# Chemical Science

### Accepted Manuscript



This is an *Accepted Manuscript*, which has been through the Royal Society of Chemistry peer review process and has been accepted for publication.

Accepted Manuscripts are published online shortly after acceptance, before technical editing, formatting and proof reading. Using this free service, authors can make their results available to the community, in citable form, before we publish the edited article. We will replace this Accepted Manuscript with the edited and formatted Advance Article as soon as it is available.

You can find more information about *Accepted Manuscripts* in the **Information for Authors**.

Please note that technical editing may introduce minor changes to the text and/or graphics, which may alter content. The journal's standard <u>Terms & Conditions</u> and the <u>Ethical guidelines</u> still apply. In no event shall the Royal Society of Chemistry be held responsible for any errors or omissions in this *Accepted Manuscript* or any consequences arising from the use of any information it contains.



www.rsc.org/chemicalscience

Cite this: DOI: 10.1039/c0xx00000x

www.rsc.org/chemicalscience

## Doping-induced memory effect in Li-ion batteries: the case of Al-doped Li<sub>4</sub>Ti<sub>5</sub>O<sub>12</sub>

De Li,<sup>a</sup> Yang Sun,<sup>a</sup> Xizheng Liu,<sup>a</sup> Ruwen Peng<sup>c</sup> and Haoshen Zhou<sup>\*a,b</sup>

Received (in XXX, XXX) Xth XXXXXXXX 20XX, Accepted Xth XXXXXXXX 20XX 5 DOI: 10.1039/b000000x

In Li-ion batteries (LIBs), memory effect has been revealed in two-phase electrode materials as olivine LiFePO<sub>4</sub> and anatase TiO<sub>2</sub>, which complicates two-phase transition and influences the estimation of the state of charge. Practical electrode materials are usually optimized by element doping strategy, while its impact on memory effect has not been reported yet. Here we firstly report the doping-induced memory

- <sup>10</sup> effect in LIBs. Pristine Li<sub>4</sub>Ti<sub>5</sub>O<sub>12</sub> is free from memory effect, while distinct memory effect could be induced by Al-doping. After discharged to a lower cutoff potential, Al-doped Li<sub>4</sub>Ti<sub>5</sub>O<sub>12</sub> exhibits poorer electrochemical kinetics, delivering a larger overpotential during the charging process. This dependence of overpotential on the discharging cutoff leads to the memory effect in Al-doped Li<sub>4</sub>Ti<sub>5</sub>O<sub>12</sub>. Our discovery emphasizes the impact of element doping on the memory effect of electrode materials, and thus <sup>15</sup> has implications on the battery design.
  - Introduction

Li-ion batteries (LIBs) are the state-of-the-art power sources for mobile electrical devices, electric vehicles and smart grid.<sup>1</sup> It was generally accepted that LIBs are free from memory effect,<sup>2</sup> which

- <sup>20</sup> is common in nickel-cadmium (Ni-Cd) and nickel-metal-hydride (Ni-MH) batteries.<sup>3-5</sup> However, recent studies indicated that the memory effect also exists in olivine LiFePO4 and anatase TiO<sub>2</sub> in LIBs.<sup>6, 7</sup> As both LiFePO4<sup>8, 9</sup> and TiO<sub>2</sub><sup>10</sup> undergo a two-phase reaction upon charge/discharge,<sup>11-13</sup> which leads to a very flat
- <sup>25</sup> potential plateau, even minimal potential changes from memory effect will make it difficult to estimate the state of charge (SOC) in LIBs.

The memory effect of olivine LiFePO<sub>4</sub> cathode was firstly reported by Sasaki et al.,<sup>6</sup> which was rationalized by using the

<sup>30</sup> particle-by-particle model.<sup>14</sup> In the memory-writing cycle, LiFePO<sub>4</sub> particles are divided into two groups: part of LiFePO<sub>4</sub> particles (first group) undergoes an extra charge/discharge cycle relative to the others (second group). In the memory-releasing cycle, the second group is (dis)charged with a larger overpotential

<sup>a</sup> Energy Technology Research Institute, National Institute of Advanced Industrial Science and Technology (AIST), Umezono, 1-1-1, Tsukuba, 305-8568, Japan. Fax: +81-29-861-3489; E-mail: hs.zhou@aist.go.jp <sup>b</sup> National Laboratory of Solid State Microstructures & Department of Energy Science and Engineering, Nanjing University, Nanjing 210093, China. <sup>40</sup> Practical electrode materials are usually optimized by element doping strategy,<sup>15</sup> while its impact on the memory effect remains unknown. In this paper, we try to examine the impact of doping strategy, and we focus on spinel Li<sub>4</sub>Ti<sub>5</sub>O<sub>12</sub>,<sup>16</sup> which is a renowned long-cycle-life anode material for LIBs.<sup>17, 18</sup> Although pristine <sup>45</sup> Li<sub>4</sub>Ti<sub>5</sub>O<sub>12</sub> is free from memory effect, we find that a distinct memory effect could be induced by Al-doping.

#### **Experimental**

Pristine Li<sub>4</sub>Ti<sub>5</sub>O<sub>12</sub> (LTO) is provided by Ishihara Sangyo Kaisha, Ltd. and Nano-Al<sub>2</sub>O<sub>3</sub> (mean particle size: 22.2~47.7 nm) is <sup>50</sup> supplied by Nanophase Technologies Corp. (NanoTek®). LTO and nano-Al<sub>2</sub>O<sub>3</sub> (10 wt.%) are ground thoroughly and the mixture is calcined at 800°C for 24h in vacuum, to obtain Al-doped Li<sub>4</sub>Ti<sub>5</sub>O<sub>12</sub> (ALTO). The morphologies and crystal structures are characterized by scanning electron microscopy (SEM, LEO <sup>55</sup> Gemini Supra 35) and powder X-ray diffraction (XRD, Cu Kα radiation, Bruker D8 Advance Diffractometer), respectively. The galvanostatic and voltammetric measurements are carried out at room temperature with a battery charge/discharge system from

<sup>60</sup> respectively. Electrochemical measurements are conducted by using coin cells (CR2032). In the working electrode, a composite paste, containing 42.5 wt.% LTO or ALTO, 42.5 wt.% acetylene black and 15 wt.% polytetrafluoroethylene (PTFE), is firmly pressed on <sup>65</sup> an Al mesh (100 mesh) with a mass loading of *ca*. 4 mg cm<sup>-2</sup>.

Hokuto Denko Corp. and an Autolab electrochemical instrument,

*[journal]*, [year], **[vol]**, 00–00 | 1

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>c</sup> National Laboratory of Solid State Microstructures & Department of Physics, Nanjing University, Nanjing 210093, China.

<sup>†</sup> Electronic Supplementary Information (ESI) available: XRD, SEM and EIS mesurements, and other related information. See DOI: 10.1039/c0xx00000x

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>35</sup> compared with the first group, which results in a potential bump in the (dis)charging curve. Memory effect is closely associated with the overshooting phenomena at the beginning of (dis)charging.<sup>6, 7</sup> Owing to a much smaller initial overshoot, no memory effect has been observed in spinel Li<sub>4</sub>Ti<sub>5</sub>O<sub>12</sub>.<sup>6</sup>



**Fig. 1** Electrochemical dependence on the discharging cutoff in Al-doped  $Li_4Ti_5O_{12}$  (ALTO). (a) A sequence of four cycles: (1) discharge to 1.5 V and full charge; (2) discharge to 1.2 V and full charge; (3) discharge to s 1.2 V and potentiostatic for 2h, and full charge; (4) discharge to 1.0 V and potentiostatic for 2h, and full charge. (b) Enlarged view between 1.53 and 1.59 V. (c) The charge/discharge curves in thesame four cycles of pristine  $Li_4Ti_5O_{12}$  (LTO). The current rate is 0.1C.

- <sup>10</sup> Here, 42.5 wt.% acetylene black is added to enhance the electronic conductivity. The counter electrode of lithium metal is separated from the working electrode by a Celgard 2400 porous polypropylene film, and the electrolyte is 1M LiClO4 in ethylene carbonate/diethyl carbonate (EC/DEC with volume ratio of 1:1).
- <sup>15</sup> After drying all components, the cells are assembled in a glovebox filled with argon gas.

#### **Results and discussion**

Fig. S1a shows X-ray diffraction (XRD) patterns of pristine Li<sub>4</sub>Ti<sub>5</sub>O<sub>12</sub> (LTO) and Al-doped Li<sub>4</sub>Ti<sub>5</sub>O<sub>12</sub> (ALTO). The XRD <sup>20</sup> pattern of ALTO can be well indexed with the spinel structure, indicating no evident structural change after Al-doping, although minor amount of Al<sub>2</sub>O<sub>3</sub> and rutile TiO<sub>2</sub> impurities exist. The peaks of ALTO shifts to higher angles compared with those of LTO (Fig. S1b), suggesting decreased lattice parameters, which is <sup>25</sup> consistent with previous reports.<sup>19, 20</sup> Besides, both of the samples

are assemblies of nano-crystallites (Fig. S2a-b).

Galvanostatic measurements were performed on ALTO in a sequence of four cycles with different discharging cutoffs (Fig. 1a). As the cutoff potential decreases, especially with <sup>30</sup> potentiostatic, the subsequent charging potential heightens (Fig. 1b). Previous report has also indicated that the charging potential of Al-doped Li<sub>4</sub>Ti<sub>5</sub>O<sub>12</sub> heightens for the low discharging cutoff.<sup>19</sup>



**Fig. 2** (a) GITT measurements for Al-doped  $\text{Li}_4\text{Ti}_5\text{O}_{12}$  (ALTO), which <sup>35</sup> consist of a series of current pulses applied at 0.1C for 1h, each followed by a 2h relaxation period. The charging cutoff is 2.0 V, and the discharging cutoff is 1.5 V (red), 1.2V and potentiostatic for 2h (blue). (b) Potential increments (decrements) and (c) OCPs during the relaxation periods.

<sup>40</sup> As the cutoff becomes lower, the capacity of subsequent charging is also increased (Fig. 1c). In the charging curves, a distinct overshoot appears at the beginning, the height of which is also dependent on the cutoff. For comparison, LTO was also measured following the same procedure, while the charging cutoff (Fig. 1d). Compared with LTO, the relatively low specific capacity of ALTO could be attributed to the impurities and Aldoping. Besides, the discharging potential of ALTO is lower than that of LTO, indicating that the Al-doping raises the energy of <sup>50</sup> Ti<sup>4+</sup>/Ti<sup>3+</sup> redox couple in spinel Li4TisO12.<sup>21</sup>

Also we examined the electrochemical dependence on the charging cutoff for ALTO (Fig. S3a). Results show that the discharging curves are independent of the charging cutoff (Fig. S3b). For different charging cutoffs, the subsequent discharging <sup>55</sup> curves are nearly overlapped between these three cycles. Note that there is no overshoot at the beginning of discharging (Fig. S3c), consistent with the association between the memory effect and initial overshoot. For LTO, analogous results are obtained (Fig. S3d).

- To study the electrochemical differences caused by different discharging cutoffs, galvanostatic intermittent titration technique (GITT) measurements <sup>22</sup> were performed on ALTO. For different cutoffs, the subsequent charging curves vary significantly (Fig. 2a). The potential decrement during relaxation in charging is also
- <sup>65</sup> dependent on the cutoff: lower cutoff leads to larger potential decrement (Fig. 2b). Compared with the potential increments in discharging, the potential decrements in charging are much larger. During the relaxation in discharging, the open-circuit potential (OCP) almost approaches the equilibrium potential in 70 two hours (Fig. 2c). In contrast, the OCP in charging continuously decreases as a tilted line, which is more evident for

Page 2 of 5

2 | Journal Name, [year], [vol], 00-00

This journal is © The Royal Society of Chemistry [year]



Fig. 3 Schematics of phase transition in Al-doped Li<sub>4</sub>Ti<sub>5</sub>O<sub>12</sub> under different discharging cutoffs, in which  $\alpha$  is delithiated phase  $\beta$  is lithiated phase, and  $\beta'$  is lithiated phase discharged to a very low cutoff potential.

- s the lower cutoff. These phenomena indicate that the kinetics of charging process, which is inferior to that of discharging process, is dependent on the discharging cutoff.
- According to above results and analysis, we may infer that the status of ALTO electrode depends on the discharging cutoff, <sup>10</sup> different from the undoped LTO. Fig. 1c-d shows that the specific capacity of ALTO increases with decreased discharging cutoff, while it almost remains constant in LTO. This indicates that a high discharging cutoff is enough to achieve the full lithiation of LTO. For ALTO, however, a few of Li sites is difficult to access
- <sup>15</sup> and require a low discharging cutoff to realize the Li-ion insertion. These "hardly accessible" Li sites could be reasonably attributed to the Al-doping induced local structural change, while the detailed lattice structure after doping is still unknown and needs more investigations. Fig. 3 schematically illustrates the
- $_{20}$  phase transition behaviour of ALTO with different discharging cutoffs. In the case of high cutoff, the phase transition between the  $\alpha$  (delithiated) and  $\beta$  (lithiated) phases could occurs readily. Further discharging to a low cutoff, the  $\beta$  phase will be transformed into the  $\beta'$  phase, which represents the lithiated phase
- <sup>25</sup> after the deeper discharging, relative to the  $\beta$  phase. In the subsequent charging process, a high potential is necessary to convert the  $\beta'$  phase into the  $\alpha$  phase, owing to its poor electrochemical kinetics. The poor kinetics of  $\beta'$  phase could also be reflected in the high initial overshoot during the charging <sup>30</sup> process.
- To identify the difference between  $\beta$  and  $\beta'$  phases, the discharged ALTO with different discharging cutoffs was characterized using electrochemical impedance spectroscopy (EIS). The electrode was firstly discharged to different cutoff <sup>35</sup> potentials and subsequently charged to 1.5V, then the
- corresponding EIS spectra were measured from  $10^{6}$  Hz to  $10^{-3}$  Hz (Fig. S4). In the high frequency region, the depressed semicircle (the inset in Fig. S4b) is associated with the charge-transfer resistance (Rct), which barely changes for different discharging
- <sup>40</sup> cutoffs. In the low frequency, the bounded-diffusion impedance exhibits a transition from the Warburg regime to the capacitive regime by decreasing the frequency (Fig. S4b),<sup>23</sup> and it enlarges evidently for the lower discharging cutoff (Fig. S4b-c). In other words, the diffusion impedance of  $\beta'$  phase is larger than that of  $\beta$
- <sup>45</sup> phase for discharged ALTO, validating the difference in electrochemical kinetics. In contrast, no evident difference was found in the EIS spectra of LTO with different discharging cutoffs (Fig. S5).

The dependence of charging potential on the preceding 50 discharging cutoff is equivalent to a memory effect in LIBs.



**Fig. 4** Demonstration of a memory effect in Al-doped  $\text{Li}_4\text{Ti}_5\text{O}_{12}$  (ALTO). (a) Memory-writing cycle: discharge to 1.2 V and potentiostatic for 2h (black), partially charge for 4h (red), and discharge to 1.5 V (blue); <sup>55</sup> memory-releasing cycle: full charge to 2.0 V (green). The current rate is 0.1C. (b) Enlarged view between 1.53 and 1.61 V. The inset shows corresponding phase transition, in which  $\alpha$  is delithiated phase,  $\beta$  is lithiated phase discharged to 1.5 V, and  $\beta'$  is lithiated phase discharged to 1.2 V and potentiostatic for 2h. (c) The charge/discharge curves in these <sup>60</sup> memory-writing/releasing cycles. (d) The Linear Sweep Voltammetry

(LSV) curve of ALTO with a scan rate of  $1\mu V s^{-1}$  from 1.55 to 1.59 V after the same memory-writing cycle.

Analogous to the reported memory effect in olivine LiFePO4 and anatase TiO2,<sup>6,7</sup> ALTO exhibits a two-step charging curve after a 65 special memory-writing cycle, which is a typical memory effect (Fig. 4a-b). The corresponding phase transition can be described by a schematic model (Fig. 4b). Firstly, all particles in the electrode are discharged to 1.2 V and potentiostatic for 2h; secondly, a group of particles (lower) are charged and then 70 discharged to 1.5 V, while the other group (upper) has not changed; then, the lower group with the discharging cutoff of 1.5 V is charged first at a low potential, followed by the charging of the upper group at a high potential. Although the charging process from the low discharging cutoff is interrupted by a partial 75 discharge/charge cycle (blue curve and the lower step of green curve), the charging curve can still be smoothly connected as the red curve and the higher step of green curve (Fig. 4c). The memory effect can also be reflected by Linear Sweep Voltammetry (LSV) result (Fig. 4d). The two peaks in the LSV <sup>80</sup> mode correspond to the two steps in the galvanostatic mode. These results unambiguously demonstrate the memory effect in the electrochemical processes of ALTO. By comparison, no memory effect has been observed in LTO (Fig. S6).

This journal is © The Royal Society of Chemistry [year] Jo



Fig. 5 (a) XRD patterns of Al-doped Li<sub>4</sub>Ti<sub>5</sub>O<sub>12</sub> with different doping levels. In the precursor, the amount of Al<sub>2</sub>O<sub>3</sub> is varied from 0 wt.% to 10 wt.%. Enlarged XRD patterns of (b) Li<sub>4</sub>Ti<sub>5</sub>O<sub>12</sub> (111), (c) rutile TiO<sub>2</sub> (110), 5 (d) Al<sub>2</sub>O<sub>3</sub> (400), (e) Li<sub>4</sub>Ti<sub>5</sub>O<sub>12</sub> (440) peaks. During XRD measurements, ca. 5 % graphite is mixed into the samples to calibrate the position of peaks.

Besides LTO and ALTO above, we also studied a series of Aldoped Li<sub>4</sub>Ti<sub>5</sub>O<sub>12</sub> with different doping levels. The amount of <sup>10</sup> nano-Al<sub>2</sub>O<sub>3</sub> was varied from 0 wt.% to 10 wt.% in the precursor to change the doping level in Al-doped Li<sub>4</sub>Ti<sub>5</sub>O<sub>12</sub>. The precursor of pristine Li<sub>4</sub>Ti<sub>5</sub>O<sub>12</sub> (Sigma-Aldrich Co. LLC.) and nano-Al<sub>2</sub>O<sub>3</sub> mixture was ground thoroughly and calcined at 800°C for 24h in air to obtain Al-doped Li<sub>4</sub>Ti<sub>5</sub>O<sub>12</sub>. Fig. 5a shows XRD patterns of

- <sup>15</sup> Al-doped Li<sub>4</sub>Ti<sub>5</sub>O<sub>12</sub> with different doping levels. The XRD peaks of Al-doped Li<sub>4</sub>Ti<sub>5</sub>O<sub>12</sub> shift towards higher angles as the amount of Al<sub>2</sub>O<sub>3</sub> increases from 0 wt.% to 2 wt.%. Above 2 wt.%, the peaks of identical index approach a constant angle (Fig. 5b, 5e). Rutile TiO<sub>2</sub> appears when Al<sub>2</sub>O<sub>3</sub> amount is over 8 wt.% (Fig. 5c),
- <sup>20</sup> and Al<sub>2</sub>O<sub>3</sub> residue increases as the amount of Al<sub>2</sub>O<sub>3</sub> precursor is varied from 0 wt.% to 10 wt.% (Fig. 5d). Above results indicate that high-level Al-doping will lead to phase separation associated with the formation of rutile TiO<sub>2</sub>.<sup>24</sup>

In galvanostatic measurements, a sequence of two cycles with <sup>25</sup> different discharging cutoffs is performed on all these samples (Fig. 6). Results show that the initial potential of the discharge plateau significantly decreases before the doping content approaches saturation (Fig. S7a-b), further confirming that the energy of Ti<sup>4+</sup>/Ti<sup>3+</sup> redox couple in spinel Li<sub>4</sub>Ti<sub>5</sub>O<sub>12</sub> could be

<sup>30</sup> changed by Al-doping. Also we may see the charging potential increment arising from different discharging cutoffs (Fig. 6b-h) shows the same dependence on the doping content (Fig. S7c), suggesting that the memory effect of Al-doped Li<sub>4</sub>Ti<sub>5</sub>O<sub>12</sub> can be tailored by changing the doping level. Although a small amount



**Fig. 6** Electrochemical dependence of Al-doped Li<sub>4</sub>Ti<sub>5</sub>O<sub>12</sub> on the doping level. (a) The sequence of two cycles. 1<sup>st</sup> cycle: discharge to 1.5 V and full charge; 2<sup>nd</sup> cycle: discharge to 1.2 V and potentiostatic for 2h, and full charge. Enlarged view between 1.53 and 1.59 V for Al-doped Li<sub>4</sub>Ti<sub>5</sub>O<sub>12</sub>, 40 the precursor of which contains (b) 0 wt.%, (c) 1 wt.%, (d) 2 wt.%, (e) 4 wt.%, (f) 6 wt.%, (g) 8 wt.%, and (h) 10 wt.% Al<sub>2</sub>O<sub>3</sub>. The charge/discharge current rate is 0.1C.

of impurities, e.g., rutile TiO<sub>2</sub>, could be introduced by high level doping, their effect on the memory effect is insignificant.

#### 45 Conclusions

In this study, we show the Al-doping-induced memory effect in spinel Li<sub>4</sub>Ti<sub>5</sub>O<sub>12</sub> anode for LIBs. For Al-doped Li<sub>4</sub>Ti<sub>5</sub>O<sub>12</sub>, the electrochemical kinetics, which shows up as overpotential, can be altered by changing the discharging cutoff. In a special memory-<sup>50</sup> writing cycle, multiple discharging cutoffs can be recorded in a discharged electrode. In the following charge process, this information can be read as a stepped charging curve, which is memory effect. The memory effect of Al-doped Li<sub>4</sub>Ti<sub>5</sub>O<sub>12</sub> could be rationalized on the basis of the particle-by-particle model. <sup>55</sup> Besides, memory effect can be tailored by changing the doping level in Al-doped Li<sub>4</sub>Ti<sub>5</sub>O<sub>12</sub>. Our discovery demonstrates that the widely adopted element doping strategy is noteworthy in triggering memory effect in LIBs, which should be taken into account in industrial battery design.

#### 60 Notes and references

1. M. Armand and J. M. Tarascon, Nature, 2008, 451, 652-657.

4 | *Journal Name*, [year], **[vol]**, 00–00

- 2. Y. Nishi, J Power Sources, 2001, 100, 101-106.
- G. Davolio and E. Soragni, J Appl Electrochem, 1998, 28, 1313-1319.
- 4. R. A. Huggins, Solid State Ionics, 2006, 177, 2643-2646.
- S. Y. Sato, S. Takeuchi and K. Kobayakawa, J Power Sources, 2001, 93, 20-24.
- 6. T. Sasaki, Y. Ukyo and P. Novak, Nat Mater, 2013, 12, 569-575.
- E. Madej, F. L. Mantia, W. Schuhmann and E. Ventosa, *Adv Energy Mater*, 2014, 1400829.
- 10 8. Y. G. Wang, P. He and H. S. Zhou, *Energy & Environmental Science* 2011, **4**, 805-817.
- L. X. Yuan, Z. H. Wang, W. X. Zhang, X. L. Hu, J. T. Chen, Y. H. Huang and J. B. Goodenough, *Energy & Environmental Science*, 2011, 4, 269-284.
- 15 10. C. H. Jiang and J. S. Zhang, J Mater Sci Technol, 2013, 29, 97-122.
- A. Yamada, H. Koizumi, S. I. Nishimura, N. Sonoyama, R. Kanno, M. Yonemura, T. Nakamura and Y. Kobayashi, *Nat Mater*, 2006, 5, 357-360.
- 12. R. Malik, A. Abdellahi and G. Ceder, *J Electrochem Soc*, 2013, **160**, A3179-A3197.
  - M. Wagemaker, W. J. H. Borghols and F. M. Mulder, *J Am Chem* Soc, 2007, **129**, 4323-4327.
  - W. Dreyer, J. Jamnik, C. Guhlke, R. Huth, J. Moskon and M. Gaberscek, *Nat Mater*, 2010, 9, 448-453.
- 25 15. S. Y. Chung, J. T. Bloking and Y. M. Chiang, *Nat Mater*, 2002, 1, 123-128.
  - G. N. Zhu, Y. G. Wang and Y. Y. Xia, *Energy & Environmental Science*, 2012, 5, 6652-6667.
- T. Ohzuku, A. Ueda and N. Yamamoto, *J Electrochem Soc*, 1995,
  142, 1431-1435.
  - K. Ariyoshi, R. Yamato and T. Ohzuku, *Electrochim Acta*, 2005, **51**, 1125-1129.
  - Z. H. Wang, G. Chen, J. Xu, Z. S. Lv and W. Q. Yang, *J Phys Chem* Solids, 2011, 72, 773-778.
- 35 20. H. L. Zhao, Y. Li, Z. M. Zhu, J. Lin, Z. H. Tian and R. L. Wang, *Electrochim Acta*, 2008, **53**, 7079-7083.
  - 21. J. B. Goodenough and Y. Kim, Chem Mater, 2010, 22, 587-603.
  - 22. W. Weppner and R. A. Huggins, *J Electrochem Soc*, 1977, **124**, 1569-1578.
- 40 23. J. H. Song and M. Z. Bazant, J Electrochem Soc, 2013, 160, A15-A24.
  - 24. G. N. Zhu, L. Chen, Y. G. Wang, C. X. Wang, R. C. Che and Y. Y. Xia, *Adv Funct Mater*, 2013, **23**, 640-647.

This journal is © The Royal Society of Chemistry [year]