Environmental Science Nano

Accepted Manuscript

This is an *Accepted Manuscript*, which has been through the Royal Society of Chemistry peer review process and has been accepted for publication.

Accepted Manuscripts are published online shortly after acceptance, before technical editing, formatting and proof reading. Using this free service, authors can make their results available to the community, in citable form, before we publish the edited article. We will replace this *Accepted Manuscript* with the edited and formatted *Advance Article* as soon as it is available.

You can find more information about *Accepted Manuscripts* in the [Information for Authors](http://www.rsc.org/Publishing/Journals/guidelines/AuthorGuidelines/JournalPolicy/accepted_manuscripts.asp).

Please note that technical editing may introduce minor changes to the text and/or graphics, which may alter content. The journal's standard [Terms & Conditions](http://www.rsc.org/help/termsconditions.asp) and the Ethical quidelines still apply. In no event shall the Royal Society of Chemistry be held responsible for any errors or omissions in this *Accepted Manuscript* or any consequences arising from the use of any information it contains.

rsc.li/es-nano

- Impact of chemical composition of
- ecotoxicological test media on the stability and
- aggregation status of silver nanoparticles
- *George Metreveli† , Bianca Frombold† , Frank Seitz‡ , Alexandra Grün§ , Allan Philippe† , Ricki*
- *R. Rosenfeldt‡ , Mirco Bundschuh‡,#, Ralf Schulz‡ , Werner Manz§ , and Gabriele E.*
- *Schaumann*,†*
- [†]Group of Environmental and Soil Chemistry, Institute for Environmental Sciences,
- University of Koblenz-Landau, Fortstrasse 7, D-76829 Landau, Germany
- 9 [‡]Group of Ecotoxicology and Environment, Institute for Environmental Sciences, University
- of Koblenz-Landau, Fortstrasse 7, D-76829 Landau, Germany
- [§]Department of Biology, Institute of Integrated Natural Sciences, University of Koblenz-
- Landau, Universitätsstrasse 1, D-56070 Koblenz, Germany
- [#]Department of Aquatic Sciences and Assessment, Swedish University of Agricultural
- Sciences, Lennart Hjelms väg 9, SWE-75007 Uppsala, Sweden
- **Keywords:** aggregation, attachment efficiency, critical coagulation concentration, humic acid, bridging
-

Abstract

Understanding of the interplay of generally known colloidal transformations under conditions of test media (TM) used during cultivation of organisms, biofilms and biological effect (=ecotoxicological) studies is still limited, although this knowledge is required for an adequate interpretation of test outcomes and for a comparison among different studies. In this context, we investigated aggregation and dissolution dynamics of citrate stabilized silver nanoparticles (Ag NP) by varying the composition of three TM (ASTM, SAM-5S, and R2A used during bioassays with *Daphnia magna*, *Gammarus fossarum*, and bacteria respectively) in the presence and absence of two types of natural organic matter (NOM), namely Suwanee River humic acid (SRHA) and seaweed extract (SW). Each original TM induced reaction-limited aggregation of Ag NP, and aggregation increased from R2A to SAM-5S and ASTM. In addition to the differences in aggregation dynamics, the concentration and speciation of Ag(I) differed between the three TM, whereby SAM-5S and ASTM are comparable with respect to the nature of the aggregation process, but clearly differ from the R2A medium. 32 Furthermore, Cl⁻, mainly present in SAM-5S, induced NP stabilization. The release of silver ions from Ag NP was controlled by the presence of NOM and organic constituents of TM, 34 and by interactions with Cl⁻ and Br⁻. The degree of aggregation, formation of interparticle 35 cation-NOM bridges or stabilization was larger for Ca^{2+} than for Me^{2+} due to the stronger 36 ability of Ca^{2+} to interact with citrate or NOM compared to Mg^{2+} . These observations and the dependence of aggregation rates on the particle concentration renders interpretation of dose-response relationships challenging, but they may open perspectives for targeted ecotoxicological testing by modifications of TM composition.

Nano Impact

Ecotoxicological studies on engineered nanoparticles (NP) are conducted involving different 42 test media (TM), whose composition is adapted towards the needs of the respective species. This composition significantly influences the colloidal state and properties of NP. In this work, aggregation and dissolution dynamics of Ag NP were characterized in three different TM by varying their composition. The dissolution of Ag NP was controlled by surface protection by natural organic matter (NOM) and organic constituents of TM, and by 47 interactions with Cl⁻ and Br⁻. In general, reaction-limited aggregation was observed. 48 Aggregation depended predominantly on Ca^{2+}/Mg^{2+} ratio, anion composition and NOM quality. This knowledge will support the interpretation of and comparison among ecotoxicological studies that may have been performed under differing conditions.

Introduction

Assessing the potential environmental impact of engineered nanoparticles (NP) frequently involves the use of well-defined test media (TM), their composition has been carefully adapted towards the specific needs of the test organisms of interest. The different ionic and molecular backgrounds of the multitude of applied TM necessarily lead to a variety of NP transformations based on aggregation (in order to cover strongly as well as weakly bound NP clusters expected in TM, we use only the term "aggregation" regardless of the type of particle clusters), coating by TM constituents and interactions with organic matter (OM). Such 60 transformations may affect the ecotoxicological potential of $NP¹$ and thus lead to TM-dependent biological responses. This may – at least partly – explain discrepancies of

Environmental Science: Nano Page 4 of 42

Environmental Science: Nano Accepted Manuscript **Environmental Science: Nano Accepted Manuscript**

62 ecotoxicological effect thresholds among studies. Despite this relevance, only limited 63 information is available on potential NP transformations in TM up to now.

64 It is known that the typically high ionic strength in TM promotes aggregation of silver, $2-5$ 65 gold,⁶ titanium dioxide,^{1, 7-9} zinc oxide,^{7, 10} and cerium dioxide¹¹ NP. Also, general impacts of 66 individual TM constituents and additives (e.g., halides, $12-16$ multivalent cations, $17-20$ 67 suspended minerals,²¹ natural organic matter $(NOM)^{21, 22}$ on NP transformations are well-68 known from lab studies in well-defined systems. Also, some studies specifically focused on 69 the role of individual TM constituents or additives in complex systems: Nur et al.⁹ observed 70 that titanium dioxide NP aggregated according to the classical Derjaguin-Landau-Verwey-71 Overbeek (DLVO) theory despite the complex chemical composition of the test media. The 72 critical coagulation concentration (CCC) of TM for titanium dioxide NP as determined by 73 diluting the TM, varied between 18 and 54% , which indicates that aggregation of these NP 74 in the original (100%) TM is diffusion-limited. The dilution of TM in order to obtain stable 75 Ag NP dispersions was also applied in other studies and suggested that dilution by a factor of 76 10, would reduce aggregation sufficiently for the tests.²⁻⁴ Tejamaya et al.⁴ reported increased 77 shape and dissolution changes for citrate coated Ag NP after replacement of Cl by SO_4^2 and 78 NO_3 . Horst et al.⁸ observed stabilizing effect of humic acid (HA) on titanium dioxide NP in 79 TM. Besides these findings, it is still largely unknown, which of the generally known 80 fundamental colloidal processes dominate NP transformation in which TM, to which extent 81 the NP status varies among TM, and which aggregation mechanisms are relevant under which 82 conditions. This knowledge is of high importance as the type of aggregation mechanism will 83 influence among others, how strongly the NP status is governed by NP concentration and 84 how the type of coating and the tendency for dissolution are expect to affect the 85 ecotoxicological potential of NPs.

Page 5 of 42 Environmental Science: Nano

From systems containing a lower variety of constituents than most TM, it is known that besides the ionic strength, the type of cations and anions is important for the aggregation of NP. Divalent cations show higher efficiency to induce aggregation than monovalent 89 cations.¹⁷⁻²⁰ Furthermore, aggregation of citrate coated Ag NP is more pronounced in the 90 presence of Ca²⁺ compared to Mg²⁺, which may be explained by the higher ability of Ca²⁺ to 91 form complexes with citrate.^{14, 18} Thus, not only differences in the total concentration of 92 divalent cations, but also differences in the molar ratio of Ca^{2+} and Mg^{2+} in TM will result in different aggregation states and, thus, different ecotoxicological responses. Furthermore, TM composition differs with respect to presence and absence of halide ions. Chloride, for example, may either enhance or suppress the aggregation of Ag NP. An Ag NP stabilization by the formation of negatively charged AgCl(s) precipitates on NP surface was observed in 97 several studies, $4, 12, 13$ whereas Baalousha et al.¹⁴ reported enhanced aggregation due to inter-particle bridging by solid phase AgCl(s).

99 Even more complex is the role of organic substances in the TM. Depending on the needs of 100 the target organisms, TM contain various organic substances (proteins, enzymes, vitamins, 101 glucose and other) at variable concentrations. Their role for the NP transformation in TM still 102 requires investigation. Furthermore, NOM is increasingly used as NP-stabilizing additive to 103 traditional TM.^{1, 8} However, NOM can induce either stabilization or destabilization of NP, 104 depending on the solution chemistry and the type of NOM used.²² Especially, the interplay 105 between bridging-determined aggregation, which is observed predominantly at high 106 concentration of multivalent cations,^{14, 18, 23-25} and electrosteric stabilization^{23, 26, 27} will 107 depend strongly on the quality of NOM and on the concentration as well as types of 108 multivalent cations. As reported by Stankus et al.²⁴ Mg²⁺ induced the bridging-determined 109 aggregation to a lower extent compared to Ca^{2+} . As TM normally contain a mixture of salts

and sometimes various NOM additives, it will be essential to understand the combined effects of NOM and all cations as well as their individual contributions to the transformation of NP. 112 Special emphasis has to be put on differences between Mg^{2+} and Ca^{2+} and between NOM types and their ability to interact with these multivalent cations. Moreover, the suggested 114 impeding impact of NOM on the Ag NP dissolution²⁸⁻³⁰ seems to be highly relevant for 115 ecotoxicological testing.³¹ However, up to date, no study is available in which the TM composition was varied systematically in order to elucidate the underlying NP transformation mechanisms and identify dominating effects.

Furthermore, the concentration of NP influences their transformations in TM. For high NP 119 concentrations (from 50 to 500 mg L^{-1}) as used in some ecotoxicological studies,^{7, 8, 10, 11} 120 aggregation is significantly accelerated.³²⁻³⁴ Thus, dose-response relationships^{7, 35, 36} may be further distorted by NP concentration-dependent dynamics in aggregation during the tests. Moreover, the concentration of NP available for the organisms can be changed by sedimentation of aggregated NP. This can additionally complicate the interpretation of 124 ecotoxicological test results.

On the example of silver nanoparticles (Ag NP), which are widely used in consumer products, the central aim of this study was to elucidate how and to which extent individual TM constituents trigger specific NP transformations and which mechanisms are responsible for these processes. In particular, we tested the following hypotheses: i) Aggregation of Ag NP in TM without NOM and other organic compounds is described by classical DLVO 130 theory and it is predominantly determined by the concentration of Ca^{2+} . ii) The presence of halide ions or organic compounds in TM modifies the NP surface, but NP aggregation is still 132 dominated by the concentration of Ca^{2+} , iii) Under the conditions of different TM, NOM generally suppresses aggregation via electrosteric stabilization and hinders Ag NP

Page 7 of 42 Environmental Science: Nano

dissolution. iv) NP size does not alter the aggregation mechanism, v) For NOM that interact 135 strongly with Ca^{2+} , there is a threshold value of Ca^{2+} concentration above which electrosteric 136 stabilization is overlaid by bridging-determined aggregation.

In order to evaluate these hypotheses, aggregation dynamics of citrate stabilized Ag NP was investigated in three TM: ASTM, SAM-5S, and R2A used during bioassays with *Daphnia magna*, *Gammarus fossarum*, and bacteria, respectively. In order to obtain process-based 140 understanding, we characterized the influence of NOM, the cations Ca^{2+} and Mg^{2+} , the anions 141 Cl, Br, SO_4^2 , and NO_3 as well as the concentration of NP on the aggregation of Ag NP by systematic variation of the TM chemical composition. In order to understand the influence of the particle size on the NP transformations under TM conditions, we used NP in two different sizes (i.e., 30 nm and 100 nm). Furthermore, the release of silver from Ag NP was investigated in the presence, as well as in the absence of NOM.

Materials and methods

Deionized water (resistivity: 18.2 MΩ·cm, Direct-Q UV, Millipore) was used for sample 148 preparation in all experiments.

Silver Nanoparticles

Ag NP (30 nm and 100 nm) were synthesized by a citrate reduction method modified from 151 Turkevich et al.³⁸ (for details see SI). Hydrodynamic diameter of Ag NP was measured via dynamic light scattering (DLS) at a scattering angle of 165° and zeta potential was determined via electrophoretic light scattering technique and was calculated using the 154 Smoluchowski equation³⁹ (both using Delsa Nano C, Beckman Coulter). In the aggregation experiments the zeta potential was measured 5 min after adding Ag NP to TM. Due to the

Environmental Science: Nano Accepted Manuscript Environmental Science: Nano Accepted Manuscript

relatively low sensitivity of the electrophoretic light scattering at reduced particle number concentrations, which is expected in response to the aggregation over time, the zeta potential was not measured for longer exposure durations. Nanoparticles were additionally characterized by transmission electron microscopy (TEM; LEO 922 Omega, ZEISS) after nebulization of the suspensions using an ultrasonic generator onto a 3 mm copper grid covered with a combined holey and ultrathin (about 3 nm) carbon film (Ted Pella, Inc.).

162 **Preparation of TM**

163 ASTM medium (used during bioassays with *Daphnia magna*)^{40, 41}, SAM-5S medium (used 164 during bioassays with *Gammarus fossarum*)⁴², and R2A medium (used during cultivation of 165 bacteria and conducting of biofilm bioassays) were prepared as outlined in Table S1, S2 and 166 S3. ASTM contains vitamins, 0.107 mmol L⁻¹ Cl⁻, and in total 1.7 mmol L⁻¹ Ca²⁺ plus Mg²⁺, 167 SAM-5S medium is free of organic compounds and contains 2.051 mmol L⁻¹ Cl⁻, 0.01 mmol 168 L⁻¹ Br, and 1.25 mmol L⁻¹ Ca²⁺ plus Mg²⁺, and R2A contains in total 0.2 mmol L⁻¹ Mg²⁺, 169 various OM as well as Tween 80 (Table S4).

170 The TM were, if needed, amended with NOM as follows: Suwannee River HA (SRHA) 171 standard II from the International Humic Substance Society (preparation method for SRHA 172 stock solution see in supporting information SI) was used as model NOM. Additionally, 173 seaweed extract (SW; Marinure®) from Glenside was used in experiments with ASTM due to 174 its frequent use in ecotoxicological testing.^{37, 43, 44} Total organic carbon (TOC) concentration 175 was adjusted to 9.4 mg L^{-1} SRHA and 8.0 mg L^{-1} SW, respectively, corresponding to total 176 mass concentration of 20 mg L^{-1} for both NOM. Whereas SRHA contains carboxylic and 177 phenolic functional groups, SW contains polysaccharides with hydroxyl, carboxylic, and 178 amino functional groups, 45 thus the two NOM are expected to have a different affinity to

Page 9 of 42 Environmental Science: Nano

multivalent cations. Following the categorization of NOM into NOM of aquatic origin and of 180 rather terrestrial origin,⁴⁶ it may be postulated from their composition that SW is likely to resemble aquatic NOM, while SRHA rather resembles NOM of terrestrial origin, the latter 182 due to its higher affinity to Ca^{2+47}

In order to measure the concentration of metals in R2A medium, potentially originating from Na-Pyruvat, but also from other individual organic compounds, the solutions of each individual organic compound were prepared at same concentration as used in R2A medium. Metal concentration was measured in unfiltered and with 3 kDa membrane (Amicon Ultra-15 centrifugal filter device, Merck Millipore) filtered solutions by inductively coupled plasma optical emission spectrometer (ICP-OES, 720, Agilent Technologies).

Ag⁺ Release

190 Due to higher specific surface and expected higher dissolution rate, $Ag⁺$ release from Ag NP was investigated in batch experiments exemplary for 30 nm Ag NP in the absence and presence of the respective NOM. Ag NP stock dispersion, NOM stock solution and medium were introduced into 50 mL polypropylene centrifuge tubes (VWR). Concentration of Ag NP 194 was set to 2 mg L^{-1} , which approximates the mean value of the broad concentration range used in ecotoxicological studies. All samples were prepared in triplicate. After shaking for 1 and 7 days using a laboratory shaker at 20 rpm (rotation angle: 180°, INTELLI-MIXER, NeoLab), two 8.5 mL aliquots from each sample were distributed in two ultracentrifuge tubes (polycarbonate) and centrifuged at 396000 *g* for 2 h (SORVALL WX 90 Ultra, Thermo Electron Corporation). This allows separation of Ag NP (cutoff: 2 nm) from the supernatant 200 (SI), which contains Ag^+ and - if present - ultra-small Ag NP (<2 nm). This fraction is 201 abbreviated as Ag_{2nm} in the following. After centrifugation, 5 mL supernatant was removed from each tube. Supernatants from two aliquot samples were recombined in one 15 mL centrifuge tube (Polypropylene, VWR) to obtain a sufficient volume (10 mL) for the subsequent analysis. Ag concentration in the supernatant was finally determined by inductively coupled plasma mass spectrometer (ICP-MS, XSeries 2, Thermo Scientific) after 206 acidification with 100 μ L 65% HNO₃ (sub-boiled). The concentration of Ag_{<2nm} in undiluted Ag NP stock dispersion was also determined.

Model calculations for Ag(I) species

In order to be able to compare our results with information about distribution of thermodynamically expected Ag(I) species in TM, the speciation calculation was done for 211 Ag<2nm concentrations detected in $Ag⁺$ release experiments with 1 d shaking duration using 212 Visual MINTEO software version $3.0⁴⁸$ The calculations were performed based on the 213 assumption that the fraction Ag_{<2nm} in ultracentrifuged samples solely represents dissolved 214 Ag(I) species. Ag(I) speciation was calculated for a $CO₂$ equilibrium between air and aqueous phase. The input parameters used in the model calculations are presented in Table S9.

Long Term Aggregation

Long-term aggregation was investigated for 30 nm and 100 nm Ag NP in all TM in the absence and presence of the respective NOM. Therefore, Ag NP stock dispersion was added to the TM directly in the size measurement cuvette (total sample volume: 3 mL; Ag NP 220 concentration 2 mg L^{-1}). The pH values are listed in Table S5 and were not significantly influenced by NOM and Ag NP. Samples were manually shaken for 2-3 s. Z-average hydrodynamic diameter was measured for first 60 min every 42 s as well as after 1 d and 7 d covering the typical duration of some toxicity tests, for example, those performed with *Gammarus fossarum*.^{41, 49} As a control, particle size of Ag NP was measured in deionized

Page 11 of 42 Environmental Science: Nano

225 water at the same particle concentration over the same test duration. All experiments were 226 performed in duplicates.

227 **Early Stage Aggregation Kinetics**

228 Early stage aggregation kinetics were investigated for 30 nm Ag NP (concentration 2 mg L^{-1}) 229 in the absence and presence of NOM in all TM, but varying Ca^{2+} (as $CaSO_4$) or Mg^{2+} (as 230 MgSO₄) concentration (0.1-12 mmol L^{-1}). For this, stock solutions of salts and organic 231 compounds (Table S6, S7 and S8) were prepared. The previously calculated volume of 232 deionized water and stock solutions was added directly into the size measurement cuvette. 233 The samples prepared for Ca^{2+} and Mg^{2+} addition did not contain Mg^{2+} and Ca^{2+} ions 234 respectively. Furthermore, ionic strength-dependent aggregation kinetics of Ag NP were 235 investigated in mixtures of Ca²⁺ and Mg²⁺ at the Ca²⁺/Mg²⁺ molar ratios 0.7/1 and 1/0.25 as 236 used in ASTM and SAM-5S respectively. DLS measurements were conducted for the first 10 237 min every 30 s, starting 30 s after addition of Ag NP. Resulting pH values are shown in Table 238 S5. All experiments were duplicated.

239 In order to elucidate the influence of vitamins on the aggregation of Ag NP in TM, early 240 stage aggregation experiments were performed for 30 nm Ag NP in the absence and presence 241 of CaSO₄ (0.7 mmol L^{-1}) in modified ASTM medium, which contained vitamins at different 242 concentrations (B₁: 0.075, 0.5, 5 mg L⁻¹; B₇: 0.00075, 0.005, 0.05 mg L⁻¹; B₁₂: 0.001, 0.01, 243 0.1 mg L^{-1} ;). To exclude the influence of Mg^{2+} on the aggregation, the modified ASTM 244 medium did not contain Mg^{2+} ions. To investigate the role of inorganic anions in the 245 aggregation of Ag NP, early stage aggregation experiments were done for 30 nm Ag NP in 246 deionized water and modified ASTM medium in the absence and presence of CaSO⁴ 247 (manufacturer and purity see in Table S1) CaCl₂ (manufacturer and purity see in Table S2),

Environmental Science: Nano Accepted Manuscript **Environmental Science: Nano Accepted Manuscript**

248 Ca(NO₃)₂ (Ca(NO₃)₂·4H₂O, \geq 99%, p.a., Carl Roth), or CaBr₂ (99.5%, Alfa Aesar) at the 249 same Ca²⁺ concentration (0.7 mmol L⁻¹). The modified ASTM medium did not contain Mg²⁺ 250 ions and vitamins to exclude their influence on the aggregation. In order to test the influence 251 of monovalent cations on the aggregation of Ag NP in R2A medium, early stage aggregation 252 experiments were performed in deionized water at the same divalent cation concentration as 253 detected in R2A medium (0.03 mmol L^{-1} Ca²⁺ as Ca(NO₃)₂, Table S12) and at different 254 NaNO₃ (\geq 99%, p.a., Carl Roth) concentrations (0 - 60 mmol L⁻¹). In order to elucidate the 255 role of individual organic constituents of R2A on the aggregation of Ag NP (30 nm), early 256 stage aggregation experiments were done in Mg^{2+} -free R2A medium in the absence and 257 presence of individual organic constituents and their mixtures at the same concentrations as 258 present in medium. In addition, the influence of NP concentration on the aggregation pattern 259 was investigated exemplarily in the NOM-free ASTM medium for particle concentration 260 ranges of 0.1-10 mg L⁻¹ (30 nm NP) and 1-10 mg L⁻¹ (100 nm NP) as well as in Mg²⁺-free 261 R2A medium for particle concentration range of 0.5 -10 mg L^{-1} (30 nm NP).

262 **Evaluation of Aggregation Kinetics**

263 The aggregation rate constant, *k,* is proportional to the initial change in the hydrodynamic 264 diameter of the nanoparticles, *DNP*, with time and inversely proportional to the initial particle 265 concentration N_0 in the early aggregation stage:^{17, 18}

$$
k \propto \frac{1}{N_0} \left(\frac{d D_{NP}(t)}{dt} \right)_{t \to 0} \tag{1}
$$

267 (d $D_{NP}(t)/dt$ _{$t\rightarrow 0$} was determined by linear regression^{17, 18} for the first 180 s.

Page 13 of 42 Environmental Science: Nano

268 The attachment efficiency, α , was calculated by normalizing the aggregation rate constant of 269 interest to the aggregation rate constant obtained for the diffusion limited aggregation regime (*kfast*):17, 18 270

271
$$
\alpha = \frac{1}{W} = \frac{k}{k_{\text{fast}}} = \frac{\frac{1}{N_0} \left(\frac{d D_{NP}(t)}{dt} \right)_{t \to 0}}{\frac{1}{(N_0)_{\text{fast}}} \left(\frac{d D_{NP}(t)}{dt} \right)_{t \to 0, \text{fast}}},
$$
(2)

272 *W* is the stability ratio and k_{fast} is independent of the electrolyte concentration.^{17, 18} The value 273 of k_{fast} was obtained as a mean value of the aggregation rate constants at cation concentrations 274 where no significant concentration dependency of aggregation rate constants was observed 275 any more. Thus, for nanoparticles aggregating due to classical DLVO interactions^{50, 51} (e.g., 276 in the absence of NOM) α will increase from zero to one. α < 1 indicates reaction-limited 277 aggregation, while $\alpha = 1$ indicates diffusion-limitation. *α* in the presence of NOM was 278 calculated by normalizing *k* in the presence of NOM to k_{fast} in the absence of NOM. $\alpha > 1$ 279 indicates additional aggregation mechanisms (e.g., interparticle bridging).²⁵ The CCC was 280 determined from the intersection of linear fitting functions of *α* under reaction and diffusion 281 limited regimes in double-logarithmic scale.²⁵

282 **Results and discussion**

283 **Ag NP Characteristics**

284 Ag NP were predominantly spherical; 20% (30 nm Ag NP) and 7% (100 nm Ag NP) was 285 present as rods and triangles (Figure S1). DLS indicated a z-average hydrodynamic diameter 286 of 31.2 \pm 1.2 nm and 107.3 \pm 1.9 nm and a polydispersity index of 0.37 \pm 0.03 and 0.18 \pm 287 0.03 (mean \pm standard deviation, n = 3) for the 30 nm and 100 nm Ag NP, respectively. Since

the number weighting shifts much stronger the particle size distribution to the small particle 289 sizes than volume weighting,⁵² the volume weighted median particle diameter was calculated from TEM data in order to validate DLS results. The volume weighted median particle diameter obtained from TEM images under the assumption that all particles are spherical was 67 nm (30 nm Ag NP) and 95 nm (100 nm Ag NP). The differences of size obtained by DLS and TEM especially for 30 nm Ag NP is due to size and shape polydispersity which may have induced a systematic error in the determination of the average hydrodynamic diameter 295 by DLS.^{53, 54} Also the presence of non-spherically-shaped NPs as observed by TEM may have introduced some uncertainties during the data evaluation due to assumption of spherical shape for all particles. More detailed information on the particle size distribution of 30 nm Ag 298 NP can be found in Metreveli et al.²³ The Ag NP revealed zeta potentials of -59.4 \pm 1.6 mV 299 and -58.9 \pm 0.5 mV (mean \pm standard deviation, n = 3) for 30 nm and 100 nm Ag NP, respectively. The highly negative zeta potential underlines the high stability (>1 year) of both Ag NP dispersions.

Ag⁺ 302 **Release**

303 In all experiments, the concentration of Ag_{2nm} was higher than the initial Ag_{2nm} 304 concentration (1.1 \pm 0.5 µg L⁻¹; Figure 1) and differed among the TM, which suggests 305 significant and TM-dependent dissolution of Ag NP. In the absence of NOM, 5.2%, 0.5% and 306 0.1% of the initially spiked 2 mg L^{-1} total silver was released in ASTM, SAM-5S and R2A, 307 respectively, resulting in Ag_{<2nm} concentrations after one day from $3.9 \pm 2.2 \mu g L^{-1}$ (R2A) to 308 105.6 ± 0.4 µg L⁻¹ (ASTM). One possible explanation for the differences among TM might 309 be their substantial difference in terms of Cl⁻ concentration (107 μ mol L⁻¹ in ASTM, 2051 310 μ mol L⁻¹ in SAM-5S and 0 μ mol L⁻¹ in R2A). Furthermore, SAM-5S contains Br⁻ (10 μ mol 311 L^{-1}), which is not present in ASTM and R2A medium and undergoes even stronger

312 interactions with $Ag(I)$, such that an impact of Br⁻ even at this low concentration cannot be 313 excluded.

314 As reported in the literature, the dissolution and ecotoxicological impact of Ag NP is strongly 315 affected by the Cl⁻ concentration.^{15, 16} Furthermore, the different conditions in the TM will 316 lead to TM-dependent Ag speciation and therefore to potentially different impacts on the Ag 317 NP status. Model calculations for equilibrium speciation of Ag(I) showed that for the Ag $_{2nm}$ 318 concentrations determined after one day in supernatant, the solution was undersaturated 319 regarding solid phase silver chloride AgCl(s) and silver bromide AgBr(s) (Table S10). While 320 in ASTM and R2A most of Ag was present as Ag^+ , aqueous silver chloride AgCl(aq) 321 dominated in SAM-5S due to highest Cl⁻ concentration. The Ag_{2nm} concentrations measured 322 after one day in supernatant of ASTM (105.6 \pm 0.4 µg L⁻¹) and SAM-5S (11.2 \pm 0.5 µg L⁻¹) 323 were close to saturation concentrations calculated for ASTM (169 μ g L⁻¹) regarding AgCl(s) 324 and for SAM-5S (21 μ g L⁻¹) regarding AgBr(s) (Table S11). This indicates that during 325 dissolution of Ag NP a part of released $Ag⁺$ is likely transferred to AgCl(s) or AgBr(s) 326 leading to the lower dissolved Ag concentration in SAM-5S compared to ASTM due to the 327 Iower solubility constant for AgBr(s).^{55, 56} In addition, the formation of surface precipitates of 328 AgCl(s) and AgBr(s) as discussed below can hinder further dissolution of Ag NP.

329 The low release of silver in the R2A medium, in turn, is likely explainable due to proteins or 330 protein fragments present in the medium, which can form protein corona on the Ag-NP 331 surface^{57, 58} and hamper the diffusion and adsorption of oxidants as observed for citrate 332 coated Ag NP in the presence of bovine serum albumin $(BSA)^{59}$ and luciferase.⁵⁷ 333 Furthermore, the removal of potentially formed Ag^+ -protein complexes by centrifugation, 334 which cannot be fully excluded under the used centrifugation conditions, can result in 335 underestimation of $Ag⁺$ release. Interestingly, after 7 d exposure time, the concentration of 336 Ag $_{2nm}$ decreased in ASTM (24.9 \pm 2.2 µg L⁻¹) and SAM-5S (7.1 \pm 2.4 µg L⁻¹), but not in 337 R2A. This effect may be explained by the interplay of several processes like dissolution of 338 initial silver oxide layer, oxidation of Ag NP surface, precipitation of AgCl(s), and re-339 sorption of released Ag^+ onto NP surfaces. After complete dissolution of initial Ag₂O layer, 340 the dissolution rate of Ag NP can be decreased since further dissolution is likely controlled 341 by oxidation reaction of Ag NP surface.¹⁶ The simultaneous formation of AgCl(s) precipitates 342 can lead to decreasing concentration of Ag_{2nm} in the solution. Furthermore, the re-sorption of 343 released Ag^+ onto NP surface cannot be excluded,^{28, 60} which can be mediated by 344 complexation sites provided by the free terminal carboxylate group of the citrate coating.⁶¹ In 345 contrast to ASTM and SAM-5S, no decrease in the concentration of Ag_{2nm} was observed in 346 R2A after 7 d, which can be attributed to the absence of halide ions or to the above-347 mentioned protecting effect of sorbed proteins and their fragments.

349 Figure 1. Release of Ag_{2nm} from 30 nm Ag NP (2 mg L^{-1}) in ASTM (a), SAM-5S (b), and R2A (c) medium 350 with and without NOM for 1 d and 7 d exposure time. The error bars represent the minimal and maximal values 351 of three replicates. The bold dashed lines correspond to mean initial concentration of Ag_{2nm} from three 352 replicates. The fine dash-dot lines correspond to the minimal and maximal values of initial concentration of 353 Ag<2nm from three replicates. Different letters denote statistically significant differences (*p* < 0.05, *t*-test). The 354 data points with the same letters are not statistically different.

355 The presence of NOM decreased Ag<2_{nm} concentration in ASTM and SAM-5S. The decrease 356 in ASTM was stronger for SW than for SRHA. The observed effect of NOM agrees well with 357 the previously reported decrease in $Ag⁺$ release with increasing concentration of HA and

Page 17 of 42 Environmental Science: Nano

358 fulvic acid (FA) .²⁸ This effect can be explained by physical protection of the Ag NP surface 359 by adsorbed NOM^{28, 29} or by reduction of $Ag⁺$ by NOM^{62, 63} and suggests a stronger protection by SW than SRHA. Stronger protection effect of SW may be explained by higher 361 sorption of more hydrophilic⁶⁴ SW on hydrophilic Ag NP surface compared to SRHA. In 362 contrast, SRHA increased the Ag_{2nm} concentration in the R2A TM, which either suggests a 363 weaker protection by NOM in this medium or a meaningfully larger active Ag NP surface⁶⁰ than in the other media. The latter is supported by the smallest Ag NP sizes and complete stabilization found in R2A relative to ASTM and SAM-5S (Figure 2). Thus, dissolution of Ag NP in TM seems to be controlled by the interplay of protecting mechanisms reducing the reactivity of the Ag NP surface and stabilizing effects of NOM increasing the specific surface area of the Ag NP. The higher release of silver from Ag NP in all media by a factor of up to 2-100 compared to the original NP dispersions (Figure 1) underlines the relevance of this process during ecotoxicological tests, especially in the light of the substantial toxicity 371 induced by Ag^{+29} The interplay between protecting and dissolution-supporting effects of organic constituents of the TM as well as NOM additives needs, however, more attention to uncover the underlying chemical processes and mechanisms.

Long Term (≤7 d) Aggregation of Ag NP

In the absence of NOM, aggregation was observed in all TM, but not in deionized water (Figure 2 and Figure S2). Generally, aggregation rates of the 100 nm Ag NP were lower than those for 30 nm Ag NP. This difference may result from the lower initial particle number concentration and lower collision probability of 100 nm Ag NP compared to 30 nm Ag NP, but also differences in specific surfaces and thus NP reactivity towards aggregation cannot be excluded. This will be discussed on the basis of quantitative assessment of aggregation rates in the next chapter.

Figure 2. Mean hydrodynamic diameter of 30 nm (a), (c), (e) and 100 nm (b), (d), (f) Ag NP in ASTM (a), (b), SAM-5S (c), (d), and R2A (e), (f) medium as a function of exposure time and mean zeta potential of 30 nm (g) and 100 nm (h) Ag NP in deionized water (DW), ASTM, SAM-5S, and R2A medium in the absence, as well as

in the presence of NOM. Please consider the different y scales of Figures a, c, e with respect to b, d, f. Zeta potential was measured 5 min after adding Ag NP to TM. The error bars represent minimal and maximal values of two replicates. Different letters denote statistically significant differences (*p* < 0.05, *t*-test). The data points

with the same letters are not statistically different.

Aggregation of Ag NP was consistent with the colloidal stability that can be expected from the zeta potential, which was most negative in the R2A medium although its absolute value was substantially reduced in all TM compared to deionized water (Figure 2g and 2h). The 404 latter is a direct consequence of electrical double layer compression at high ionic strength (> 405 5mmol L^{-1}).^{50, 51} Considering the respective ionic backgrounds in the different TM (Table S4) and the stability tendencies (Figure 2), it is clear that additional processes are involved in the stabilization of Ag NP. The medium R2A, which generated the most stable suspensions, contains among others the surfactant Tween-80. Tween-80 is known to readily adsorb onto 409 the NP surface and stabilize $NP⁶⁰ - a$ process potentially of high relevance for the present 410 study. Furthermore, the stabilizing effect of the proteins⁶⁵ which are also present in the R2A medium, cannot be excluded.

 NOM generally increased stability of Ag NP in all TM and at all points of time except for SRHA in ASTM in combination with 100 nm Ag NP after 7 days (Figure 2, Figure S2). These observations support the general expectation of electrosteric NP stabilization by 415 NOM.³²⁻³⁴ For exposure times exceeding one day SW served more efficiently as stabilizing agent relative to SRHA (Figure 2a and 2b), while for shorter exposure times, the stabilization by SRHA was slightly stronger or similar to SW. This could be explained by different adsorption kinetics of SRHA and SW to Ag NP or different aggregation mechanisms, which are further outlined below. However, neither SRHA nor SW completely prevented the Ag NP in ASTM and SAM-5S from aggregation as the hydrodynamic diameter continuously increased during the seven days (Figure 2c and 2d). In contrast to this, the addition of SRHA

Page 21 of 42 Environmental Science: Nano

to R2A even completely prevented aggregation after one minute (Figure 2e and 2f, Figure S2e and S2f) likely due to overlay of stabilizing effects of SRHA and surfactant Tween-80.

Another interesting finding is that the zeta potential became slightly more negative after addition of NOM in ASTM and R2A, but not in SAM-5S (Figure 2g and 2h). Although small, the differences range between 3-5 mV and are statistically significant. It can, thus, not be excluded that these differences reflect changes in NP surface charge. Thus, NOM alone was not able to modify the zeta potential in the presence of inorganic constituents (SAM-5S), but it may have been able to increase its absolute value in the presence of additional organic compounds (R2A and ASTM). Although the final explanation requires more detailed investigations, the results suggest an interplay between NOM and further organic compounds present in ASTM and R2A or solid phase AgCl(s) precipitates, which were most likely present on the surface of Ag NP in SAM-5S (see also discussion below).

If verified by further experiments, these findings demonstrate how the interplay between organic compounds and cations and its time dependence can affect dynamics in Ag NP stability. Therefore, using Ag NP pre-aged in TM likely results in different ecotoxicological effects relative to those used immediately after preparation, which was demonstrated for titanium dioxide NP in ASTM medium. $¹$ </sup>

Early Stage Aggregation Kinetics of Ag NP

The influence of particle number concentration on the initial aggregation rates of 30 nm and 100 nm Ag NP in ASTM is presented in Figure 3 on the basis of original aggregation data shown in Figure S3. The initial aggregation rates increased with increasing particle number 443 concentration from 2.3 nm min⁻¹ (100 nm Ag NP) to 38 nm min⁻¹ (30 nm Ag NP), and within the limits of data scattering, this dependence can be described with one linear function,

Environmental Science: Nano Accepted Manuscript **Environmental Science: Nano Accepted Manuscript**

suggesting comparable aggregation mechanisms for both particle sizes. Thus, no significant impacts of additional effects, such as specific surface or surface reactivity of the NP, are evident from our data. The lower initial aggregation rates of 100 nm NP compared to 30 nm NP can, thus, be explained by the lower particle number concentration and thus the lower collision probability. The linear relationship between initial aggregation rate and particle concentration is also in a good agreement with the classical DLVO theory. A similar linear increase of the initial aggregation rate with increasing particle number concentration was also 452 observed for 30 nm Ag NP in Mg^{2+} -free R2A medium (Figure S4).

Figure 3. Mean initial aggregation rate of 30 nm and 100 nm Ag NP in ASTM medium as a function of particle number concentration. Mean values and standard deviations (error bars) were calculated from initial aggregation rates determined for the first 4, 5, and 6 min. Particle number concentration was calculated by the assumption that all particles are spherical and have the same particle diameter. Solid line represents the linear fit of combined experimental data for 30 nm and 100 nm Ag NP.

Attachment efficiency profiles obtained for the 30 nm Ag NP in the absence of NOM (Figure 4) showed two aggregation regimes (i.e., reaction and diffusion limited) and are in 461 compliance with published literature.^{17, 18} The CCC values ranged from 1.6 ± 0.1 mmol L⁻¹ 462 (Ca²⁺ in ASTM) to 2.3 \pm 0.1 mmol L⁻¹ (Mg²⁺ in SAM-5S) and were by a factor of up to 1.2 463 higher for Mg^{2+} than for Ca^{2+} and by a factor of 1.2-1.4 higher for SAM-5S than for ASTM (Table 1).

Page 23 of 42 Environmental Science: Nano

465 The slightly lower CCC and consequently, the higher efficiency of Ca^{2+} than Mg²⁺ to induce 466 aggregation agrees well with the literature^{14, 18} and can be explained by stability constants of 467 citrate complexes formed on the surface of the citrate stabilized Ag NP, which are higher 468 with calcium ($log K = 8.02$ for CaHC₆H₅O₇, $log K = 3.5$ for CaC₆H₅O₇) than with magnesium 469 (log K = 7.66 for MgHC₆H₅O₇, logK = 3.38 for MgC₆H₅O₇).⁶⁶

471 **Figure 4.** Mean attachment efficiency profiles of 30 nm Ag NP in cation-modified ASTM (a), (c), (e) and SAM-472 5S (b), (d), (f) medium in the absence, as well as in the presence of NOM for Ca^{2+} (a), (b), Mg^{2+} (c), (d), and for

473 mixture of both, Ca^{2+} and Mg²⁺ cations (e), (f). The samples prepared for Ca^{2+} and Mg²⁺ addition did not contain 474 Mg²⁺ and Ca²⁺ respectively. Molar ratio of Ca²⁺ and Mg²⁺ was 0.7/1 for ASTM and 1/0.25 for SAM-5S medium. 475 Me²⁺ concentration corresponds to the sum of Ca^{2+} and Mg²⁺ concentrations in the mixture. The grey vertical 476 line shows the sum of Ca^{2+} and Mg^{2+} concentrations in the respective original medium. Horizontal dashed lines 477 show the attachment efficiency values of 0 and 1. The values of $\alpha > 1$ indicate aggregation mechanisms not 478 considered by the classical DLVO theory (e.g., interparticle bridging by cation-NOM complexes). The error 479 bars represent the minimal and maximal values of two replicates.

480 On the other hand, the clearly higher CCC of Ca^{2+} and Mg²⁺ for SAM-5S than for ASTM despite comparable pH and divalent cation concentrations, indicate that in SAM-5S additional stabilization mechanisms are effective. Different concentrations of monovalent cations in the media cannot explain the differences in Ag NP stability since reported CCC of 484 monovalent cations for citrate stabilized Ag NP $(48-122 \text{ mmol L}^{-1})^{14, 18, 67}$ are much higher 485 than their concentration in the medium (2.43 mmol L^{-1} in ASTM and 1.06 mmol L^{-1} in SAM-5S, Table S4). Therefore, other TM constituents, namely vitamins (present in ASTM) or halide ions (present in higher concentration in SAM-5S than in ASTM), are suspected to influence Ag NP stability.

Biotin (vitamin B7), present in ASTM, for example, was found to form polymeric complexes 490 through binding of Ag⁺ to thioether and carbamide groups at concentrations of 2-25 mg L⁻¹.^{55,} 491 Although biotin concentration in ASTM is much lower than these values, it cannot be excluded that such polymeric complexes are also formed on the Ag NP surface and support particle aggregation in ASTM. In order to test this hypothesis, we measured the initial aggregation rates of 30 nm Ag NP in modified ASTM medium in the absence and presence of Ca^{2+} (0.7 mmol L⁻¹) as well as in the absence and presence of vitamins (B₁, B₇ and B₁₂) at 496 different concentrations. The initial aggregation rate (ca. 2 nm min⁻¹) determined in the absence of vitamins did not change significantly in their presence even at 67 - 100 fold higher

Page 25 of 42 Environmental Science: Nano

499 the vitamins used in ASTM medium do not influence the aggregation of Ag NP.

500 The concentration of Cl in SAM-5S medium is approximately 20 fold higher than in ASTM 501 medium. Furthermore, SAM-5S medium contains Br ions, which are not present in ASTM 502 medium. In order to evaluate the role of inorganic anions in the aggregation of Ag NP, we 503 performed early stage aggregation experiments for 30 nm Ag NP in deionized water as well 504 as in modified ASTM medium in the absence and presence of $CaSO₄$, $CaCl₂$, $Ca(NO₃)₂$, or 505 CaBr₂ at the same Ca²⁺ concentration (0.7 mmol L⁻¹). In deionized water as well as in 506 modified ASTM medium no aggregation occurred in the presence of Cl or Br (Figure 5a). In 507 contrast to this, aggregation was observed in the presence of SO_4^2 or NO_3^- at the same Ca^{2+} 508 concentration (Figure 5a). Our results are finally in a good agreement with El Badawy et al.¹², 509 who reported much higher hydrodynamic diameter (determined by DLS) of Ag NP in the 510 presence of 10 mmol L^{-1} NaNO₃ than in the presence of same amount of NaCl. In the 511 solutions containing NaCl, no aggregation was observed even at low pH value (pH 3). El 512 Badawy et al.¹² explained this effect by the high negative charge of AgCl(s) surface 513 precipitates. The formation of solid phase AgCl(s) or AgBr(s) in our dispersions was 514 confirmed by model calculations for the ASTM medium when modifying the anion 515 composition by substitution of the CaSO₄ by CaCl₂ or CaBr₂ at equivalent Ca²⁺ concentration 516 (0.7 mmol L^{-1}). The results of these calculations showed that 62.2% and 97.6% of the 517 released silver was present as solid phase AgCl(s) and AgBr(s) respectively (Table S10). 518 However, solid AgCl(s) precipitates or the presence of AgCl(s) colloids cannot easily explain 519 a higher stability of Ag NP in the TM. On the other side, zeta potentials of Ag NP measured 520 in ASTM medium modified with CaCl₂ or CaBr₂ were slightly more negative than in ASTM 521 medium with $Ca(NO₃)₂$ (Figure 5b). Although these differences range only between 3 and 6 522 mV, they are statistically significant and they could support the idea that negatively charged 523 surface precipitates of AgCl(s) or AgBr(s) may have stabilized nanoparticles in SAM-5S 524 medium. Furthermore, the stabilization of nanoparticles by adsorption of Cl or Br cannot be 525 excluded. The idea that halide ions stabilize the Ag NP in the TM is further supported by the 526 observation that the CCC for citrate coated Ag NP determined by Li et al.¹³ was higher for 527 NaCl (40 mmol L^{-1}) than for NaNO₃ (30 mmol L^{-1}). Furthermore, Tejamaya et al.⁴ reported a 528 reduction of absorbance and appearance of a shoulder at higher wavelengths in surface plasmon resonance spectra for citrate coated Ag NP after substitution of Cl by SO_4^2 or NO₃ 529 530 in 10 fold diluted OECD test medium indicating similar to our results an increasing 531 aggregation in the presence of SO_4^2 and NO_3 . Partly opposite effects were reported in 532 another study: Baalousha et al.¹⁴ determined smaller CCC for citrate coated Ag NP in NaCl 533 than in $Na₂SO₄$ and $NaNO₃$ electrolyte by UV-Vis measurements and explained this effect by 534 increasing aggregation due to the possible bridging mechanisms by solid phase AgCl(s). In 535 the presence of divalent cations (i.e., Ca^{2+} and Mg^{2+}) the influence of anions was less distinct, 536 especially for the experiments using UV-Vis method for the detection of the CCC of Ca^{2+} and 537 Mg^{2+} . The CCC determined by DLS was slightly higher for CaCl₂ than for CaSO₄ and 538 Ca(NO₃)₂ which is in compliance with the above discussed results. Most likely, whether or 539 not the presence of Cl or Br stabilizes the Ag NP depends on the concentrations of these 540 anions and dissolution degree of Ag NP. In order to clarify to which extent the aggregation 541 state of Ag NP depends on the concentrations of Cl, Br, and released Ag^+ , further detailed 542 investigations are needed.

543 Table 1. Mean CCC (in mmol L⁻¹) of 30 nm Ag NP in ASTM, SAM-5S, and R2A medium in the absence, as 544 well as in the presence of NOM for Ca^{2+} , Mg^{2+} and for mixture of both, Ca^{2+} and Mg^{2+} .

TМ 2 I.W	SAM-5S	$D \Omega$ 174.A

Page 27 of 42 Environmental Science: Nano

545 $\frac{a}{a}$ This concentration does not represent classical CCC, but marks the cation concentration at which α becomes 546 larger than 1, indicating the concentration range where non-classical DLVO interaction mechanisms like 547 aggregation by bridging become more important. ^{*b*} n.d.: not determined.

549 **Figure 5.** Mean initial aggregation rates (a) and mean zeta potentials (b) of 30 nm Ag NP in deionized water and 550 modified ASTM medium in the absence and presence of CaSO₄, CaCl₂, Ca(NO₃)₂, or CaBr₂ at the same Ca²⁺ 551 concentration (0.7 mmol L⁻¹). The modified ASTM medium did not contain Mg²⁺ and vitamins. The horizontal 552 dashed line shows the initial aggregation rate when no aggregation occurs. The error bars represent the standard 553 deviations from three replicates. Different letters denote statistically significant differences (*p* < 0.05, *t*-test) 554 between the data points for deionized water (upper-case letters) and modified ASTM medium (lower-case 555 letters). The data points with the same letters are not statistically different.

556 Despite the high long-term stability of Ag NP in R2A (Figure 2), which is most probably due 557 to the presence of surfactants, it is important to mention that CCC of Mg^{2+} 558 (1.7 \pm 0.2 mmol L⁻¹) in R2A was even lower than in ASTM and SAM-5S in the absence of

28 559 NOM (Table 1), Furthermore, even in the absence of Mg^{2+} , attachment efficiency, α (0.15) was clearly above zero (Figure 6), whereas aggregation of Ag NP in ASTM and SAM-5S 561 medium required Ca^{2+} or Mg^{2+} concentrations above 0.5-0.9 mmol L⁻¹ (Figure 4). One reason for these unexpected findings may be that the organic constituents of the R2A medium contain significant amounts of cations, which had not yet been considered. The total 564 concentration of divalent (Ca^{2+} and Mg²⁺) and monovalent (Na⁺ and K⁺) cations originated 565 from the organic compounds of the R2A medium was 0.03 and 6.7 mmol L^{-1} , respectively 566 (Table S12). Considering that K^+ (3.5 mmol L^{-1}) originated from K₂HPO₄, the total 567 monovalent cation concentration in Mg^{2+} -free R2A medium was approximately 10 mmol L⁻¹. Additional experiments showed that aggregation of Ag NP in deionized water in the presence 569 of 0.03 mmol L^{-1} Ca²⁺ started at a Na⁺ concentration of approximately 30 mmol L^{-1} (Figure $\,$ S6). Therefore, monovalent and divalent cations available in Mg²⁺-free R2A medium alone cannot explain the increase in hydrodynamic diameter of Ag NP. Most likely, this effect is induced by organic compounds present in R2A (amino acids, proteins and protein fragments; Table S4) despite the high stabilization efficiency of Tween 80. Additional aggregation experiments showed that in the absence of MgSO4 the single organic constituents of R2A medium alone did not induce aggregation of Ag NP (30 nm). Only the mixtures of individual organic compounds were able to initialize aggregation (Figure S7). Most effective was the mixture of casein and yeast extract, which contain amino acids, proteins and protein 578 fragments. Proteins adsorbing to Ag $NP^{57, 59, 68}$ can form a multilayer protein corona on NP 579 surfaces,^{57, 58} which could also explain the fast initial increase in hydrodynamic diameter to 65 nm (Figure 2) instead of aggregation. However, additional aggregation experiments in Mg^{2+} -free R2A at different Ag NP (30 nm) concentration showed that particle size remained constant within 10 min, but it increased with increasing NP concentration (Figure S4), such that even the initial increase in hydrodynamic diameter must be at least partly due to

Page 29 of 42 Environmental Science: Nano

aggregation, which is in contrast to the assumption of the sole relevance of the protein corona. Which mechanisms induce the initial aggregation and whether or not the protein corona is also effective (or becomes effective only slowly, preventing further aggregation after some minutes), should be investigated in further detail by assessing the development and architecture of OM coatings in media with complex composition.

589

590 **Figure 6.** Mean attachment efficiency profiles of 30 nm Ag NP in cation modified R2A medium as a function of 591 Mg^{2+} concentration. The grey vertical line shows the Mg^{2+} concentration in the original R2A medium. 592 Horizontal dashed lines show the attachment efficiency values of 0 and 1. The error bars represent the minimal 593 and maximal values of two replicates.

594 The attachment efficiency profiles for Me²⁺ used as Ca^{2+} -Mg²⁺ combinations at Ca^{2+}/Mg^{2+} 595 ratio of the respective media (Figure 4e and 4f) indicated lower CCC of Me²⁺ in ASTM (2.0) 596 ± 0.1 mmol L⁻¹) than in SAM-5S (2.4 \pm 0.1 mmol L⁻¹). Thus, the media would have to be 597 concentrated with respect to Me^{2+} concentration by a factor of only 1.2 for ASTM, but of 2.0 598 for SAM-5S in order to reach the diffusion limited regime.

This is in line with the findings for single cations. The total concentrations of divalent cations $(Ca^{2+} + Mg^{2+})$ in ASTM and SAM-5S and Mg²⁺ in R2A) in all original TM (grey vertical lines in Figure 4e and 4f and Figure 6) lie in the reaction-limited regime, which predicts the formation of reaction-limited aggregates (RLA) in the original TM. It is important to note 603 that the Me²⁺ concentration in ASTM, but not in SAM-5S, is already close to the CCC, such that an overlay between diffusion and reaction control cannot be excluded in ASTM. In 605 contrast to our observation for Ag NP, the results of Nur et al.⁹ suggest diffusion limited aggregation for titanium dioxide NP in several original TM. RLA are usually more compact 607 and stable compared to the diffusion-limited aggregates (DLA) .⁶⁹ The difference in aggregation regime between Ag NP and titanium dioxide NP, thus suggests that organisms are confronted with different types of aggregates in the same test medium, depending on the type of NP used.

611 Addition of NOM reduced α at the cation concentrations below respective CCC in all TM 612 (Figure 4) confirming the generally assumed stabilizing effect of NOM, which was stronger 613 in the presence of Ca^{2+} than in the presence of Mg²⁺ (Table 1). This is in contrast to the 614 strong destabilizing effect of Ca^{2+} on Ag NP in the absence of NOM. Moreover, the 615 stabilizing effect of SRHA in the presence of Ca^{2+} was dramatically stronger than that of SW, 616 and the differences between Ca^{2+} and Mg^{2+} in the presence of NOM were lower for SW than 617 for SRHA (Table 1 and Figure 4). This can be a result of stronger interaction between SRHA 618 and Ca^{2+} than between SRHA and Mg^{2+} , assuming that the multivalent cations act as bridging 619 agent between Ag NP and NOM coating. This is in line with the observation that in Ca^{2+} -620 dominated systems, where the degree of $SRHA-Me^{2+}$ interactions is higher compared to 621 Mg^{2+} -dominated systems.^{24, 25}

622 In contrast to this, SRHA, but not SW, resulted in $\alpha > 1$ at Ca²⁺ concentrations above 6.3 ± 623 1.4 mmol L⁻¹ for ASTM and above 4.2 ± 0.1 mmol L⁻¹ for SAM-5S. Furthermore, α further 624 increased with increasing Ca^{2+} concentration up to 2.2 ± 0.5 and 3.7 ± 0.1 mmol L⁻¹ in ASTM 625 and SAM-5S, respectively. Also high Mg²⁺ concentrations resulted in increased α (1.4), but 626 to a much lower extent than for Ca^{2+} . Such accelerated aggregation by SRHA in the presence

Page 31 of 42 Environmental Science: Nano

627 of Ca²⁺ in high concentrations is in line with observations for Ag NP^{14, 18} and Au NP²⁴ in the 628 presence of FA or HA and has been explained by bridging of NP via Ca^{2+} -NOM complexes. 629 The formation of NP aggregates by cation-NOM bridges is not consistent with classical 630 DLVO theory. Stankus et al.²⁴ reported that Mg^{2+} can enhance NP aggregation in the 631 presence of SRHA (5 mg L^{-1} TOC), but to a lower extent than Ca^{2+} . The difference between 632 Ca²⁺ and Mg²⁺ was explained by the larger hydration radius of Mg²⁺ compared to Ca²⁺, 633 leading to a lower tendency of Mg^{2+} to form inner sphere complexes with the NOM.²⁴ The 634 fact that no effect was observed for Mg^{2+} in the work of Chen and Elimelech²⁵ is most likely 635 a result of significantly lower HA concentration (1 mg L^{-1} TOC) used in their work relative to 636 the present study (9.4 mg L^{-1} TOC). This demonstrates that, besides the concentration of 637 divalent cations, the NOM concentration is a key parameter influencing bridging-determined 638 aggregation.

639 The lack of aggregation enhancement by SW even in the presence of Ca^{2+} suggests that the 640 SW constituents tend to undergo insignificant bridging with Ca^{2+} and Mg^{2+} , which is most 641 probably due to differences in molecular weight, multi-functionality and affinity of functional 642 groups towards Ca^{2+} and Mg^{2+} . While SW contains large fraction of polysaccharides, 643 phenolic and carboxylic functional groups are relevant in SRHA, suggesting that coordinative 644 Me²⁺-NOM interactions are more relevant in SRHA than in SW. In the presence of NOM 645 aggregation enhancement was also not observed in R2A medium, which underlines the 646 reported strong stabilizing efficiency of Tween 80.⁶⁰ Furthermore, other organic constituents 647 (proteins and protein fragments) of R2A may modified the Ag NP surface and by this 648 reduced the probability to form the $Me^{2+}NOM$ bridges between NP.

649 **Consequences for aggregation dynamics in test media**

Summarizing the findings of this study, TM-specific changes in Ag NP aging and aggregation state as well as in the concentration and speciation of Ag(I) are suggested (Table 2). Regarding the nature of the aggregation process, both SAM-5S and ASTM seem to be similar, but differ in the expression of qualitative characteristics of NOM coating and aggregate size. In contrast, the R2A results in clearly smaller aggregates and $Ag⁺$ concentrations than the other two TM. Thus, although the characteristics of the Ag NP in R2A are not fully resolved, it seems unquestionable that they differ from those in the other two TM. Generally, under conditions of the investigated TM, the aggregation state of the Ag 658 NP is determined by the Ca^{2+}/Mg^{2+} ratio and concentration of halide ions in the TM (Table 2).

In all TM, reaction-limited aggregates are expected, with the consequence that their morphology and stability is sensitive to the TM composition and NP concentration. These aggregates are very small in R2A medium, such that their properties will differ strongly from those of ASTM and SAM-5S. Aggregate types and dynamics are expected comparable between ASTM and SAM-5S medium, but zeta potential, aggregate sizes and NP reaction on the addition of different types of NOM and on the changes in concentration and composition 666 of multivalent cations differs between these two media. Furthermore, the Me^{2+} concentration in ASTM is close to its CCC, suggesting starting relevance of diffusion-limitation for 668 aggregation. These differences are mostly due to different initial molar ratios of Ca^{2+}/Mg^{2+} between the two media and the presence or absence of halide ions. In the absence of strong stabilizing agents like Tween 80, the most prominent differences among all TM are the 671 concentration of Cl⁻ and the dominance of Ca^{2+} .

With respect to the inorganic constituents relevant for Ag NP dissolution, surface reaction and aggregation, the composition of the SAM-5S resembles that of the Rhine water discussed

Page 33 of 42 Environmental Science: Nano

674 by Metreveli et al.²³ and suggests that Ag NP aggregates are at least partly stabilized in the 675 presence of Cl⁻, but with a distinct speciation of Ag(I) in this water. More generally speaking, our results suggest that Ag NP may be only incompletely stabilized by NOM and halides in natural waters, and NOM quality in addition to ion composition will strongly affect the nature of the aggregates forming. Thus, as long as NOM in the natural water is similar to SW, bridging-determined aggregates in that water will have low relevance compared to waters rich in NOM similar to SRHA.

681 **Table 2.** Overview on NP characteristics in TM and their dynamics and changes upon modification of TM

	ASTM	SAM-5S	R2A
Salt composition			
Ca^{2+}/Mg^{2+} a	0.69/1	1/0.25	0/0.2
Cl^-/Br^{-a}	0.11/0	2.05/0.01	0/0
Formation of Ag(I) species			
$Ag+ concentration$	$++++$	$++$	$\! +$
predominant Ag(I) species	Ag^+	AgCl(aq)	Ag^+ Ag ⁺ -protein complexes?
Impact of NOM	NOM reduces Ag^+ SW>SRHA	SRHA reduces Ag ⁺	SRHA increases Ag ⁺
Aggregation and colloidal stability			
Tendency to aggregate	$++++$	$^{+++}$	$+$
$CCC(Mg2+)/CCC(Ca2+)$ ^a	1.9/1.6	2.3/2.2	1.7/n.d. b
NP stabilization	no effect of vitamins	by halide surface precipitates?	by Tween 80 protein corona?
Impact of NOM in original TM (at low Me^{2+} concentrations)	electrosteric stabilization $SW \leq SRHA$ (short term) SW > SRHA (long term)	electrosteric stabilization	electrosteric stabilization
Effect of Me^{2+} in the presence of NOM		Ca^{2+} enhances electrosteric stabilization compared to Mg^{2+}	
	SRHA > SW	Me^{2+} induces bridging-determined aggregation at high concentrations: $Ca^{2+} > 6.3$ mmol L^{-1} $Ca^{2+} > 4.2$ mmol L^{-1} $Mg^{2+} > 3.4$ mmol L^{-1} $Mg^{2+} > 2.9$ mmol L^{-1}	no bridging-determined aggregation
General strength of cation effects		$Ca^{2+} > Mg^{2+}$ based on Me^{2+} -citrate and Me^{2+} -NOM interactions	

682 composition as suggested from this study.

683 a in mmol L⁻¹ / mmol L⁻¹. b n.d.: not determined.

684 **Conclusions**

In summary, not only the composition of the TM but also the Ag NP concentration and the duration of the ecotoxicological and biological studies will significantly affect the aggregation status of Ag NP. This underlines the requirement to carefully interpret dose-response relationships and differences in toxicity towards the same organisms, which have been obtained for TM with different composition. In the absence of NOM, the formation of aggregates is controlled by the molar ratio of multivalent cations and by the type of anions. Under the conditions of TM, formation of bridging-determined aggregates induced by NOM is not relevant, but could increase in relevance in natural surface waters with high concentration of cations. Pre-aging of NP in the TM prior to the biological and ecotoxicological studies will minimize the time depending transformations and changes in

Page 35 of 42 Environmental Science: Nano

colloidal state and concentration of NP during the tests and will allow the investigation of the effect of different states of aggregation and different coating structures, but also of different concentrations of metal cations released from NP in the medium under conditions comparable with the realistic environmental scenarios.

The results of our study do not only show that by using different TM, the same Ag NP will likely have different ecotoxicological potentials, but they open perspectives for targeted research on the impact of individual Ag NP species on ecotoxicological potential. For 702 example, increasing Ca^{2+}/Mg^{2+} concentration ratio in the absence of NOM will enhance aggregation. By modifying the nature of the NOM additive of the TM and the ratio between Ca^{2+} and Mg²⁺, the effectiveness of the electrosteric stabilization by NOM will be modified and bridging-determined aggregation may be induced. The use of SW and the dominance of Mg^{2+} will favor aggregates formed on the basis of extended DLVO interactions. In ecotoxicological tests, these composition parameters could be adjusted within ranges where no or low effects on the vitality of test organisms are expected in order to obtain Ag NP with different coating stability, surface and aggregate characteristics, and concentration of dissolved Ag(I) species. It is furthermore essential to know how ecotoxicity results obtained in conventional TM could be transferred to environmental systems, the composition of which differs often significantly from that of the TM with the consequence of different aggregation 713 properties.⁶ Taking advantage of the knowledge of NP transformations in TM with modified chemical composition will, therefore, allow to predict specific NP characteristics and aggregation states in natural environmental systems, which may help in a second step to extrapolate ecotoxicological findings to the field.

Associated content

Supporting information

Details of the Ag NP synthesis method; Preparation method of SRHA stock Solution; Calculation of centrifugation duration; Chemical composition of TM; pH values in TM after addition of NOM and Ag NP; Chemical composition of the stock solutions used for early stage aggregation experiments; Input parameters used in the model calculations; Speciation of silver in TM; Metal concentrations in organic compounds used for preparation of R2A; Particle size distribution (DLS) and TEM images of Ag NP; Hydrodynamic diameter of Ag NP in TM for first 60 min as a function of exposure time. Hydrodynamic diameter of Ag NP in ASTM and R2A at different particle concentrations; Initial aggregation rates of 30 nm Ag 727 NP in modified ASTM medium in the absence and presence of vitamins (B_1, B_7, A_8) and (B_{12}) ; 728 Initial aggregation rates of 30 nm Ag NP in deionized water in the presence of 0.03 mmol L^{-1} 729 Ca^{2+} and at different Na⁺ concentrations. Initial aggregation rates of 30 nm Ag NP in 730 deionized water and in Mg^{2+} -free R2A medium in the absence and presence of individual organic constituents of R2A and their mixtures.

Author information

Corresponding authors

- *E-Mail: schaumann@uni-landau.de
- **Notes**
- The authors declare no competing financial interest.

Acknowledgement

Page 37 of 42 Environmental Science: Nano

References

745 1. Seitz, F.; Luderwald, S.; Rosenfeldt, R. R.; Schulz, R.; Bundschuh, M., Aging of TiO₂ nanoparticles transiently increases their toxicity to the pelagic microcrustacean *Daphnia magna*. *Plos One* **2015,** *10*, (5).

2. Romer, I.; White, T. A.; Baalousha, M.; Chipman, K.; Viant, M. R.; Lead, J. R., Aggregation and dispersion of silver nanoparticles in exposure media for aquatic toxicity tests. *Journal of Chromatography A* **2011,** *1218*, (27), 4226-4233.

3. Romer, I.; Gavin, A. J.; White, T. A.; Merrifield, R. C.; Chipman, J. K.; Viant, M. R.; Lead, J. R., The critical importance of defined media conditions in *Daphnia magna* nanotoxicity studies. *Toxicology Letters* **2013,** *223*, (1), 103-108.

4. Tejamaya, M.; Romer, I.; Merrifield, R. C.; Lead, J. R., Stability of citrate, PVP, and PEG coated silver nanoparticles in ecotoxicology media. *Environmental Science and Technology* **2012,** *46*, (13), 7011-7017.

5. Zhao, C. M.; Wang, W. X., Size-dependent uptake of silver nanoparticles in *Daphnia magna*. *Environmental Science and Technology* **2012,** *46*, (20), 11345-11351.

6. Park, S.; Woodhall, J.; Ma, G. B.; Veinot, J. G. C.; Cresser, M. S.; Boxall, A. B. A., Regulatory ecotoxicity testing of engineered nanoparticles: Are the results relevant to the natural environment? *Nanotoxicology* **2014,** *8*, (5), 583-592.

7. Wiench, K.; Wohlleben, W.; Hisgen, V.; Radke, K.; Salinas, E.; Zok, S.; Landsiedel, 763 R., Acute and chronic effects of nano- and non-nano-scale $TiO₂$ and ZnO particles on 764 mobility and reproduction of the freshwater invertebrate *Daphnia magna*. Chemosphe mobility and reproduction of the freshwater invertebrate *Daphnia magna*. *Chemosphere* **2009,** *76*, (10), 1356-1365.

8. Horst, A. M.; Ji, Z. X.; Holden, P. A., Nanoparticle dispersion in environmentally 767 relevant culture media: A TiO₂ case study and considerations for a general approach. *Journal* 768 *of Nanoparticle Research* 2012, 14, (8), 1014. *of Nanoparticle Research* **2012,** *14*, (8), 1014.

- 9. Nur, Y.; Lead, J. R.; Baalousha, M., Evaluation of charge and agglomeration behavior 770 of TiO₂ nanoparticles in ecotoxicological media. *Science of The Total Environment* 2015,
771 535, (Special Issue: Engineered nanoparticles in soils and waters), 45-53. *535*, (Special Issue: Engineered nanoparticles in soils and waters), 45-53. 10. Vielkind, M.; Kampen, I.; Kwade, A., Zinc oxide nanoparticles in bacterial growth medium: Optimized dispersion and growth inhibition of *Pseudomonas putida*. *Advances in Nanoparticles* **2013,** *2*, 287-293. 11. Tantra, R.; Jing, S. H.; Pichaimuthu, S. K.; Walker, N.; Noble, J.; Hackley, V. A., 776 Dispersion stability of nanoparticles in ecotoxicological investigations: The need for adequate
777 measurement tools. Journal of Nanoparticle Research 2011, 13, (9), 3765-3780. measurement tools. *Journal of Nanoparticle Research* **2011,** *13*, (9), 3765-3780. 778 12. El Badawy, A. M.; Luxton, T. P.; Silva, R. G.; Scheckel, K. G.; Suidan, M. T.; 779 Tolaymat, T. M., Impact of environmental conditions (pH, ionic strength, and electroly Tolaymat, T. M., Impact of environmental conditions (pH, ionic strength, and electrolyte type) on the surface charge and aggregation of silver nanoparticles suspensions. *Environmental Science and Technology* **2010,** *44*, (4), 1260-1266. 782 13. Li, X.; Lenhart, J. J.; Walker, H. W., Aggregation kinetics and dissolution of coated silver nanoparticles. *Langmuir* 2012, 28, (2), 1095-1104. silver nanoparticles. *Langmuir* **2012,** *28*, (2), 1095-1104. 14. Baalousha, M.; Nur, Y.; Romer, I.; Tejamaya, M.; Lead, J. R., Effect of monovalent and divalent cations, anions and fulvic acid on aggregation of citrate-coated silver nanoparticles. *Science of the Total Environment* **2013,** *454*, 119-131. 15. Levard, C.; Hotze, E. M.; Colman, B. P.; Dale, A. L.; Truong, L.; Yang, X. Y.; Bone, A. J.; Brown, G. E.; Tanguay, R. L.; Di Giulio, R. T.; Bernhardt, E. S.; Meyer, J. N.; Wiesner, M. R.; Lowry, G. V., Sulfidation of silver nanoparticles: Natural Antidote to their toxicity. *Environmental Science and Technology* **2013a,** *47*, (23), 13440-13448. 16. Levard, C.; Mitra, S.; Yang, T.; Jew, A. D.; Badireddy, A. R.; Lowry, G. V.; Brown, G. E., Effect of Chloride on the Dissolution Rate of Silver Nanoparticles and Toxicity to *E. coli*. *Environmental Science and Technology* **2013b,** *47*, (11), 5738-5745. 794 17. Chen, K. L.; Elimelech, M., Aggregation and deposition kinetics of fullerene (C_{60})
795 nanoparticles. *Langmuir* **2006**, 22, (26), 10994-11001. nanoparticles. *Langmuir* **2006,** *22*, (26), 10994-11001.
- 18. Huynh, K. A.; Chen, K. L., Aggregation kinetics of citrate and polyvinylpyrrolidone coated silver nanoparticles in monovalent and divalent electrolyte solutions. *Environmental Science and Technology* **2011,** *45*, (13), 5564-5571.
- 799 19. Topuz, E.; Sigg, L.; Talinli, I., A systematic evaluation of agglomeration of Ag and 7iO₂ nanoparticles under freshwater relevant conditions. *Environmental Pollution* 2014, 19 TiO2 nanoparticles under freshwater relevant conditions. *Environmental Pollution* **2014,** *193*,
- 37-44.
- 802 20. Topuz, E.; Traber, J.; Sigg, L.; Talinli, I., Agglomeration of Ag and TiO₂
803 nanoparticles in surface and wastewater: Role of calcium ions and of organic carl
- nanoparticles in surface and wastewater: Role of calcium ions and of organic carbon fractions. *Environmental Pollution* **2015,** *204*, 313-323.
- 805 21. Hall, S.; Bradley, T.; Moore, J. T.; Kuykindall, T.; Minella, L., Acute and chronic 806 toxicity of nano-scale $TiO₂$ particles to freshwater fish, cladocerans, and green algae, and

Page 39 of 42 Environmental Science: Nano

34. Liu, J. F.; Legros, S.; Ma, G. B.; Veinot, J. G. C.; von der Kammer, F.; Hofmann, T., Influence of surface functionalization and particle size on the aggregation kinetics of engineered nanoparticles. *Chemosphere* **2012,** *87*, (8), 918-924. 35. Das, P.; Xenopoulos, M. A.; Metcalfe, C. D., Toxicity of silver and titanium dioxide nanoparticle suspensions to the aquatic invertebrate, *Daphnia magna*. *Bull. Environ. Contam. Toxicol.* **2013,** *91*, (1), 76-82. 36. Lovern, S. B.; Klaper, R., *Daphnia magna* mortality when exposed to titanium 853 dioxide and fullerene (C_{60}) nanoparticles. *Environmental Toxicology and Chemistry* 2006, 25, 854 (4). 1132-1137. (4) , 1132-1137. 855 37. Seitz, F.; Bundschuh, M.; Rosenfeldt, R. R.; Schulz, R., Nanoparticle toxicity in 856 Daphnia magna reproduction studies: The importance of test design. Aquatic Toxicolog *Daphnia magna* reproduction studies: The importance of test design. *Aquatic Toxicology* **2013,** *126*, 163-168. 858 38. Turkevich, J.; Stevenson, P. C.; Hillier, J., A study of the nucleation and growth processes in the synthesis of colloidal gold. *Discussions of the Faraday Society* **1951,** *11*, 55- 75. 861 39. Schultz, N.; Metreveli, G.; Franzreb, M.; Frimmel, F. H.; Syldatk, C., Zeta potential measurement as a diagnostic tool in enzyme immobilisation. *Colloids and Surfaces B-Biointerfaces* **2008,** *66*, (1), 39-44. 864 40. ASTM Standard E729. Standard guide for conducting acute toxicity tests on test materials with fishes, macroinvertebrates, and amphibian. **2007**. 41. Seitz, F.; Rosenfeldt, R. R.; Schneider, S.; Schulz, R.; Bundschuh, M., Size-, surface-and crystalline structure composition-related effects of titanium dioxide nanoparticles during their aquatic life cycle. *Science of the Total Environment* **2014,** *493*, 891-897. 42. Borgmann, U.; Cheam, V.; Norwood, W. P.; Lechner, J., Toxicity and bioaccumulation of thallium in *Hyalella azteca*, with comparison to other metals and prediction of environmental impact. *Environmental Pollution* **1998,** *99*, (1), 105-114. 43. Rosenfeldt, R. R.; Seitz, F.; Schulz, R.; Bundschuh, M., Heavy metal uptake and toxicity in the presence of titanium dioxide nanoparticles: A factorial approach using *Daphnia magna*. *Environmental Science and Technology* **2014,** *48*, (12), 6965-6972. 44. Loureiro, C.; Castro, B. B.; Pereira, J. L.; Goncalves, F., Performance of standard media in toxicological assessments with *Daphnia magna*: Chelators and ionic composition versus metal toxicity. *Ecotoxicology* **2011,** *20*, (1), 139-148. 45. Namvar, F.; Rahman, H. S.; Mohamad, R.; Baharara, J.; Mahdavi, M.; Amini, E.; 879 Chartrand, M. S.; Yeap, S. K., Cytotoxic effect of magnetic iron oxide nanoparticles synthesized via seaweed aqueous extract. *Int J Nanomedicine* **2014,** *9*, 2479-88. 881 46. Buffle, J.; Wilkinson, K. J.; Stoll, S.; Filella, M.; Zhang, J., A Generalized description of aquatic colloidal interactions: The three-colloidal component-approch. *Environmental Science and Technology* **1998,** *32*, (19), 2887-2899.

Page 41 of 42 Environmental Science: Nano

61. Munro, C. H.; Smith, W. E.; Garner, M.; Clarkson, J.; White, P. C., Characterization 921 of the surface of a citrate-reduced colloid optimized for use as a substrate for surface-
922 enhanced resonance Raman-scattering. *Langmuir* 1995, 11, (10), 3712-3720. enhanced resonance Raman-scattering. *Langmuir* **1995,** *11*, (10), 3712-3720.

62. Akaighe, N.; MacCuspie, R. I.; Navarro, D. A.; Aga, D. S.; Banerjee, S.; Sohn, M.; Sharma, V. K., Humic acid-induced silver nanoparticle formation under environmentally relevant conditions. *Environmental Science and Technology* **2011,** *45*, (9), 3895-3901.

63. Adegboyega, N. F.; Sharma, V. K.; Siskova, K.; Zboril, R.; Sohn, M.; Schultz, B. J.; 927 Banerjee, S., Interactions of aqueous $Ag⁺$ with fulvic acids: Mechanisms of silver nanoparticle formation and investigation of stability. *Environmental Science and Technology* **2013,** *47*, (2), 757-64.

64. Rosenfeldt, R. R.; Seitz, F.; Senn, L.; Schilde, C.; Schulz, R.; Bundschuh, M., Nanosized titanium dioxide reduces copper toxicity - The role of organic material and the crystalline phase. *Environmental Science and Technology* **2015,** *49*, (3), 1815-1822.

65. Tai, J. T.; Lai, C. S.; Ho, H. C.; Yeh, Y. S.; Wang, H. F.; Ho, R. M.; Tsai, D. H., Protein silver nanoparticle interactions to colloidal stability in acidic environments. *Langmuir* **2014,** *30*, (43), 12755-12764.

66. Field, T. B.; Coburn, J.; McCourt, J. L.; McBryde, W. A. E., Composition and stability of some metal citrate and diglycolate complexes in aqueous solution. *Analytica Chimica Acta* **1975,** *74*, (1), 101–106.

67. El Badawy, A. M.; Scheckel, K. G.; Suidan, M.; Tolaymat, T., The impact of stabilization mechanism on the aggregation kinetics of silver nanoparticles. *Science of the Total Environment* **2012,** *429*, 325-331.

942 68. Wang, Y.; Ni, Y. N., New insight into protein-nanomaterial interactions with UV-visible spectroscopy and chemometrics: Human serum albumin and silver nanoparticles. *Analyst* **2014,** *139*, (2), 416-424.

69. Meakin, P., Models for colloidal aggregation. *Annual Review of Physical Chemistry* **1988,** *39*, (1), 237-267.