

used as concertor in commercial batteries.							
<b>Current Collector</b>	Price	Weight	Resistivity				
	$($/ft^2)$	$(g/ft^2)$	(Ω.m) at 293 K				
Stainless steel (SS316)	19	92	$6.9 \times 10^{-7}$				
Nickel	31	105	$6.9 \times 10^{-8}$				
Titanium	109	53	$4.2 \times 10^{-7}$				
Aluminium	0.6	31	$2.82 \times 10^{-8}$				

<sup>a</sup> Price information calculated based on foils with the same thickness (0.2 mm). Data obtained from <u>www.McMaster.com</u> on April 2015

Among various organic and inorganic coatings, chromium compound based films are currently the most effective way to inhibit corrosion of aluminium and its alloys. Chromate conversion coating has also been identified as a simple, cheap, and fast method to passivate aluminium surface by a thin and impervious layer of chromium oxide and related Cr(III) compounds.<sup>13</sup> Here we report the successful use of chromate conversion coated (CCC) aluminium foil as a light-weight and corrosion-resistant current collector for use in ALIBs. Our results showed that the overall performance of the LiMn<sub>2</sub>O<sub>4</sub> electrodes on CCC aluminium current collectors is superior to those of electrodes fabricated on more expensive and heavier

**RSCPublishing** 

materials in terms of cyclability and Coulombic efficiency, thereby introducing new opportunities for the development of low-cost, stable, and high efficiency current collectors for aqueous batteries.

#### 2. Experimental Section

#### 2.1. Chromate conversion coating of aluminium foil

CCC aluminium foil was fabricated by a "MIL-C-5541E Class 3" process.<sup>14</sup> This process consists of the following steps: (a) pretreatment of aluminium foil surface by a deoxidizer (Oakite 160) solution with intermittent water rinsing, (b) immersing aluminium foil in a chromic acid solution (CrO<sub>3</sub> 3.7 g/l, NaF 1.2 g/l, and Na<sub>2</sub>Cr<sub>2</sub>O<sub>7</sub> g/l, pH = 1.8) for 120 seconds, (c) rinsing with water at 45 °C, and (d) drying in air at 50–60 °C. This process produces an extremely corrosion-resistant film composed of hydrated mixed Cr(III) and Al(III) oxides:<sup>15</sup>

 $2AI + Cr_2O_7^{2^-} + 2H^+ + H_2O \rightarrow 2CrOOH \downarrow + 2AIOOH \downarrow \quad (1)$ 

The AlOOH in the mixed oxides is then dissolved due to the fluoride ions present in the coating solution, leaving the less soluble CrOOH in the coating. This process continues as the strongly adhered coating grows to clog the aluminium surface with the bulk coating consisting of  $Cr_2O_3$  and CrOOH.<sup>15</sup> The coating was characterized with X-ray photoelectron spectroscopy (XPS, Physical Electronics Model 5700) and scanning electron microscopy (SEM, Gemini LEO 1525 microscopy).

#### 2.2. Electrode fabrication

For titanium, un-treated aluminium, and CCC aluminium foils current collectors, the working electrodes were prepared by spreading a slurry of commercial  $\text{LiMn}_2\text{O}_4$  powder (purchased from MTI, particle size distribution 10–20 µm), carbon black (TIMCAL), and polyvinylidene difluoride (weight ratio 80:10:10) in N-methyl pyrrolidinone on the substrate followed by drying. For the SS mesh substrate, the electrodes were made by using polytetrafluoroethylene as the binder. The surface area of each electrode was 1.5 cm<sup>2</sup>.

#### 2.3. Electrochemical measurements

All the electrochemical characterizations were conducted in a threeelectrode flooded-cell configuration using fabricated  $LiMn_2O_4$ electrodes as the working electrode, activated carbon as the counter electrode, and Ag/AgCl as the reference electrode immersed in 5 ml of 2.5 M  $Li_2SO_4$  as the electrolyte. All electrochemical measurements including constant current charging–discharging, voltammetry measurement, and electrochemical impedance spectroscopy (EIS) were carried out using a Biologic VMP3 potentiostat.

#### 3. Results and Discussion

Figure 1 compares the morphology and XPS spectra of the aluminium surface before and after CCC treatment. Figure 1(a) and 1(b) show the surface morphology of un-treated and CCC aluminium foils, respectively. The un-treated aluminium foil surface has parallel streaks and small micro-indentations resulted from mechanical rolling operations. In contrast, CCC aluminium foil shows a uniform mud-crack pattern (Figure 1(b)). Dehydration of CCC film develops tensile stress leading to the formation of cracks, in particular during drying of the coating and is characteristic of the CCC layer.<sup>16</sup> Absence of peel-off spots over the surface can be interpreted as the good coverage and adhesion of the coating.<sup>17</sup> The XPS Al 2p spectra of the un-treated and CCC aluminium foils are shown in Figure 1(c). The Al 2p signal appeared at 75.8 eV and 72.9

eV for the un-treated aluminium foil are characteristic of aluminium oxide and aluminium metal, respectively. Neither of the peaks are detected after the CCC process, indicating complete coverage of the aluminium surface.<sup>18</sup> Figure 1(d) shows the XPS spectra of Cr  $2p_{3/2}$ , where the peaks at 579.5 eV and 581.3 eV indicate the presence of Cr(III) as in CrOOH and Cr(VI) as in chromate, respectively.<sup>19</sup> The presence of chromate in the coating is believed to contribute to the "active corrosion inhibition" upon any corrosive attack to the surface (vide infra).<sup>20</sup>



Figure 1. Characterization of CCC aluminium foil. SEM image of the surface obtained from aluminium foil (a) before and (b) after coating (scale bar: 10  $\mu$ m). (c) XPS Al 2p spectra of aluminium foil before and after coating; and (d) XPS Cr 2p<sub>3/2</sub> for CCC aluminium foil.

In order to show the improvement of the performance of aluminium foil after CCC process, the electrochemical performance of  $LiMn_2O_4$  electrodes fabricated on both un-treated and CCC aluminium foils as the current collectors is presented in Figure 2. The electrode fabricated on un-treated aluminium foil suffers from large capacity loss each cycle. The black spots on the backside of the aluminium foil after 15 cycles are the formed corrosion pits (inset in Figure 2a). In contrast, 86% of the specific discharge capacity of the electrode fabricated on CCC aluminium foil retained after 50 cycles with the characteristic two-plateaus potential profile of  $LiMn_2O_4$  preserved (Figure 2(b)).<sup>21</sup> The absence of black spots in the inset of Figure 2(b) confirms the inhibition of the corrosion during cycling. The golden color is typical for CCC coating.

Impedance spectra of the electrodes were analysed for both untreated and CCC aluminium foil electrodes to reveal the property change of the current collectors before and after cycling. According to the simplified contact-Randles (SCR) equivalent circuit proposed for impedance spectra of lithium-ion insertion electrodes by Atebama *et al.*<sup>22</sup>, the EIS spectrum composed of two partially overlapped arcs in the high to medium frequencies. The highfrequency arc is attributed to the impedance due to the collectorelectrode materials contact. At medium-frequency, there is another arc due to charge transfer resistance between active materials and electrolyte. The electrochemical impedance can be estimated from the diameter of the arcs from the impedance from 30 to 45,000  $\Omega$ after only 15 cycles. This dramatic increase is due to the continuous corrosion of the un-treated aluminium current collector. In contrast, Journal Name

for the CCC electrode, there is only a relatively small increase from 30 to 100  $\Omega$  after 50 cycles (Figure 2(d)).



Figure 2: Electrochemical characterization of LiMn<sub>2</sub>O<sub>4</sub> electrodes on un-treated aluminium and CCC aluminium foil as current collectors. (a) Charge–discharge voltage curve of different cycles in 2.5 M Li<sub>2</sub>SO<sub>4</sub> electrolyte (pH = 7) for LiMn<sub>2</sub>O<sub>4</sub> electrode on un-treated aluminium foil. Inset shows the photograph of the backside of un-treated aluminium foil current collector after 15 cycles. (b) LiMn<sub>2</sub>O<sub>4</sub> electrode on CCC aluminium foil. Inset shows the photograph of the backside of CCC aluminium foil current collector after 50 cycles. The golden color is typical color of CCC coating. Impedance spectra for (c) un-treated aluminium foil and (d) CCC aluminium foil before and after cycling. In both (c) and (d), insets show the magnified high frequency region.

In the aluminium–water system, pitting corrosion is the most common type of corrosion at room temperature and starts as soon as aluminium is exposed to the aqueous environment. During charging, the corrosion is accelerated due to anodic polarization.<sup>20</sup>

Figure 3(a)–(c) shows the corrosion process of un-treated aluminium. In the first stage (Figure 3(a)), pitting is initiated by the aggressive ions (e.g. sulfate) in the solution that penetrate the passivation film.<sup>24</sup> The corrosion of aluminium occurs in two steps (Figure 3(b)):

$$AI \rightarrow AI^{3+} + 3e^{-}$$
(2)  
$$AI^{3+} + 3H_2O \rightarrow AI(OH)_3 + 3H^{+}$$
(3)

Aluminium is first oxidized, and the resulted aluminium ions react with water to form  $Al(OH)_3$  precipitates and decrease the pH inside the pit. To balance the positive charge, more sulfate ions migrate into the pits which propagate the pitting (Figure 3(c)). Meanwhile, the electrons stripped from aluminium are captured at the passivated aluminium surface by the cathodic reduction of water:<sup>10</sup>

$$2H_2O + 2e^- \rightarrow H_2 + 2OH^- \tag{4}$$

Local alkalinization at the cathodic sites results in dissolution of the passivation film and formation of new corrosion sites.<sup>25</sup>

The CCC aluminium, on the other hand, has a Cr(III) surface film that acts as an impervious physical barrier to the corrosive aqueous electrolyte.<sup>26</sup> Even though with cracks (as observed with SEM), the CCC coating has the ability of self-healing via an "active corrosion inhibition" process aided by the stored chromate in the coating layer:<sup>27</sup>



Figure 3: Schematics of the corrosion behavior of un-treated (a–c) and CCC (d–f) aluminium in aqueous electrolytes. (a) Pitting initiation, (b) propagation of the pit and formation of  $Al(OH)_3$  as the corrosion product, (c) local increase of pH around the pit and formation of new corrosion sites. (d) Initiation of a corrosion site at an un-protected site on the surface, (e) chromate released to the solution as a result of pH increase around the corrosion site followed by chromate reduction to form insoluble Cr(III) compounds, and (f) passivation of the corrosion site as insoluble Cr(III) formed.

$OCr(III) - O - Cr(VI)O_3^- + OH^- \Leftrightarrow CrOOH + CrO_4^{2-}$	(5)
$\operatorname{CrO_4^{2-}} + 3\operatorname{H_2O} + 3e^- \rightarrow \operatorname{CrOOH} + 5\operatorname{OH}^-$	(6)

where CrOOH is representative of hydrated Cr(III) oxides. Chromate ions originally adsorbed on Cr(III) through a reversible Cr(VI)–O–Cr(III) bond can be favorably released at higher pH values near the cathodic sites (Figure 3(d,e)).<sup>27,28</sup> The chromate ions readily diffuse to the corrosion sites, where they are reduced and form insoluble Cr(III) compounds shown in Figure 3(e). Therefore, the combination of storage, release, migration, and irreversible reduction of chromate enables efficient protection of aluminium at the cracked sites (Figure 3(f)).

To demonstrate the competitiveness of CCC aluminium as a current collector material for ALIBs vis-à-vis state-of-the-art materials, the galvanostatic charge-discharge performance for LiMn<sub>2</sub>O<sub>4</sub> electrodes fabricated on a series of current collectors including CCC aluminium, untreated aluminium, SS316 mesh, and titanium foil is compared in Figure 4. Figure 4(a) reveals that the lowest electrode polarization was obtained with the electrode on CCC aluminium foil. Compared to LiMn<sub>2</sub>O<sub>4</sub> electrode fabricated on titanium and SS, the electrode on CCC aluminium foil is superior in terms of stability with an 86% capacity retention after the first 50 cycles (Figure 4(b)). For comparison, the electrode on un-treated aluminium foil delivered almost no capacity after 25 cycles. Note that the capacity decay for all the electrodes is related to the intrinsic instability of the micron-sized LiMn<sub>2</sub>O<sub>4</sub> particles due to Jahn-Teller distortion and Mn dissolution during cycling.<sup>29</sup> Reduction of the particle size to the nanoscale can help mitigate the instability of LiMn<sub>2</sub>O<sub>4</sub> but is beyond the scope of this work.<sup>2</sup>

Another advantage of CCC aluminium is its capability to suppress undesired oxygen evolution at high charging potential as evidenced by cyclic voltammetry measurements.<sup>31</sup> As shown in Figure 4(d), the oxygen evolution peak position varies with current

collectors. Oxygen begins to evolve at the potentials of 1.1 and 1.7 V vs. Ag/AgCl on SS316 and untreated aluminium, respectively, while



Figure 4: Comparison of electrochemical performance of  $LiMn_2O_4$  electrodes fabricated on different current collectors in 2.5 M  $Li_2SO_4$  electrolyte (pH = 7): (a) 1<sup>st</sup> galvanostatic charge–discharge voltage profiles, (b) stability of specific discharge capacity, (c) Coulombic efficiency, and (d) linear scan voltammetry for different current collectors in 2.5 M  $Li_2SO_4$  (pH = 7) at a scan rate of 1 mV/s.

titanium and CCC aluminium push the values to 2.2 and 3.8 V vs. Ag/AgCl respectively. Oxygen evolution reaction involves multiple intermediate steps including formation of adsorbed intermediate species such as adsorbed O, OH, OOH.<sup>32</sup> The overpotential for oxygen evolution reaction arises from the reduction of relative stability and binding energies of these intermediate species on a given surface.<sup>33</sup> It has been shown that even a single monolayer of chromium(III) oxide on the CCC aluminium surface could effectively suppress the oxygen evolution reaction through blocking active adsorption sites and reducing electron tunnelling rate.<sup>34</sup> This behavior contributes to the higher Coulombic efficiency obtained from the electrodes fabricated on CCC aluminium foil (~99%) than those on SS316 mesh and un-treated aluminium foil and similar to titanium foil in Figure 4(c). In other words, oxygen evolution is supressed before lithium being extracted from LiMn<sub>2</sub>O<sub>4</sub> during the charging process.

#### 4. Conclusions

In summary, we demonstrated the effectiveness of chromate conversion coating on aluminium foil current collector to achieve excellent corrosion-resistance in ALIB. Electrochemical measurements of  $LiMn_2O_4$ electrodes fabricated on CCC aluminium showed superior capacity retention as well as higher Coulombic efficiency than traditional stainless steel and titanium based current collectors. The CCC layer acts as (i) a physical barrier to aggressive ions and (ii) a reservoir of chromate ions which can diffuse to corrosion sites to form protective insoluble Cr(III) compounds, thereby enhancing the corrosion resistance of aluminium foil. We would like to point out that the chromate compounds used here are toxic and should be replaced by environmental friendly materials going forward.12 Nonetheless, we believe the excellent performance of CCC aluminium foil demonstrated here will spark interests in the development of lightweight lowcost current collectors to enable high energy density aqueous batteries.

#### Author address

<sup>*a*</sup> Department of Electrical and Computer Engineering and Materials Science and Engineering Program, University of Houston, Houston, Texas 77204, USA. E-mail: yyao4@uh.edu

<sup>b</sup> Southwest Research Institute, 6220 Culebra Road, San Antonio, Texas 78228-0510, USA.

<sup>c</sup> Texas Center for Superconductivity, University of Houston, Houston, Texas 77204, USA.

#### Acknowledgements

Authors acknowledge the funding support from the Advanced Research Projects Agency-Energy (DE-AR0000380).

#### Notes and references

- W. Li, W. R. Mckinnon, and J. R. Dahn, J. Electrochem. Soc., 1994, 141, 2310-2316.
- 2 W. Tang, Y. Zhu, Y. Hou, L. Liu, Y. Wu, K. P. Loh, H. Zhang, and K. Zhu, *Energy Environ. Sci.*, 2013, 6, 2093-2104.
- 3 J.-Y. Luo, W.-J. Cui, P. He, and Y. Y. Xia, Nat. Chem., 2010, 2, 760-765.
- 4 H. Kim, J. Hong, K. Y. Park, H. Kim, S. W. Kim, K. Kang, *Chem. Rev.*, 2014, **114**, 11788-11827.
- 5 S. Liu, S. H. Ye, C. Z. Li, G. L. Pan, and X. P. Gao, J. Electrochem. Soc., 2011, 158, A1490 A1497.
- 6 H. Wang, Y. Zeng, K. Huang, S. Liu, and L. Chen, *Electrochm. Acta*, 2007, **52**, 5102-5107.
- 7 M. Zhao, G. Huang, B. Zhang, F. Wang, X Song, J. Power Sources, 2012, 211, 202-207.
- 8 K. Xu, C. A. Angell, J. Electrochem. Soc, 1998, 145, L70-L72.
- 9 A. H. Whitehead and M. Schreiber, J. Electrochem. Soc., 2005, 152, A2105-A2113.
- 10 M. A. Elmorsi, R.M. Isaa, , B. Electrochem, 1988, 4, 785.
- 11 R. P. Frankenthal, L. F. G. Mesias, *Electronic materials, Components, and Devices, in Uhlig's Corrosion Handbook*, 3<sup>rd</sup> Ed., John Wiley & Sons, Inc., Hoboken, NJ, USA., 559-564.
- 12 R. L. Twite and G. P. Bierwagan, Prog. in Org. Coating, 1998, 33, 91-100.
- 13 J. Zhao, G. Frankel, R. L. McCreery, J. Electrochem. Soc., 1998, 145, 2258-2264
- 14 "MIL\_5541\_Specification "Chemical Conversion Coatings on Aluminium and Aluminium Alloys" 1990.
- 15 A. E. Hughes, R. J. Taylor, B. R. W. Hinton, *Surf. Interface Anal.*, 1997, 25, 223-234.
- 16 Q. Meng and G. S. Frankel, Surf. Interface Anal., 2004, 36, 30-42.
- 17 L. E. M. Palomino, L.V. Aoki, H. G. deMelo, *Electrochimi Acta*, 2006, **51**, 5943-5953
- 18 B. R. Strhmeier, Surf. Interface Anal., 1990, 15, 51-56.
- 19 G. P. Halada, C. R. Clayton, J. Electrochem. Soc., 1991, 138, 2921-2927.
- 20 M. U. Kendig, S. Jeanjaquet, R. Addison, and J. Waldrop, Surf. and Coatings Tech., 2001, 140, 58-66.
- 21 W. Tang, Y. Hou, F. Wang, L. Liu, Y. Wu, and K. Zhu, *Nano Lett.*, 2013, **13**, 2036-2040.
- 22 J. M. Atebamba, J. Moskon, S. Pejovnik, and M. Gaberscek, J. *Electrochem. Soc.*, 2010, **157**, A1218-A1228.
- 23 A. Sakuda, A. Hayashi, M. Tatsumisago, J. Power Sources, 2010, 195, 599-603
- 24 R. D. Armstrong, V. J. Braham, Corros. Sci., 1996, 38, 1463-1471.
- 25 G. M. Scamans, J. A. Hunter, and N. J. H. Holroyd, 8th International Light Metals Congress, 1987, 1, 699-705.
- 26 G. M. Brown, K. Shimizu, K. Kobayashi, G. E. Thompson, and G. C. Wood, *Corros. Sci.*, 1992, **33**, 1371-1385.
- 27 L. Xia, R. L. McCreery, J. Electrochem. Soc., 1998, 145, 3083-3089.
- 28 G. S. Frankel and R. L. Mccreery, *Electrochem. Soc. Interface*, 2001, 10, 34-38.

**ARTICIF** 

Journal Name

- 29 D. Aurbach, M. D. Levi, K. Gamulski, B. Markovsky, G. Salitra, E. Levi, U. Heider, L. Heider, R. Oesten, J. Power. Sources, 1999, 81-82, 472-479.
- 30 G. Yuan, J. Bai, T. N. L. Doan, P. Chen, *Mater. Lett.*, 2014, **137**, 311-314.
- 31 G. J. Wang, N. H. Zhao, L. C. Yang, Y. P. Wu, H. Q. Wu, R. Holze, *Electrochim. Acta*, 2007, **52**, 4911-4915.
- 32 I. Katsounaros, S. Cherevko, A. R. Zeradjanin, and K. J. J. Mayrhofer, Angew. Chem. Int. Ed., 2014, 53, 102-121.
- 33 R. V. Mom, J. Cheng, M. T. M. Koper, and M. Sprik, *J. Phys. Chem. C*, 2014, **118**, 4095-4102.
- 34 W. J. Clark and R. L. Mccreery, J. Electrochem. Soc. 2002, 149, B379-B386.



We report chromate conversion coated (CCC) aluminium foil as corrosion-resistant current collectors in aqueous lithium-ion battery cathodes. CCC aluminium-based electrodes show better cycling stability and higher Coulombic efficiency than those fabricated on stainless steel and titanium foils.