# Chemical  sience 

## Accepted Manuscript



This is an Accepted Manuscript, which has been through the Royal Society of Chemistry peer review process and has been accepted for publication.

Accepted Manuscripts are published online shortly after acceptance, before technical editing, formatting and proof reading Using this free service, authors can make their results available to the community, in citable form, before we publish the edited article. We will replace this Accepted Manuscript with the edited and formatted Advance Article as soon as it is available.

You can find more information about Accepted Manuscripts in the Information for Authors.

Please note that technical editing may introduce minor changes to the text and/or graphics, which may alter content. The journal's standard Terms \& Conditions and the Ethical guidelines still apply. In no event shall the Royal Society of Chemistry be held responsible for any errors or omissions in this Accepted Manuscript or any consequences arising from the use of any information it contains.

# Isomerisation of nido- $\left[\mathrm{C}_{2} \mathrm{~B}_{10} \mathrm{H}_{12}\right]^{\mathbf{2 -}}$ Dianions: Unprecedented Rearrangements and New Structural Motifs in Carborane Cluster Chemistry. 

David McKay,* ${ }^{* b}$ Stuart A. Macgregor ${ }^{a}$ and Alan J. Welch ${ }^{a}$<br>${ }_{5}$ Received (in $X X X$, XXX) Xth XXXXXXXXX 20XX, Accepted Xth XXXXXXXXX 20XX DOI: 10.1039/b000000x

Dianionic nido- $\left[\mathrm{C}_{2} \mathrm{~B}_{10}\right]^{2-}$ species are key intermediates in the polyhedral expansion from 12- to 13 -vertex carboranes and metallacarboranes, and the isomer adopted by these nido intermediates dictates the isomeric form of the 13 -vertex product that is produced. Upon reduction and metallation of para10 carborane up to five $M \mathrm{C}_{2} \mathrm{~B}_{10}$ metallacarboranes can be produced (Angew. Chem. Int. Ed., 2007, 46, 6706), the structures of which imply the intermediacy of $1,7-, 3,7-, 4,7-, 7,9-$ and 7,10 -isomers of the nido$\left[\mathrm{C}_{2} \mathrm{~B}_{10}\right]^{2-}$ species. In this paper we use density functional theory (DFT) calculations to characterise the reduction of closo- $\mathrm{C}_{2} \mathrm{~B}_{10} \mathrm{H}_{12}$ carboranes and the subsequent isomerisations of the nido- $\left[\mathrm{C}_{2} \mathrm{~B}_{10} \mathrm{H}_{12}\right]^{2-}$ dianions. Upon reduction para-carborane initially opens to $\left[1,7-\text { nido }-\mathrm{C}_{2} \mathrm{~B}_{10} \mathrm{H}_{12}\right]^{2-}$ (abbreviated to 1,7 ) and
${ }_{15}\left[4,7 \text {-nido }-\mathrm{C}_{2} \mathrm{~B}_{10} \mathrm{H}_{12}\right]^{2-}(\mathbf{4 , 7})$ and isomerisation pathways connecting $\mathbf{1 , 7}$ to $\mathbf{7 , 9}, \mathbf{4 , 7}$ to $\mathbf{7 , 1 0}$ and $\mathbf{1 , 7}$ to $\mathbf{3 , 7}$ have been characterised. For ortho- and meta-carborane the experimental reduction produces $\mathbf{7 , 9}$ in both cases and computed pathways for both processes are also defined; with ortho-carborane rearrangement occurs via $\mathbf{7 , 8}$, whereas with meta-carborane 7,9 is formed directly. The 7,9 isomer is the global minimum nido-structure. The characterisation of these isomerisation processes uncovers intermediates
20 that adopt new structural motifs that we term basket and inverted nido. Basket intermediates feature a two-vertex basket handle bridging the remaining 10 vertices; inverted nido intermediates are related to known nido species, in that they have 5-and 6-membered belts, but where the latter, rather than the former, is capped, leaving a 5 -membered open face. These new intermediates exhibit similar stability to the nido species, which is attributed to their relation to the 13-vertex docosahedron through the removal 25 of 5-connected vertices. Isomerisation pathways starting from nido geometries are most often initiated by destabilisation of the cluster through a DSD process causing the 3 -connected $\mathrm{C}^{7}$ vertex to move into a 4 connected site and a neighbouring $B$ vertex to become 3 -connected. The ensuing rearrangement of the cluster involves processes such as the pivoting of a 4 -vertex diamond about its long diagonal, the pivoting of two 3-vertex triangles about a shared vertex and DSD processes. These processes are all ultimately
30 driven by the preference for carbon to occupy low-connected vertices on the open 6-membered face of the resulting nido species.

## Introduction

As predicted by Wade's Rules, ${ }^{1}$ the addition of a skeletal electron pair (SEP) to a closo polyhedron (with $[n+1]$ SEPs, where $n$ is ${ }_{35}$ the number of vertices) results in the formation of the corresponding nido cluster ( $[n+2]$ SEPs). A key synthetic route that relies upon this is the polyhedral expansion method, whereby 2 -electron reduction of a closo precursor (normally a 12 -vertex carborane) results in the formation of a nido fragment, which can
40 then be capitated with a $\{\mathrm{BR}\}$ or $\{M\}$ fragment. Application of this method led to both the first 13 -vertex metallacarborane ${ }^{2}$ and the first 13 -vertex carborane. ${ }^{3}$ In 2007 we showed that the polyhedral expansion of a single carborane precursor, [1,12- $\mathrm{Ph}_{2}-$ 1,12 -closo- $\left.\mathrm{C}_{2} \mathrm{~B}_{10} \mathrm{H}_{10}\right]$, with $\{M\}=\{\mathrm{Ru}(p$-cymene $)\}$ led to the
${ }_{45}$ formation of five isomeric supraicosahedral metallacarboranes of the form $\mathrm{RuC}_{2} \mathrm{~B}_{10}$ (Fig. 1). ${ }^{4}$ This implies the presence of five isomeric nido fragments following reduction, i.e. 1,7-, 3,7-, 4,7-, $7,9-\quad$ and $\quad\left[7,10-\mathrm{Ph}_{2}-7,10 \text {-nido- } \mathrm{C}_{2} \mathrm{~B}_{10} \mathrm{H}_{10}\right]^{2-}$. A concurrent computational study on [1,12-closo- $\mathrm{C}_{2} \mathrm{~B}_{10} \mathrm{H}_{12}$ ] (para-carborane) ${ }_{50}$ suggested the first nido-fragments formed upon reduction were $\left[1,7 \text {-nido }-\mathrm{C}_{2} \mathrm{~B}_{10} \mathrm{H}_{12}\right]^{2-}$ (termed $\mathbf{1 , 7}$ in the following) and $[4,7$-nido$\left.\mathrm{C}_{2} \mathrm{~B}_{10} \mathrm{H}_{12}\right]^{2-}(4,7)$. At the time, the further isomerisation of these species to the remaining nido species was not considered, however computing these directly provided relative energies, H 55 (enthalpies, 0 K ) of $+29.5,+24.0,+22.0$ and $+1.4 \mathrm{kcal} / \mathrm{mol}$ for $\mathbf{1 , 7}, \mathbf{3 , 7}, 4,7,7,9$ and $\mathbf{7 , 1 0}$ respectively, all relative to 7,9 at 0.0 $\mathrm{kcal} / \mathrm{mol}$. In contrast, related experimental studies adopting ortho- or meta-carborane precursors show that 7,9 is the only nido species formed. ${ }^{2,5-7}$


Fig. 1 Results of polyhedral expansion of 12 -vertex carboranes to 13-vertex metallacarboranes. For para-carbroane $\{M\}=\{\mathrm{Ru}(p-\mathrm{cymene})\},\{\mathrm{C}\}=\{\mathrm{CPh}\}$ relating to Ref. ${ }^{4}$; for ortho-carborane, e.g. $\{M\}=\{\mathrm{Ru}(p-c y m e n e)\}$ or $\{\mathrm{CoCp}\},\{\mathrm{C}\}=$ e.g. $\{\mathrm{CH}\} .{ }^{2,5}$ Computed energies of $\left[\text { nido- } \mathrm{C}_{2} \mathrm{~B}_{10} \mathrm{H}_{12}\right]^{2-}$ species given 5 relative to 7,9 in $\mathrm{kcal} / \mathrm{mol}$. See inset for formal numbering.



Scheme 1 Neutral (hetero)borane isomerisation processes a) DSD and b) TFR.

The thermal rearrangement of 12 -vertex closo (hetero)boranes 10 has been the subject of continued investigation. Starting from ortho-carborane, the conversion to meta-carborane at $450{ }^{\circ} \mathrm{C}$ and then to para-carborane at $700{ }^{\circ} \mathrm{C}$ has been known for over 50 years and indeed was the route to their first syntheses. ${ }^{8-10}$ The processes involved in their rearrangement have been studied for 15 many years, both theoretically ${ }^{11-16}$ and experimentally through labelling studies. ${ }^{17-19}$ In 1966, Lipscomb ${ }^{13}$ introduced the diamond-square-diamond (DSD) mechanism (Scheme 1a), while in the same year, Zakharkin and Kalinin ${ }^{16}$ suggested the triangular face rotation (TFR) mechanism, which can also be ${ }_{20}$ described as three concerted DSD processes (Scheme 1b). The DSD process in particular has since been recognised as key to carborane rearrangement. Wales ${ }^{15}$ adopted an eigenvector following method to map the potential energy surface of $\mathrm{C}_{2} \mathrm{~B}_{10} \mathrm{H}_{12}$ at the Hartree-Fock (HF) level. Multi-step DSD-derived ${ }_{25}$ processes were found to dominate, however two TFR-type pathways were also located. High symmetry processes involving multiple simultaneous DSDs (e.g. the hextuple DSD process leading to a cuboctahedral geometry suggested by Lipscomb ${ }^{13}$ ) were discounted due to their unfeasibly high activation energies. ${ }_{30}$ Later studies also demonstrate an energetic preference for low symmetry processes. ${ }^{11,12,14}$ Wales also ruled out the closo-nidocloso rearrangement pathway, which requires opening of the cage to a high energy pseudo-nido intermediate.
More recently, Brown and McKee ${ }^{11}$ showed, through density ${ }_{35}$ functional theory (DFT) calculations, that a single step TFR
process was favoured in the ortho- to meta-carborane isomerisation, while a two-step DSD pathway was preferred for isomerisation from meta- to para-carborane. Brown and McKee had discounted a two-step pathway from ortho- to meta40 carborane, due to a high initial barrier between ortho-carborane and the intermediate involved. We later showed that the equivalent intermediate was formed upon the oxidation of $\mathbf{7 , 9}$ and characterised a lower energy process to form ortho-carborane, in agreement with experiment. ${ }^{12}$ Most recently, Sugden and co45 workers ${ }^{14}$ investigated both of these isomerisation pathways through $a b$ initio molecular dynamics (DFT-MD) adopting the PBE functional.

In stark contrast, few computational studies have involved ${ }_{50}$ reduced 12 -vertex carboranes, despite the isomeric form of the reduced species ultimately dictating the isomer of the supraicosahedral product. McKee et al. ${ }^{20}$ computed 7,9 directly, through HF calculations, for comparison with plausible protonated [nido $-\mathrm{C}_{2} \mathrm{~B}_{10} \mathrm{H}_{13}$ ] structures. Later, Hermansson and ${ }_{55}$ co-workers ${ }^{21}$ showed in a study of the electron affinities of carboranes (also at the HF level) that sequential addition of two electrons to meta-carborane resulted in $\mathbf{7 , 9}$, while geometries produced from reduction of ortho- and para-carborane showed only minor distortions and did not resemble nido fragments. ${ }_{60}$ More recently, 12 -vertex nido carboranes and (bis)carboranes have featured in our


Fig. 2 2e addition to para-carborane followed by isomerisation to the first nido intermediates, 1,7 and 4,7. Numbering of CH vertices (blue) and BH vertices (black) consistent with para-carborane. See inset for key computed structures along the pathways. Selected distances in $\AA$ and energies relative to 7,9 in $\mathrm{kcal} / \mathrm{mol}$. H atoms omitted for clarity.
${ }_{5}$ investigations of the aforementioned oxidation of $\mathbf{7 , 9}$ to orthocarborane, ${ }^{12}$ the room-temperature $\mathrm{C}-\mathrm{C}$ activation of an arene at a 13 -vertex metallacarborane, ${ }^{22}$ co-production of isomeric 13vertex cobaltacarboranes from polyhedral expansion of a tethered carborane precursor ${ }^{23}$ and in the rational design of derivatives of ${ }_{10} 7,9$ stabilised towards aerial oxidation. ${ }^{24}$

Herein we report a computational study of the isomerisation processes that follow from the initial 2 e reduction of paracarborane and formation of $\mathbf{1 , 7}$ and 4,7 , revealing pathways interconnecting all five nido fragments inferred experimentally ${ }_{15}$ (see Fig. 1). The reduction of ortho-carborane is shown to initially produce $\mathbf{7 , 8}$, before rearranging to the experimental product, 7,9. Meta-carborane reduction proceeds to $\mathbf{7 , 9}$ directly, where the barrierless rearrangement process is rationalised by relation to the nido isomerisation pathways. In the completion of 20 this work, we uncover and rationalise new dianionic 12 -vertex carborane structures which we refer to as basket and inverted nido intermediates and characterise new, unexpectedly complex
processes interconnecting nido species, ultimately linking all intermediates to the global minimum, $\mathbf{7 , 9}$.

## Results

## 1. Formation of 1,7 and $4,7$.

DFT calculations were performed at the BP86/6-31G** level using Gaussian 03 and we report zero-point corrected electronic energies, $H$, for all computed species relative to $\mathbf{7 , 9}$ (see ${ }_{30}$ Computational Details). In order to model the reduction of paracarborane, first the neutral geometry was optimised, then two electrons were added and the system was re-optimised. This resulted in an initial reduced minimum, $\operatorname{Int}(\mathbf{A})(\mathrm{H}=+34.8$ $\mathrm{kcal} / \mathrm{mol}$; Fig. 2). Int(A) features 4-membered $\left(\mathrm{B}^{3}-\mathrm{B}^{8}-\mathrm{B}^{4}-\mathrm{C}^{1}\right)$ and ${ }_{35} 5$-membered ( $\mathrm{B}^{3}-\mathrm{C}^{1}-\mathrm{B}^{5}-\mathrm{B}^{6}-\mathrm{B}^{2}$ ) open faces and is related to the nido geometry, $\mathbf{1 , 7}$, by a DSD process in the $\mathrm{C}^{1}-\mathrm{B}^{3}-\mathrm{B}^{8}-\mathrm{B}^{4}$ face. This was characterised by decreasing the $\mathrm{C}^{1} \cdots \mathrm{~B}^{8}$ distance, giving $\mathbf{T S}(\mathbf{A}-1,7)(\mathrm{H}=+53.8 \mathrm{kcal} / \mathrm{mol})$. Through this process, $\mathrm{C}^{1}$, which


Fig. 3 Left: representation of the LUMO of para-carborane at the BP86/6-31G** level; contour value $=0.05$. Right: qualitative schematic shows bonding in blue and antibonding interactions in red. H atoms omitted for clarity.


Scheme 2 TFR processes considered to interconvert nido geometries.


Fig. 4 Isomerisation from 1,7 to 7,9. Numbering of CH vertices (blue) and BH vertices (black) consistent with 1,7. Inset shows the computed structure of $\mathrm{TS}(1,7-7,9)$. Selected distances in $\AA$ and energies relative to $7,9 \mathrm{in} \mathrm{kcal} / \mathrm{mol}$. H atoms omitted for clarity.
is 3-connected in $\boldsymbol{\operatorname { I n t }}(\mathbf{A})$, becomes 2 -connected in the transition 15 state and returns to 3 -connected in $\mathbf{1 , 7}$, giving a barrier of 19.0 $\mathrm{kcal} / \mathrm{mol}$. Alternatively, movement of $\mathrm{B}^{3}$ across the 5 -membered face towards $B^{6}$ in $\operatorname{Int}(\mathbf{A})$ gives $\operatorname{Int}(\mathbf{A}-\mathbf{4}, 7)$, through a lower barrier of $4.4 \mathrm{kcal} / \mathrm{mol}$. $\boldsymbol{\operatorname { I n t }}(\mathbf{A}-4,7)$ is topologically equivalent to $\operatorname{Int}(\mathbf{A})$ and features 4 -membered $\mathrm{C}^{1}-\mathrm{B}^{3}-\mathrm{B}^{2}-\mathrm{B}^{6}$ and 5 -membered ${ }_{20} \mathrm{C}^{1}-\mathrm{B}^{3}-\mathrm{B}^{7}-\mathrm{B}^{8}-\mathrm{B}^{4}$ faces. We refer to such a topology as a basket intermediate (discussed in detail later) where here $C^{1}$ and $B^{3}$ vertices bridge the remaining 10 vertices in a way that resembles a basket handle. From $\operatorname{Int}(\mathbf{A}-4,7)$ decreasing the $\mathrm{B}^{3} \cdots \mathrm{~B}^{6}$ distance causes the 4-membered face to close via TS2(A-4,7) ( $\mathrm{H}=+38.9$
${ }_{25} \mathrm{kcal} / \mathrm{mol}$ ) in what is effectively a barrierless process. Thereafter, a DSD process occurs in the $\mathrm{C}^{1}-\mathrm{B}^{3}-\mathrm{B}^{6}-\mathrm{B}^{5}$ diamond, breaking the $\mathrm{C}^{1}-\mathrm{B}^{6}$ connection and forming the $\mathrm{B}^{3}-\mathrm{B}^{5}$ connection, allowing $\mathrm{C}^{1}$ to become 3-connected and furnishing the nido geometry, 4,7. These energy profiles suggest that processes decreasing the ${ }_{30}$ number of connections to carbon vertices and increasing the number of connections to boron vertices are favoured. The lower barrier to formation of $\mathbf{4 , 7}$ than of $\mathbf{1 , 7}$ also suggests that processes involving movement of boron are easier than those involving movement of carbon. This is supported by electronegativity ${ }_{35}$ arguments; the radial orbitals of the carbon vertices, being more
contracted than those of boron, do not allow stabilisation of higher-connected sites or longer connections. The movement of vertices from the initial para-carborane geometry to give $\operatorname{Int}(\mathbf{A})$ can be rationalised by visualisation of the LUMO of para40 carborane (Fig. 3). This features a $\pi$-antibonding interaction along the $\mathrm{C}^{1}-\mathrm{B}^{6}$ connection and a further antibonding interaction between $B^{3}$ and $B^{4}$. Therefore the 2e occupation of this orbital is consistent with the breaking of these interactions to give a 4 membered $\mathrm{C}^{1}-\mathrm{B}^{3}-\mathrm{B}^{8}-\mathrm{B}^{4}$ and a 5 -membered $\mathrm{C}^{1}-\mathrm{B}^{3}-\mathrm{B}^{2}-\mathrm{B}^{6}-\mathrm{B}^{5}$ face ${ }_{45}$ in $\operatorname{Int}(\mathbf{A})$.

## 2. Onward isomerisations of 1,7 and 4,7: General Strategies.

The geometries of $\mathbf{1 , 7}$ and $\mathbf{4 , 7}$ were considered as starting points towards formation of the remaining nido species, 3,7, 7,9 and 7,10. Initially, we considered the possibility of TFR processes ${ }_{50}$ linking nido isomers (Scheme 2); in $\mathbf{1 , 7}$, rotation of the $\mathrm{C}^{1}-\mathrm{B}^{3}-\mathrm{B}^{4}$ triangle could be envisaged to interconvert 1,7 and 3,7 and rotation of the same triangle again, or $\mathrm{C}^{3}-\mathrm{B}^{9}-\mathrm{B}^{4}$, would exchange 3,7 and 4,7 . Likewise, in 4,7 , rotation of the $C^{4}-B^{9}-B^{10}$ triangle could give $\mathbf{7 , 9}$ and $\mathbf{7 , 1 0}$. However, attempts to characterise such ${ }_{55}$ processes through potential energy surface searching (linear transits) were unsuccessful from either $\mathbf{1 , 7}$ or $\mathbf{4 , 7}$. Several atoms


Fig. 5 Isomerisation from 4,7 to 7,10 . Numbering of CH vertices (blue) and BH vertices (black) consistent with 4,7. Inset shows key computed structures along the pathway. Selected distances in $\AA$ and energies relative to 7,9 in $\mathrm{kcal} / \mathrm{mol}$. H atoms omitted for clarity.
had to be fixed in position in order to prevent non-targetted ${ }_{5}$ rearrangement of the cluster. This suggested that the TFR process, though relevant to closo carborane isomerisation, was higher in energy than other processes available to the more flexible nido species. It was noted that the lowest energy vibrational mode of all nido species computed involves rotation 10 of the 6 -membered face above the 5 -membered 2-3-4-5-6 belt, where the largest displacement is seen in the 7-position. Taking the lead from the mode-following approach of Wales, ${ }^{15}$ we used the transition state (TS) optimisation option in Gaussian 03, ${ }^{25}$ which follows the lowest energy vibrational mode to a saddle${ }_{15}$ point on the PES, thus allowing low energy transition states to be sought a priori, direct from selected minima. The present $\mathrm{C}_{2} \mathrm{~B}_{10} \mathrm{H}_{12}$ clusters (which lack polyatomic exopolyhedral substituents) lend themselves to mode-following since the lowest energy vibrational mode always involves displacement of cluster 20 vertices and so is productive towards cluster rearrangement. Mode-following was therefore always attempted in the first instance for any transition state search (see Computational Details). From 1,7 and 4,7 this revealed surprising and contrasting isomerisation processes, which see rearrangement of ${ }_{25} \mathbf{1 , 7}$ to $\mathbf{7 , 9}$ in a single step and $\mathbf{4 , 7}$ to $\mathbf{7 , 1 0}$ in a multi-step process.

### 2.1 Formation of $\mathbf{7 , 9} \boldsymbol{v i a}$ isomerisation of $\mathbf{1 , 7}$.

Mode-following from 1,7 provided a transition state, $\operatorname{TS}(1,7-7,9)$
$(H=+41.2 \mathrm{kcal} / \mathrm{mol}$; Fig. 4), connecting $\mathbf{1 , 7}$ directly to $\mathbf{7 , 9}$, through a barrier of just $11.7 \mathrm{kcal} / \mathrm{mol}$. $\mathbf{T S}(\mathbf{1 , 7 - 7 , 9})$ is formed 30 through a DSD process in the $\mathrm{C}^{7}-\mathrm{B}^{12}-\mathrm{B}^{6}-\mathrm{B}^{2}$ diamond and exhibits a 3 -connected boron vertex, $\mathrm{B}^{12}$, which protrudes from the 6 membered open face by $0.81 \AA$ w.r.t. the $\mathrm{C}^{7}-\mathrm{B}^{8}-\mathrm{B}^{9}-\mathrm{B}^{10}-\mathrm{B}^{11}$ least squares mean plane (for comparison, $\mathrm{C}^{7}$ protrudes by $0.28 \AA$ and $0.27 \AA$ from the open faces of $\mathbf{1 , 7}$ and $\mathbf{7 , 9}$ respectively).
${ }_{35}$ Visualisation of the single imaginary vibrational mode of $\operatorname{TS}(1,7-$ 7,9 ) sees movement of $B^{12}$ relative to the open face, where the $\mathrm{B}^{12} \cdots \mathrm{~B}^{9}$ distance is $3.01 \AA$ at the transition state geometry. Characterisation of $\mathbf{T S}(\mathbf{1 , 7 - 7 , 9 )}$ via IRC calculations revealed a remarkable and unanticipated process in which the cluster inverts 40 in one step from $\mathbf{1 , 7}$, which has a $\mathrm{CB}_{5} 6$-membered open face, to 7,9, with a $\mathrm{C}_{2} \mathrm{~B}_{4}$ open face. Figure 4 shows the isomerisation process, with atom labelling consistent with the formal numbering of 1,7 to allow vertex movement to be followed; two snap-shots, $\operatorname{SS1}(1,7-7,9)$ and $\operatorname{SS2}(1,7-7,9)$, are shown to further ${ }_{45}$ aid in visualising the process and a movie is provided in the ESI. ${ }^{\dagger}$ The initial movement away from $\mathbf{T S}(\mathbf{1 , 7 - 7 , 9})$ involves pivoting about the long $\mathrm{C}^{7} \cdots \mathrm{~B}^{11}$ diagonal of the $\mathrm{C}^{7}-\mathrm{B}^{6}-\mathrm{B}^{11}-\mathrm{B}^{12}$ diamond. SS1(1,7-7,9) illustrates the midpoint of this process. The pivoting continues, opening the $\mathrm{C}^{1}-\mathrm{B}^{2}-\mathrm{C}^{7}-\mathrm{B}^{6}-\mathrm{B}^{11}-\mathrm{B}^{5}$ face and closing the ${ }_{50} \mathrm{C}^{7}-\mathrm{B}^{8}-\mathrm{B}^{9}-\mathrm{B}^{10}-\mathrm{B}^{11}-\mathrm{B}^{12}$ face of the starting structure. At $\mathbf{S S} 2(1,7-$ 7,9 ) the original open face has closed to give a geometry


Fig. 6 Isomerisation from 1,7 to 3,7. Numbering of CH vertices (blue) and BH vertices (black) consistent with 1,7. Inset shows key computed structures along the pathway. Selected distances in $\AA$ and energies relative to 7,9 in $\mathrm{kcal} / \mathrm{mol}$. H atoms omitted for clarity.
resembling a mirror image of $\operatorname{TS}(\mathbf{1}, 7-7,9)$, but with both C 5 vertices now on the open face. Finally, a barrierless DSD process in the $\mathrm{C}^{7}-\mathrm{B}^{6}-\mathrm{B}^{12}-\mathrm{B}^{8}$ diamond moves $\mathrm{C}^{7}$ into the 3 -connected site to give $\mathbf{7 , 9}$.

### 2.2 Formation of 7,10 via isomerisation of 4,7.

In contrast, the isomerisation of $\mathbf{4 , 7}$ to $\mathbf{7 , 1 0}$ was found to be a 10 multistep process (Fig. 5) which was characterised through sequential mode-following steps. The first transition state, TS1 (4,7-7,10) (H = $+33.0 \mathrm{kcal} / \mathrm{mol}$ ) again gives a low isomerisation barrier of $11.0 \mathrm{kcal} / \mathrm{mol}$. TS1 $(4,7-7,10)$ is related to 4,7 by a single $\operatorname{DSD}$ process in the $\mathrm{C}^{7}-\mathrm{B}^{8}-\mathrm{B}^{3}-\mathrm{B}^{2}$ diamond, ${ }_{15}$ resulting in a geometry topologically equivalent to $\mathbf{T S}(\mathbf{1 , 7} \mathbf{7}, \mathbf{9})$, exhibiting a 3-connected $\mathrm{B}^{8}$ vertex protruding from the open face by $0.56 \AA$. Further distortion of the cluster has also occurred, where the $\mathrm{B}^{3}-\mathrm{C}^{4}$ connection has lengthened from $1.67 \AA$ to 2.01 $\AA$, producing an open $\mathrm{B}^{1}-\mathrm{B}^{3}-\mathrm{B}^{9}-\mathrm{C}^{4}$ diamond. The imaginary 20 mode associated with $\operatorname{TS} 1(4,7-7,10)$ displays rotation of the $B^{3}$ -$\mathrm{B}^{8}-\mathrm{B}^{9}$ and $\mathrm{C}^{4}-\mathrm{B}^{9}-\mathrm{B}^{10}$ triangles, giving a hinging motion about the shared $B^{9}$ vertex. Towards $\operatorname{Int1}(4,7-7,10)(H=+29.0 \mathrm{kcal} / \mathrm{mol})$, this motion further elongates the $\mathrm{B}^{3}-\mathrm{C}^{4}$ connection to $2.57 \AA$, shortens the $\mathrm{B}^{9}-\mathrm{B}^{1}$ distance to $2.46 \AA$ and sees formation of an ${ }_{25}$ incipient $\mathrm{B}^{8}-\mathrm{B}^{10}$ connection of $2.04 \AA$, giving a 5 -membered $\mathrm{C}^{7}$ -
$B^{8}-B^{10}-B^{11}-B^{12}$ face. Mode-following from Int1(4,7-7,10) gives TS2 (4,7-7,10) $(\mathrm{H}=+30.5 \mathrm{kcal} / \mathrm{mol})$ in which $\mathrm{B}^{8}$ has moved above the open face and the $\mathrm{B}^{8}-\mathrm{B}^{3}$ and $\mathrm{B}^{8}-\mathrm{B}^{9}$ connections are lengthened, but not broken, from $1.80 \AA$ and $1.68 \AA$ respectively ${ }_{30}$ in $\operatorname{Int1}(\mathbf{4}, 7-7,10)$ to $1.90 \AA$ and $1.74 \AA$ respectively in TS2(4,7$\mathbf{7 , 1 0}$ ). Similarly, the long $B^{1} \cdots B^{3}$ distance, is lengthened further from $1.99 \AA$ in $\operatorname{Int1}(\mathbf{4}, \mathbf{7}-\mathbf{7}, \mathbf{1 0})$ to $2.11 \AA$ in the transition state. From TS2(4,7-7,10) to $\operatorname{Int} \mathbf{2 ( 4 , 7 - 7 , 1 0 )}$ the movement of $\mathrm{B}^{8}$ across the larger face is continued, leading to formation of connections ${ }_{35} \mathrm{~B}^{8}-\mathrm{B}^{12}$ and $\mathrm{B}^{8}-\mathrm{B}^{11}$ in $\operatorname{Int} \mathbf{( 4 , 7 - 7 , 1 0 )}$ while breaking the $\mathrm{B}^{3}-\mathrm{B}^{8}$ and $B^{9}-B^{8}$ connections. $C_{2}$ symmetric $\operatorname{Int} \mathbf{2 ( 4 , 7 - 7 , 1 0 )}(H=+16.5$ $\mathrm{kcal} / \mathrm{mol}$ ) is a further example of a basket intermediate with two equivalent 5-membered $\mathrm{CB}_{4}$ faces, where the $\mathrm{B}^{3}-\mathrm{B}^{9}$ edge comprises the basket handle and the C vertices adopt bridgehead ${ }_{40}$ positions, 4 and 7. It is also relatively thermodynamically stable, having a lower energy than the starting nido species, 4,7. However, it is kinetically unstable due to the low barrier to its subsequent rearrangement. Rearrangement of $\operatorname{Int2}(4,7-7,10)$ to give a nido fragment is equivalent to that found for $\operatorname{Int}(\mathbf{A})$. ${ }_{45}$ Mode-following gives $\operatorname{TS3}(4,7-7,10)(\mathrm{H}=+20.5 \mathrm{kcal} / \mathrm{mol})$, in which the $\mathrm{B}^{3}-\mathrm{B}^{2}$ connection is lengthened from $1.84 \AA$ to $2.25 \AA$ at the transition state and the $\mathrm{B}^{9}-\mathrm{B}^{8}$ connection shortens to 2.02 $\AA$, giving a structure that closely resembles TS(A-1,7) and


Fig. 7 Isomerisation from 7,10 to 7,9. Numbering of CH vertices (blue) and BH vertices (black) consistent with 7,9. Inset shows key computed structures along the pathway. Selected distances in $\AA$ and energies relative to 7,9 in $\mathrm{kcal} / \mathrm{mol}$. H atoms omitted for clarity.

TS2(A-4,7). In visualising the IRC calculations from TS3(4,7$\left.{ }_{5} \mathbf{7 , 1 0}\right) B^{3}$ is initially seen to remain 3-connected, however a DSD process in the $B^{3}-B^{8}-B^{12}-C^{7}$ diamond gives a 3 -connected $C^{7}$. Overall this transformation sees $\mathbf{4 , 7}$ rearrange to $\mathbf{7 , 1 0}$ where the former $C^{4}$ vertex now adopts the $C^{10}$ position and the $B^{3}-B^{8}-B^{9}$ triangle is effectively transferred across the open face of the ${ }_{10}$ cluster in order for this to be accomplished. The process is exothermic with $\Delta \mathrm{H}=-20.6 \mathrm{kcal} / \mathrm{mol}$.

### 2.3 Formation of $\mathbf{3 , 7} \boldsymbol{v i a}$ isomerisation of $\mathbf{1 , 7}$.

The final remaining target nido fragment, 3,7, lies between $\mathbf{1 , 7}$ and 4,7 in energy ( $H=+24.0 \mathrm{kcal} / \mathrm{mol}$, Fig. 6). It was therefore 15 considered most likely to form in an exothermic process starting from 1,7. As the mode-following approach had previously defined the pathway from 1,7 to 7,9 (and not $\mathbf{3 , 7}$ ) we focussed on the reverse process, from 3,7 to 1,7 . In this case, however, the lowest mode led to a facile, degenerate, two-step DSD process 20 that links equivalent forms of $3,7\left(\Delta \mathrm{H}^{\ddagger}=6.2 \mathrm{kcal} / \mathrm{mol}\right.$; see $\mathrm{ESI}^{\dagger}$ Fig. S1). Instead a linear transit shortening the $C^{1}$ to $B^{6}$ distance allowed us to locate a new minimum, $\operatorname{Int2}(\mathbf{1}, \mathbf{7}-\mathbf{3}, \mathbf{7})$, that was comparable in energy to $\mathbf{1 , 7}$ and $\mathbf{3 , 7}$. Int2(1,7-3,7) is topologically equivalent to $\operatorname{Int1}(\mathbf{4}, \mathbf{7 - 7 , 1 0})$. Therefore a process 25 analogous to that linking 4,7 to $\operatorname{Int}(\mathbf{4}, 7-7,10)$, where two triangle pivot about a shared vertex, was sought through STQN calculations. This resulted in location of TS3(1,7-3,7), through which the $C^{1}-B^{3}-B^{2}$ and $B^{2}-B^{6}-C^{7}$ triangles (as numbered in Fig. 6 ) pivot about $B^{2}$. The remaining challenge was then to connect
${ }_{30} \operatorname{Int2}(\mathbf{1}, \mathbf{7}-\mathbf{3}, \mathbf{7})$ to $\mathbf{1 , 7}$. $\mathbf{I n t 2}(\mathbf{1 , 7}-\mathbf{3}, \mathbf{7})$ features one 5 -membered face including $\mathrm{C}^{1}$. By analogy now with $\operatorname{TS}(\mathbf{1 , 7 - 7 , 9})$, it was envisaged that a process pivoting the $\mathrm{B}^{12}-\mathrm{B}^{5}-\mathrm{B}^{10}-\mathrm{B}^{11}$ diamond about its long $B^{12} \cdots B^{10}$ diagonal would provide the 1,7 geometry. Such a process, located by decreasing the $\mathrm{C}^{1} \cdots \mathrm{~B}^{5}$ distance with the $\mathrm{B}^{5}-$ ${ }_{35} \mathrm{~B}^{11}$ distance frozen, gave TS2(1,7-3,7) $(\mathrm{H}=+47.1 \mathrm{kcal} / \mathrm{mol})$. A snap-shot geometry, $\mathbf{S S}(\mathbf{1 , 7 - 3 , 7})$ is given in Figure 6 to illustrate this process, where the $\mathrm{B}^{5}-\mathrm{B}^{10}-\mathrm{B}^{11}-\mathrm{B}^{12}$ diamond pivots about the long $\mathrm{B}^{10} \cdots \mathrm{~B}^{12}$ diagonal. This gives (in the reverse direction) Int1(1,7-3,7) $(\mathrm{H}=+45.0 \mathrm{kcal} / \mathrm{mol})$. Mode-following from ${ }_{40} \operatorname{Int}(\mathbf{1}, \mathbf{7}-\mathbf{3}, \mathbf{7})$ gave $\mathbf{T S} \mathbf{1}(1,7-3,7)$ directly, emphasising the ability of this technique to give the lowest energy transition state associated with a minimum, i.e. here locating the lower TS1(1,7$3,7)$ at $\Delta \mathrm{H}=+1.6 \mathrm{kcal} / \mathrm{mol}$ rather than the slightly higher TS2(1,7-3,7) at $\Delta H=+2.1 \mathrm{kcal} / \mathrm{mol}$ w.r.t. $\operatorname{Int1}(\mathbf{1 , 7 - 3 , 7})$. The ${ }_{45}$ process linking 1,7 to $\operatorname{Int1}(1,7-3,7)$ involves a double-DSD step, where the first DSD (in the $\mathrm{C}^{7}-\mathrm{B}^{2}-\mathrm{B}^{6}-\mathrm{B}^{12}$ diamond) has already occurred at TS1 $(\mathbf{1}, \mathbf{7}-3,7)$ and the second furnishes $\operatorname{Int1}(1,7-3,7)$. The overall isomerisation process forming $\mathbf{3 , 7}$ from 1,7 has a barrier of $17.6 \mathrm{kcal} / \mathrm{mol}$, corresponding to $\mathbf{T S} 2(1,7-3,7)$, and is ${ }_{50}$ exothermic by $\Delta \mathrm{H}=-5.5 \mathrm{kcal} / \mathrm{mol}$.

### 2.4 Remaining isomerisation pathway; 7,10 to 7,9.

At this stage isomerisation processes have been characterised that rationalise the formation of all five nido species targeted. However, for completeness, it is desirable to connect all species ${ }_{55}$ to $\mathbf{7 , 9}$, the global minimum. $\mathbf{1 , 7}$ connects to $\mathbf{7 , 9}$ directly, whereas


Fig. 7 Isomerisation from 7,10 to 7,9. Numbering of CH vertices (blue) and BH vertices (black) consistent with 7,9. Inset shows key computed structures along the pathway. Selected distances in $\AA$ and energies relative to 7,9 in $\mathrm{kcal} / \mathrm{mol}$. H atoms omitted for clarity.
$\mathbf{3 , 7}$ connects to $\mathbf{7 , 9}$ via $\mathbf{1 , 7}$ and $\mathbf{4 , 7}$ connects to $\mathbf{7 , 9}$ via $\mathbf{7 , 1 0}$ (see ${ }_{5}$ Discussion section). The remaining isomerisation, from 7,10 to $\mathbf{7 , 9}$, is discussed below. Starting from 7,10, mode-following results in a degenerate process where the 3 -connected $\mathrm{C}^{7}$ becomes 4 -connected and $B^{8}$ and $B^{9}$ (or equivalent $B^{12}$ and $B^{11}$ ) become 3 -connected. This is similar to the initial movement of 10 vertices seen for the formation of $\mathbf{3 , 7}$ from $\mathbf{1 , 7}$, however here it does not lead to an isomerisation process. A linear transit was therefore adopted, increasing the $\mathrm{C}^{7}-\mathrm{B}^{2}$ distance, to cause a DSD process in the $\mathrm{C}^{7}-\mathrm{B}^{8}-\mathrm{B}^{2}-\mathrm{B}^{12}$ diamond. This gave $\mathbf{T S} \mathbf{( 7 , 1 0 - 7 , 9 )}$ $(\mathrm{H}=+27.7 \mathrm{kcal} / \mathrm{mol})$ which leads to a basket intermediate, ${ }_{15} \operatorname{Int}(\mathbf{7 , 1 0 - 7 , 9})(\mathrm{H}=+2.8 \mathrm{kcal} / \mathrm{mol})$, where $\mathrm{C}^{7}-\mathrm{B}^{11}$ forms the basket handle. $\operatorname{Int}(\mathbf{7 , 1 0 - 7 , 9})$ is related to $\mathbf{7 , 9}$ through a DSD process in the $\mathrm{C}^{7}-\mathrm{B}^{11}-\mathrm{B}^{6}-\mathrm{B}^{12}$ diamond, which was characterised through location of $\operatorname{TS} 2(7,10-7,9)(H=+21.4 \mathrm{kcal} / \mathrm{mol})$. The isomerisation from $\mathbf{7 , 1 0}$ to $\mathbf{7 , 9}$ therefore involves two DSD ${ }_{20}$ processes, through a basket intermediate, with an overall barrier of $26.3 \mathrm{kcal} / \mathrm{mol}$.

## 3. Reductions of ortho- and meta-carborane.

The experimental reductions of ortho- and meta-carborane each lead to 7,9. ${ }^{2,5-7}$ Hermansson and et al. ${ }^{21}$ showed in a study of ${ }_{25}$ carborane electron affinities that, at the HF level of theory, sequential addition of two electrons to meta-carborane produced a 7,9 nido geometry, whereas ortho-carborane was only slightly distorted. Through the present DFT calculations, we have now characterised the rearrangement processes undergone by both of
${ }_{30}$ these species following 2 e reduction, ultimately giving $\mathbf{7 , 9}$, which can be rationalised by relating them to the processes seen above. By analogy to the computational treatment of the reduction of para-carborane, 2 e were added to the optimised geometry of ortho-carborane and the structure re-optimised as a dianion. This ${ }_{35}$ gave $\operatorname{Int}(\mathbf{B})(\mathrm{H}=+18.4 \mathrm{kcal} / \mathrm{mol}$ above 7,9; Fig. 8). $\operatorname{Int}(\mathbf{B})$ is another example of a basket intermediate, where here the geometry is $C_{2}$ symmetric and the $C^{1}$ and $C^{2}$ vertices form the basket handle. The $\mathrm{C}^{1}-\mathrm{C}^{2}$ connection in $\operatorname{Int}(\mathbf{B})$ is shortened to $1.52 \AA$ w.r.t. $1.64 \AA$ in ortho-carborane, indicative of single bond ${ }_{40}$ character. From $\operatorname{Int(B)}$, a basket collapse process was characterised through $\mathbf{T S}(\mathbf{B}-7,9)(\mathrm{H}=+52.9 \mathrm{kcal} / \mathrm{mol}$; see Fig. 8, grey pathway) and involves DSD processes in the $\mathrm{C}^{1}-\mathrm{B}^{5}-\mathrm{B}^{10}-\mathrm{B}^{6}$ diamond (with $\mathrm{C}^{1} \cdots \mathrm{~B}^{10}$ and $\mathrm{B}^{5} \cdots \mathrm{~B}^{6}$ distances of $2.44 \AA$ and 2.58 $\AA$ respectively) and breaking of the $\mathrm{C}^{1}-\mathrm{C}^{2}$ connection to give 7,9 ${ }_{45}$ in a single step. However, this process exhibits a high overall barrier of $34.5 \mathrm{kcal} / \mathrm{mol}$, consistent with it being dominated by the breaking of a $\mathrm{C}-\mathrm{C}$ connection with single bond character. An alternative basket collapse process was characterised through mode-following (Fig. 8, black pathway). This pathway initially ${ }_{50}$ maintains the $\mathrm{C}^{1}-\mathrm{C}^{2}$ connection, giving 7,8 through a low barrier of $15.5 \mathrm{kcal} / \mathrm{mol}$ in which the $\mathrm{C}^{1}-\mathrm{C}^{2}$ connection is shortened still further to $1.45 \AA$. Mode-following from $\mathbf{7 , 8}$ led to a degenerate process involving a DSD process in the $\mathrm{C}^{1}-\mathrm{C}^{2}-\mathrm{B}^{4}-\mathrm{B}^{5}$ diamond (as numbered in Fig. 8), forming a $\mathrm{C}^{2}-\mathrm{B}^{5}$ connection through a ${ }_{55}$ barrier of $14.8 \mathrm{kcal} / \mathrm{mol}$. Linear transits were therefore conducted to discover a pathway leading to 7,9. A low energy transition


Fig. 8 2e addition to ortho-carborane followed by isomerisation to 7,9 through a one-step pathway (grey) or a multi-step pathway, via 7,8 (black). Numbering of CH vertices (blue) and BH vertices (black) consistent with ortho-carborane. Inset shows key computed structures along the pathway. Selected distances in $\AA$ and energies relative to $7,9 \mathrm{in} \mathrm{kcal} / \mathrm{mol}$. H atoms omitted for clarity.


## LUMO of ortho-carborane

Fig. 9 Left: LUMO of ortho-carborane at the BP86/6-31G** level; contour value $=0.05$. Right: qualitative schematics show key bonding (blue) and antibonding (red) interactions. H atoms omitted for clarity.
state, $\mathbf{T S 1}(7,8-7,9)(\mathrm{H}=+27.4 \mathrm{kcal} / \mathrm{mol})$ was located, and 10 provided a basket intermediate, Int1(7,8-7,9). From here, $\mathrm{C}^{1}-\mathrm{C}^{2}$ bond breaking proceeds through TS2(7,8-7,9) at over $10 \mathrm{kcal} / \mathrm{mol}$ lower than $\mathbf{T S}(\mathbf{B}-7,9)(\mathrm{H}=+42.5 \mathrm{kcal} / \mathrm{mol})$, giving a barrier of
$29.9 \mathrm{kcal} / \mathrm{mol}$ from 7,8. This process leads to $\mathbf{I n t 2}(7,8-7,9)$ at $\mathrm{H}=$ $+2.8 \mathrm{kcal} / \mathrm{mol}$, which is identical to $\operatorname{Int}(7, \mathbf{1 0}-7,9)$. Therefore the
15 basket collapse process described above to give 7,9 is repeated in this pathway; here forming the $\mathrm{C}^{1}-\mathrm{B}^{7}$ connection through a DSD process in the $\mathrm{C}^{1}-\mathrm{B}^{11}-\mathrm{B}^{7}-\mathrm{B}^{6}$ diamond of the $\operatorname{Int} \mathbf{2}(7,8-7,9)$ basket. The nido-7,8 isomer is implicated experimentally in the synthesis if $4,1,2-\mathrm{MC}_{2} \mathrm{~B}_{10}$ species from ortho-carborane, where 20 exopolyhedral hydrocarbyl or silyl tethers connecting the C vertices ensure the C positions remain adjacent. ${ }^{3,26,27}$ With the removable silyl tether metallation with $M=\{\mathrm{CoCp}\}$ leads to the concurrent formation of the expected $4,1,2-M C_{2} \mathrm{~B}_{10}$ species, but also the $4,1,6-M C_{2} B_{10}$ isomer, indicating that isomerisation of the 25 nido-7,8 fragment to the 7,9 form is possible. ${ }^{23}$ The initial strengthening of the $\mathrm{C}^{1}-\mathrm{C}^{2}$ connection in $\operatorname{Int}(\mathbf{B}) \mathrm{cf}$. orthocarborane contrasts with the 2 e addition to $1,2-\mathrm{Ph}_{2}-1,2$-closo$\mathrm{C}_{2} \mathrm{~B}_{10} \mathrm{H}_{10}$ (towards $\left[7,9-\mathrm{Ph}_{2}-7,9-\text { nido }-\mathrm{C}_{2} \mathrm{~B}_{10} \mathrm{H}_{10}\right]^{2-}$ ), where the $\mathrm{C}^{1}-$ $\mathrm{C}^{2}$ connection breaks due to a $\sigma-\mathrm{C}-\mathrm{C}$ antibonding component in


Fig. 10 a) 2e addition to meta-carborane giving 7,9. Numbering of CH vertices (blue) and BH vertices (black) consistent with meta-carborane with selected distances in $\AA$. b) Left: representation of the LUMO orbital 5 of meta-carborane at the BP86/6-31G** level; contour value $=0.05$.

Right: qualitative schematic shows bonding in blue and antibonding interactions in red. H atoms omitted for clarity.
the LUMO orbital of the neutral species. ${ }^{24}$ In the LUMO of ortho-carborane (Fig. 9a) a $\pi$-antibonding interaction is seen 10 between the C vertices, suggesting the connection would indeed be lengthened on occupation of the orbital. Further antibonding interactions are seen between $\mathrm{C}^{2}$ and the $\mathrm{B}^{3}-\mathrm{B}^{7}$ edge and those equivalent by $\mathrm{C}_{2 \mathrm{v}}$ symmetry $\left(\mathrm{C}^{1}-\left\{\mathrm{B}^{3}-\mathrm{B}^{4}\right\}, \mathrm{C}^{1}-\left\{\mathrm{B}^{5}-\mathrm{B}^{6}\right\}\right.$ and $\mathrm{C}^{2}-$ $\left\{B^{6}-B^{11}\right\}$ ) and along the $B^{4}-B^{5}$ (and $B^{7}-B^{11}$ ) connections. Upon 15 visualising the optimisation an initial lengthening of connections with antibonding interactions was noted (see $\mathrm{ESI}^{\dagger}$ for movie). A snapshot of this (Fig. 8, $\mathbf{S S}(\boldsymbol{o}-\mathrm{B})$ ) shows the $\mathrm{C}^{1}-\mathrm{C}^{2}$ connection initially lengthens from $1.64 \AA$ in ortho-carborane to ca. $1.7 \AA$. In addition, the distances from the $C$ vertices to $B^{3}$ and $B^{6}$ and the ${ }_{20} \mathrm{~B}^{4}-\mathrm{B}^{5}$ and $\mathrm{B}^{7}-\mathrm{B}^{11}$ connections are also lengthened at $\mathbf{S S}(\boldsymbol{o}-\mathbf{B})$. As the optimisation continues the $\mathrm{C}_{2 \mathrm{v}}$ symmetry is reduced to $\mathrm{C}_{2}$ by reformation of the $\mathrm{C}^{2}-\mathrm{B}^{3}(1.55 \AA), \mathrm{C}^{1}-\mathrm{B}^{5}(1.71 \AA)$ and $\mathrm{C}^{1}-\mathrm{C}^{2}$ (1.52 $\AA$ ) connections in $\operatorname{Int}(\mathbf{B})$.

25 Addition of 2e to meta-carborane led directly to the location of 7,9 (Fig. 10a) (see ESI ${ }^{\dagger}$ for movie). During the optimisation the structure initially distorts with retention of $\mathrm{C}_{2 \mathrm{v}}$ symmetry, consistent with the population of the LUMO of meta-carborane (Fig. 10b and see snap-shot geometry $\mathbf{S S 1}(\boldsymbol{m}-\mathbf{7}, 9)$ in Fig 10a). ${ }_{30}$ Subsequently, the $\mathrm{B}^{6}-\mathrm{C}^{7}$ lengthens and the symmetry is lost. At $\operatorname{SS} 2(\boldsymbol{m}-\mathbf{7}, 9)$, a $\mathrm{B}^{6}-\mathrm{B}^{4}$ connection is formed and the connections from $C^{7}$ to $B^{8}, B^{11}$ and $B^{12}$ have reformed. $\operatorname{SS2}(\boldsymbol{m}-7,9)$ is equivalent to $\mathbf{S S 2}(\mathbf{1 , 7 - 7 , 9})$ (Fig. 4) and indeed undergoes a related DSD process, here in the $B^{3}-B^{4}-B^{6}-C^{1}$ diamond to give 7,9.

35


Scheme 3 Interconnection of 12-vertex nido carborane dianions and their relation to 12 -vertex closo carboranes. Relative energies of nido species and the barriers associated with rearrangement processes (denoted $\ddagger$ ) given in $\mathrm{kcal} / \mathrm{mol}$.

## Discussion

Polyhedral expansion of closo- $\mathrm{C}_{2} \mathrm{~B}_{10}$ carboranes with metal fragments produces a range of $M \mathrm{C}_{2} \mathrm{~B}_{10}$ species which imply the intermediacy of 1,7-, 3,7-, 4,7-, 7,9- and 7,10-isomers of the nido${ }_{45}\left[\mathrm{C}_{2} \mathrm{~B}_{10}\right]^{2-}$ species. Here we have used DFT calculations to characterise the isomerisation pathways that link these various nido isomers. Our study has revealed several unusual new intermediates and their unforeseen rearrangement pathways which are categorised and rationalised below.

Following the addition of two electrons to the optimised geometry of para-carborane, 1,7 and 4,7 are formed as the initial nido species (Scheme 3). Thereafter, 1,7 connects to 7,9, through a single transition state, with a barrier of $11.7 \mathrm{kcal} / \mathrm{mol}$. In ${ }_{55}$ contrast, the isomerisation of $\mathbf{4 , 7}$ proceeds through a facile multistep process to form $\mathbf{7 , 1 0}$, but with a similar overall barrier of $11.0 \mathrm{kcal} / \mathrm{mol}$. The remaining nido species, 3,7, is formed in an alternative 3 -step process from 1,7 with a barrier of 17.6 $\mathrm{kcal} / \mathrm{mol}$. In order to connect all nido species to the global ${ }_{60}$ minimum, $\mathbf{7 , 9}$, additional pathways were sought from 7,10, 3,7 and $\mathbf{4 , 7}$. From 7,10, a two-step process was characterised with a barrier of $26.3 \mathrm{kcal} / \mathrm{mol}$. From 3,7, while a single step process was characterised for isomerisation to 7,9 with a barrier of 28.5 $\mathrm{kcal} / \mathrm{mol}$ (see ESI ${ }^{\dagger}$ Fig. S2) this is higher than the reverse process ${ }_{65}$ from $\mathbf{3 , 7}$ to 1,7 (above; $\Delta \mathrm{H}^{\ddagger}=23.1 \mathrm{kcal} / \mathrm{mol}$ ) and therefore 3,7 likely isomerises to $\mathbf{7 , 9}$ via $\mathbf{1 , 7}$. Similarly, a direct pathway from 4,7 to 7,9 was not found and so formation of 7,9 from 4,7 is


Scheme 4 a) Relationship between the docosahedron and nido, basket and inverted nido geometries with numbering consistent with the docosahedron. b) Processes characterised that interconvert these geometries.
thought to proceed through $\mathbf{7 , 1 0}\left(\Delta \mathrm{H}^{\ddagger}=11.0 \mathrm{kcal} / \mathrm{mol}\right)$. An additional nido species, $\mathbf{7 , 8}$, was found to be formed following 2 e addition to ortho-carborane and isomerises to 7,9 through a barrier of $29.9 \mathrm{kcal} / \mathrm{mol}$. 2e reduction of meta-carborane leads
${ }_{10}$ directly to 7,9. Degenerate pathways, where the start and end points of a rearrangement are the same nido species, were characterised for $\mathbf{7 , 9}\left(\Delta \mathrm{H}^{\ddagger}=10.7 \mathrm{kcal} / \mathrm{mol}\right), \mathbf{7 , 1 0}\left(\Delta \mathrm{H}^{\ddagger}=11.1\right.$ $\mathrm{kcal} / \mathrm{mol})$, two examples for $3,7\left(\Delta \mathrm{H}^{\ddagger}=6.2 \mathrm{kcal} / \mathrm{mol}\right.$ and 20.8 $\mathrm{kcal} / \mathrm{mol})$ and $7,8\left(\Delta \mathrm{H}^{\ddagger}=14.8 \mathrm{kcal} / \mathrm{mol}\right)$.
${ }_{15}$ A family of basket intermediates, which are often energetically comparable to conventional nido fragments, were located along several of the characterised pathways. In a basket intermediate, two vertices form a basket handle bridging the remaining 10 vertices, with examples located in this study including $\operatorname{Int}(\mathbf{A})$, ${ }_{20} \operatorname{Int}(\mathbf{A}-4,7), \operatorname{Int}(7,10-7,9), \operatorname{Int1}(7,8-7,9)$ and $\operatorname{Int2(7,8-7,9)}$ (all with $C_{1}$ symmetry) and $\operatorname{Int2(4,7-7,10)}$ and $\operatorname{Int}(\mathbf{B})$ (with $C_{2}$ symmetry with the CH vertices in the bridgehead positions and basket handle positions respectively). As shown in Scheme 4a, starting from the docosahedron, a $C_{1}$-basket may be produced 25 through removal of one of the 5-connected vertices 6-9 (red), with lengthening of the 1-4 distance to produce the requisite 4and 5-membered faces. The $C_{2}$-basket intermediates are related to the relevant $C_{I}$-basket by a DSD in the 1-2-5-9 diamond and lengthening of the 3-4 distance. Two additional key 30 intermediates, Int1(4,7-7,10) and Int2(1,7-3,7), we refer to as inverted nido geometries, due to the 6-membered belt of vertices, rather than the 5 -membered belt, being capped by a single vertex. The inverted nido motif is derived from the docosahedron by
removal of a 5 -connected vertex ( 10 or 11 , green). A classical 35 nido geometry is produced through removal of a 6 -connected vertex (4 or 5, blue). ${ }^{28}$ In order to test the validity of this empirical observation, the idealised $\left[\mathrm{B}_{13} \mathrm{H}_{13}\right]^{2-}$ docosahedron was computed, the appropriate vertices removed and the structure reoptimised as $\left[\mathrm{B}_{12} \mathrm{H}_{12}\right]^{4-}$ fragments. The nido and inverted nido 40 were located as minima ( $\mathrm{H}=0.0$ and +25.8 respectively; see $\mathrm{ESI}^{\dagger}$ ). The basket geometry was found to collapse to a nido structure, suggesting the C vertices are required to stabilise the distorted geometry, however, the $C_{2}$ basket was located as a transition state that exchanges equivalent nido structures $(\mathrm{H}=$ $45+18.6 \mathrm{kcal} / \mathrm{mol}$; see ESI' ${ }^{\dagger}$ ).

The structural types discussed above tend to access specific rearrangement processes. From nido species, the initial step in the isomerisation is most often to move the 3 -connected $\mathrm{C}^{7}$ vertex
${ }_{50}$ into a 4-connected position. This then triggers movement of the neighbouring vertices resulting in net rotation of the 6 -membered belt of vertices above the 5 -membered belt. Such processes are also responsible for the degenerate exchanges characterised in $\mathbf{7 , 8}, 7,9$ and 7,10. Three additional processes are found (Scheme ${ }_{55} 4 \mathrm{~b}$ ): a common DSD process by which basket intermediates undergo basket collapse to give nido species (Scheme 4b, upper left); the pivoting of a 4 -vertex diamond about its long diagonal to directly exchange nido geometries (Scheme 4b, right; seen in the isomerisations from 1,7 to 7,9 , from 1,7 to 3,7 and in the ${ }_{60}$ higher energy degenerate process at $\mathbf{3 , 7}$ (see ESI, ${ }^{\dagger}$ Fig. S1)) and the pivoting of two triangles about a shared vertex exchanging inverted nido and nido geometries (Scheme 4b lower left; seen in the isomerisations of $\mathbf{4 , 7}$ to $\mathbf{7 , 1 0}$ and $\mathbf{1 , 7}$ to $\mathbf{3 , 7}$ ).

## Conclusions

${ }_{65}$ The rearrangements of dianionic 12 -vertex nido-carboranes, $\left[\mathrm{C}_{2} \mathrm{~B}_{10} \mathrm{H}_{12}\right]^{2-}$, have been characterised through DFT calculations. Para-carborane rearranges to $\mathbf{1 , 7}$ and 4,7 as the first nido species, where experimentally, $\mathbf{1 , 7}, \mathbf{3 , 7}, 4,7,7,9$ and $\mathbf{7 , 1 0}$ are produced. Isomerisation processes have been characterised connecting $\mathbf{1 , 7}$
70 to $\mathbf{7 , 9}, \mathbf{4 , 7}$ to $\mathbf{7 , 1 0}, \mathbf{1 , 7}$ to $\mathbf{3 , 7}$ and $\mathbf{7 , 1 0}$ to $\mathbf{7 , 9}$, thus rationalising the experimental formation of these species and showing how they are interconnected. Reduction of ortho-carborane gives 7,8 as the first nido species and subsequently isomerises to the expected $\mathbf{7 , 9}$, while meta-carborane rearranges directly to $\mathbf{7 , 9}$. The initial ${ }_{55}$ movements of vertices away from closo geometries, following the addition of two electrons, is related to the LUMO of the neutral species.

In the characterisation of these isomerisation processes, where ${ }_{80}$ possible through a priori mode-following calculations, a series of common intermediate topologies as well as the unexpectedly complex processes by which they interconnect have been uncovered and rationalised. Basket intermediates (e.g. Int(A), $\operatorname{Int}(\mathbf{A}-4,7), \quad \operatorname{Int} \mathbf{( 4 , 7 - 7 , 1 0 )}, \quad \operatorname{Int}(\mathbf{7 , 1 0 - 7 , 9 )}$ and $\operatorname{Int}(\mathbf{B}))$ are ${ }_{85}$ characterised by a two-vertex basket handle bridging the remaining 10 vertices; inverted nido intermediates (Int1(4,7$\mathbf{7 , 1 0}$ ) and $\operatorname{Int2}(1,7-3,7))$ exhibit a 5 -membered belt and a 6membered belt capped by the remaining vertex. The geometries of these new intermediates, like nido species themselves, are ${ }_{90}$ related to the 13 -vertex docosahedron by removal of a single
vertex. The pathways through which carborane dianions isomerise, driven by the thermodynamic preference for lowconnected C vertices, are most often initiated by movement of the 3 -connected $\mathrm{C}^{7}$ vertex, common to all nido species, into a 4${ }_{5}$ connected position through a DSD step, forcing a B vertex into a destabilised 3 -connected site and leading to rearrangement of the cluster. Isomerisation continues through processes such as the pivoting of a 4 -vertex diamond about its long diagonal. This can directly lead to a nido geometry or produce a basket or inverted 10 nido intermediate. Basket intermediates can undergo a basket collapse process, characterised by DSD steps, giving to a nido geometry, while inverted nido intermediate convert to nido geometries through the pivoting of two 3-vertex triangles about a shared vertex.

## ${ }_{15}$ Computational Details

Calculations were performed using Gaussian 03, Revision D. 01 employing the BP86 functional ${ }^{29,30}$ and $6-31 \mathrm{G}^{* *}$ basis sets ${ }^{31}$ for B, C and H atoms. Zero-point corrected energies, H, are reported in $\mathrm{kcal} / \mathrm{mol}$ relative to 7,9. Analytical frequency calculations were 20 used to confirm geometries as minima (all positive eigenvalues) or transition states (one negative eigenvalue). Transition states were further characterised through IRC calculations. ${ }^{32,33}$ Modefollowing calculations used the 'OPT=TS' option in Gaussian along with the GDIIS algorithm, where convergence constraints
${ }_{25}$ were set to 'verytight' in order to force the optimisation to move away from a formally minimum energy starting geometry, itself optimised with default convergence constraints. Synchronous Transit-Guided Quasi-Newton (STQN) calculations were run with the 'QST2' option (two intermediate geometries given as ${ }_{30}$ input) and the structure generated used as input in a transition state optimisation.

## Acknowledgements

We thank the EPSRC for support (DMcK funded by project EP/E02971X/1).

## ${ }_{35}$ Notes and references

${ }^{a}$ Institute of Chemical Sciences, School of Engineering and Physical Sciences, Heriot-Watt University, Edinburgh, EH14 4AS, UK. Fax.
+441314513180; Tel: +441314518031; E-mail:dm228@st-
andrews.ac.uk
$40{ }^{b}$ Present address: School of Chemistry, St Andrews University, North Haugh, St Andrews, Fife, KY16 9ST, UK.
$\dagger$ Electronic Supplementary Information (ESI) available: Movies of the 1,7 to 7,9 isomerisation (17-79_isom.avi), ortho-carborane reduction (ortho-carborane_RED.avi) and meta-carborane reduction (meta45 carborane_RED.avi); alternative reaction profiles; computed Cartesian coordinates and energies for all structures.. See DOI: 10.1039/b000000x/
$\ddagger$ Footnotes should appear here. These might include comments relevant to but not central to the matter under discussion, limited experimental and spectral data, and crystallographic data.
501 K. Wade, Adv. Inorg. Chem. Radiochem., 1976, 18, 1.
2 G. B. Dunks, M. M. McKown and M. F. Hawthorne, J. Am. Chem. Soc., 1971, 93, 2541.
3 A. Burke, D. Ellis, B. T. Giles, B. E. Hodson, S. A. Macgregor, G. M. Rosair and A. J. Welch, Angew. Chem. Int. Ed., 2003, 42, 225.

554 S. Zlatogorsky, M. J. Edie, D. Ellis, S. Erhardt, M. E. Lopez, S. A. Macgregor, G. M. Rosair and A. J. Welch, Angew. Chem., Int. Ed., 2007, 46, 6706
5 M. R. Churchill and B. G. DeBoer, J. Chem. Soc., Chem. Commun., 1972, 1326.
606 G. B. Dunks, R. J. Wiersema and M. F. Hawthorne, J. Am. Chem. Soc., 1973, 95, 3174
7 T. D. Getman, C. B. Knobler and M. F. Hawthorne, Inorg. Chem., 1990, 29, 158.
8 D. Grafstein and J. Dvorak, Inorg. Chem., 1963, 2, 1128.
659 S. Papetti and T. L. Heying, J. Am. Chem. Soc., 1964, 86, 2295.
10 V. I. Stanko, V. A. Brattsev and Y. V. Gol'tyapin, Zh. Obshch. Khim., 1969, 39, 2686
11 C. A. Brown and M. L. McKee, J. Mol. Model., 2006, 12, 653.
12 B. W. Hutton, F. MacIntosh, D. Ellis, F. Herisse, S. A. Macgregor, D.
70 McKay, V. Petrie-Armstrong, G. M. Rosair, D. S. Perekalin, H. Tricas and A. J. Welch, Chem. Commun., 2008, 5345.
13 W. N. Lipscomb, Science, 1966, 153, 373.
14 I. J. Sugden, D. F. Plant and R. G. Bell, Chem. Commun., 2013, 49, 975.

7515 D. J. Wales, J. Am. Chem. Soc., 1993, 115, 1557.
16 L. I. Zakharkin and V. N. Kalinin, Dokl. Akad. Nauk SSSR, 1966, 169, 590.
17 S. Robertson, D. Ellis, G. M. Rosair and A. J. Welch, Appl. Organomet. Chem., 2003, 17, 518.
8018 S. Robertson, D. Ellis, G. M. Rosair and A. J. Welch, J. Organomet. Chem., 2003, 680, 286.
19 S. Robertson, R. M. Garrioch, D. Ellis, T. D. McGrath, B. E. Hodson, G. M. Rosair and A. J. Welch, Inorg. Chim. Acta, 2005, 358, 1485.

20 M. L. McKee, M. Buehl and P. v. R. Schleyer, Inorg. Chem., 1993, 32, 1712.
21 K. Hermansson, M. Wójcik and S. Sjöberg, Inorg. Chem., 1999, 38, 6039.

22 D. Ellis, D. McKay, S. A. Macgregor, G. M. Rosair and A. J. Welch, Angew. Chem. Int. Ed., 2010, 49, 4943.
9023 A. McAnaw, M. Elena Lopez, G. Scott, D. Ellis, D. McKay, G. M. Rosair and A. J. Welch, Dalton Trans., 2012, 41, 10957.
24 H. Tricas, M. Colon, D. Ellis, S. A. Macgregor, D. McKay, G. M Rosair, A. J. Welch, I. V. Glukhov, F. Rossi, F. Laschi and P. Zanello, Dalton Trans., 2011, 40, 4200.
${ }_{95} 25$ Gaussian 03, Revision D.01, M. J. Frisch, G. W. Trucks, H. B. Schlegel, G. E. Scuseria, M. A. Robb, J. R. Cheeseman, J. A. Montgomery Jr, T. Vreven, K. N. Kudin, J. C. Burant, J. M. Millam, S. S. Iyengar, J. Tomasi, V. Barone, B. Mennucci, M. Cossi, G. Scalmani, N. Rega, G. A. Petersson, H. Nakatsuji, M. Hada, M. Ehara, K. Toyota, R. Fukuda, J. Hasegawa, M. Ishida, T. Nakajima, Y. Honda, O. Kitao, H. Nakai, M. Klene, X. Li, J. E. Knox, H. P. Hratchian, J. B. Cross, V. Bakken, C. Adamo, J. Jaramillo, R. Gomperts, R. E. Stratmann, O. Yazyev, A. J. Austin, R. Cammi, C. Pomelli, J. W. Ochterski, P. Y. Ayala, K. Morokuma, G. A. Voth, P.
105 Salvador, J. J. Dannenberg, V. G. Zakrzewski, S. Dapprich, A. D. Daniels, M. C. Strain, O. Farkas, D. K. Malick, A. D. Rabuck, K. Raghavachari, J. B. Foresman, J. V. Ortiz, Q. Cui, A. G. Baboul, S. Clifford, J. Cioslowski, B. B. Stefanov, G. Liu, A. Liashenko, P. Piskorz, I. Komaromi, R. L. Martin, D. J. Fox, T. Keith, M. A. AlLaham, C. Y. Peng, A. Nanayakkara, M. Challacombe, P. M. W. Gill, B. Johnson, W. Chen, M. W. Wong, C. Gonzalez and J. A. Pople, Gaussian Inc., Wallingford, CT, USA, 2004.
26 R. McIntosh, D. Ellis, J. Gil-Lostes, K. J. Dalby, G. M. Rosair and A. J. Welch, Dalton Trans., 2005, 1842.

11527 J. Zhang, L. Deng, H-S. Chan and Z. Xie, J. Am. Chem. Soc., 2007, 129, 18.
28 M. A. Fox and K. Wade, Pure Appl. Chem., 2003, 75, 1315.
29 A. D. Becke, Phys. Rev. A, 1988, 38, 3098.
30 J. P. Perdew, Phys. Rev. B, 1986, 33, 8822.
12031 P. C. Hariharan and J. A. Pople, Theor. Chim. Acta, 1973, 28, 213.
32 C. Gonzalez and H. B. Schlegel, J. Phys. Chem., 1990, 94, 5523.
33 C. Gonzalez and H. B. Schlegel, J. Chem. Phys., 1989, 90, 2154.

Cite this: DOI: 10.1039/c0xx00000x
www.rsc.org/xxxxxx

## ARTICLE TYPE

## TOC Graphic

5 The formation and isomerisation of nido- $\left[\mathrm{C}_{2} \mathrm{~B}_{10} \mathrm{H}_{12}\right]^{2-}$ species is investigated through DFT calculations, which reveal novel basket and inverted nido intermediates and unusual inverconversion pathways, including basket collapse and pivoting traingles and diamonds.


