This is an Accepted Manuscript, which has been through the Royal Society of Chemistry peer review process and has been accepted for publication.

Accepted Manuscripts are published online shortly after acceptance, before technical editing, formatting and proof reading. Using this free service, authors can make their results available to the community, in citable form, before we publish the edited article. We will replace this Accepted Manuscript with the edited and formatted Advance Article as soon as it is available.

You can find more information about Accepted Manuscripts in the Information for Authors.

Please note that technical editing may introduce minor changes to the text and/or graphics, which may alter content. The journal’s standard Terms & Conditions and the Ethical guidelines still apply. In no event shall the Royal Society of Chemistry be held responsible for any errors or omissions in this Accepted Manuscript or any consequences arising from the use of any information it contains.
Effect of crystallinity on photocatalytic performance of $\text{Co}_3\text{O}_4$ water-splitting cocatalyst

Chin Sheng Chua, Davide Ansovini, Coryl Jing Jun Lee, Yin Ting Teng, Lay Ting Ong, Dongzhi Chi, T. S. Andy Hor, Robert Raja, and Yee-Fun Lim

Cocatalysts, when loaded onto a water splitting photocatalyst, accelerate the gas evolution reaction and improve the efficiency of the photocatalyst. In this paper, we report that the efficiency of the photocatalyst is enhanced with an amorphous cobalt oxide cocatalyst. $\text{WO}_3$ film, when loaded with amorphous or nanocrystalline $\text{Co}_3\text{O}_4$, shows an improvement of up to 40% in photocurrent generation and 34% in hydrogen gas evolution. The effect of cocatalyst crystallinity on performance was systematically studied, and we found that the photocurrent deteriorates with the conversion of the cocatalyst to highly crystalline phase at annealing temperature of 500°C. The mechanism for this effect was studied in detail using electrochemical impedance spectroscopy, and the enhancement effect produced by amorphous cocatalyst is attributed to the large density of unsaturated catalytically active sites in the amorphous material.

1. Introduction

Photocatalytic water splitting is an attractive process as it produces energy from a clean process starting from renewable raw materials and stores this energy in the form of hydrogen gas. The process involves (i) absorption of photons and generation of electron-hole pair, (ii) separation and migration of electron-hole pair, and (iii) surface redox reaction via photogenerated electrons and holes. For water splitting, the surface redox reaction is a combination of two half-reactions, hydrogen evolution reaction (HER) and the oxygen evolution reaction (OER). Of the two half-reactions, OER is more complex as it requires multiple interactions and the removal of four protons and electrons for oxygen to evolve. As such, much work had focused on improving the solar-to-oxygen conversion efficiency for photoanode catalysts.

Photoanode materials used for OER are n-type semiconductors whose band bending at the surface drives minority holes to its surface. Among the various n-type semiconductors, tungsten oxide ($\text{WO}_3$) has been widely studied due to its good stability in neutral to acidic solution, non-toxicity, good charge transport properties and high oxidation power of valence band holes (+3.1–3.2 V vs normal hydrogen electrode (NHE)). Its bandgap of 2.6–2.8 eV allows absorption of the blue portion of the visible spectrum. While it has a theoretical solar-to-hydrogen efficiency of ca. 4.5%, such efficiency is rarely attained due to losses such as recombination of charge carriers and kinetic loss. To reduce these losses, the photocatalyst can be loaded with cocatalysts which improve the efficiency of the water splitting process.

When loaded by a proper amount (typically <5%), cocatalysts help to accelerate the water splitting reaction with a photocatalyst. The deposited cocatalyst serves as reaction sites for the water splitting process and catalyses the reaction. They also promote the transportation of charges from the catalyst, and increase charge separation at the interface between cocatalyst and the photocatalytic semiconductor. In addition, the cocatalyst improves the stability of the photoanodes by extracting photogenerated holes from the photoanodes, thus suppressing photocorrosion. For HER, platinum (Pt) is usually considered as the best cocatalyst. A volcano relation had been established between the exchange current for H$_2$ evolution and the bond strength of metal-hydrogen, and Pt sits at the peak of the volcano. In the case of OER, a clear dominant cocatalyst has yet to be established. Several inorganic cocatalysts, such as IrO$_2$, CoO$_x$, $\text{Co}_3\text{O}_4$, NiO$_x$, and RuO$_2$, were found to enhance the photocatalytic reaction.

While it may be expected that highly crystalline cocatalysts would show good performance due to favourable charge transport properties, some of the most effective cocatalysts that have been reported were amorphous materials such as MoS$_2$, CoO$_x$, and Co-Pi. The effect of the crystallinity on the performance of these cocatalysts, however, has not been systematically studied. In this work, we investigated the effect of the crystallinity of $\text{Co}_3\text{O}_4$ cocatalysts on the photocatalytic...
water splitting performance of WO$_3$ film. The cocatalyst and WO$_3$ photocatalyst film were deposited using sol-gel processing. Sol-gel deposition is a low-cost solution-based method, and offers distinct advantages such as large area film deposition and ease of control over the film’s stoichiometry. Here, we will report the photoelectrochemical (PEC) analysis and gas evolution performance of the Co$_2$O$_4$/WO$_3$ films. The superior photocurrent generation capability of amorphous cocatalyst compared to their crystalline counterpart will also be presented, together with a detailed mechanistic study of this effect based on electrochemical impedance spectroscopy (EIS).

2. Experimental

2.1 Synthesis of WO$_3$ sol-gel precursor solution

The deposition of WO$_3$ thin film was carried out by spin-coating WO$_3$ sol-gel solution onto fluorine-doped tin oxide (FTO) coated glass. The WO$_3$ precursor solution was prepared by first adding 0.4 ml of acetylacetone into 5 ml of methanol, after which the solution mixture was slowly added into 0.5 g of WCl$_6$ (Sigma Aldrich) before undergoing further dilution with 5 ml of methanol. 0.25 g of poly(ethylene glycol) (Sigma Aldrich, average molecular weight of 200) was then added to the solution to improve the film quality during spin-coating. The solution was allowed to age under constant stirring for 4 days before use. All of the above steps were carried out inside a nitrogen-filled glovebox.

2.2 Thin film deposition

Prior to the spin-coating process, the substrates were cleaned by sonication in ethanol for 5 minutes followed by oxygen plasma treatment with Trion Sirus reactive ion etcher at 100 W for 2 minutes. The sol-gel solution was pre-filtered with a 0.45 μm PVDF Whatman syringe filter, and then spin-coated onto the substrate at 2000 rpm for 30 seconds. After each spin-coating cycle, the substrates were annealed at 300 °C for 2 minutes to convert the organic layer into oxide. The process was repeated for 20 cycles to obtain a WO$_3$ coated onto the substrate at 2000 rpm for 30 seconds. After each spin-coating cycle, the substrates were annealed at 300 °C for 2 minutes to convert the organic layer into oxide. The process was repeated for 20 cycles to obtain a WO$_3$ film with a final thickness of about 1.4 μm. To obtain crystalline WO$_3$ film, the substrates were subjected to a final annealing step at 500 °C for 1 hour.

Co$_2$O$_4$ was deposited on WO$_3$ through sol-gel spin-coating. Its precursor solution is prepared by mixing 0.05 g of cobalt acetylacetonate into 10 ml of methanol with 0.1 ml of ethanolamine as a stabilizer. The precursor solution is stirred overnight before spin-coating onto the WO$_3$ film using the same spin parameters as that for WO$_3$. The cocatalyst solution was spin-coated for 1 cycle followed by annealing on a hotplate for 15 minutes. For comparison purposes, WO$_3$ samples loaded with NiO, cocatalysts were also prepared; the NiO was deposited from a nickel acetate precursor solution of similar concentration.

2.3 Structural characterization

X-ray diffraction (XRD) spectra of the deposited films were analysed using Bruker D8 general area detector diffraction system (GADDS). Film morphology was characterized using ESM-9000 field-emission scanning electron microscope (FE-SEM). X-ray photoelectron spectroscopy (XPS) was carried out with VG Thermo ESCALab 220i-XL X-ray photoelectron spectrometer using monochromatic Al Kα (1486.6 eV) as the X-ray source. The binding energies were charge corrected using adventitious C 1s peak at 285.0 eV as a reference. UV-Vis absorbance studies were carried out using Shimadzu 3101 UV-VIS-NIR spectrophotometer.

2.4 PEC measurement

Photoelectrochemical (PEC) measurements were carried out in a 3-electrode configuration using Ag/AgCl reference electrode, Pt counter electrode and the cocatalyst/WO$_3$ film coated on FTO glass as the working electrode. A black tape was used to define the active area of 1 cm$^2$ on the coated sample. The electrodes were immersed inside a 0.1 M Na$_2$SO$_4$ aqueous electrolyte solution, with a pH of 5.84 as measured by a Hanna Instruments pH meter. The PEC measurement was carried out using Metrohm Autolab PGSTAT101 potentiostat. The light source used was an Oriel solar simulator using a 150 W Xenon arc lamp fitted with an AM 1.5 filter, with light intensity maintained at 100 mWcm$^{-2}$. Using Metrohm Autolab PGSTAT302N potentiostat, electrochemical impedance spectroscopy (EIS) data was collected with an amplitude setting of 10 mV and frequency varying from 0.1 to 100,000 Hz. The electrolyte is 0.1 M Na$_2$SO$_4$ solution and at a potential of 1.2 V vs Ag/AgCl.

2.5 Gas evolution analysis

Photoelectrocatalytic water splitting gas evolution was characterized in a closed recirculating glass reactor filled with Ar gas. The same 3-electrode configuration and electrolyte solution was used for the gas evolution measurement. The electrodes were connected to DY2100 series potentiostat (Digi-Ivy, Inc.), which was used to supply a constant voltage of 1 V across the reference and working electrode. The samples were illuminated with a 150 W Xenon arc lamp fitted with AM 1.5 filter at a light intensity of 50 mWcm$^{-2}$. The amount of evolved gases was analysed by gas chromatography (Shimadzu, GC-2014 with TCD detector and MS-5A column, Ar carrier).

3. Results and discussion

XRD spectra of the deposited WO$_3$ film on FTO glass and thick Co$_2$O$_4$ film on silicon substrate are shown in Figure 1. The WO$_3$ film shows distinct peaks at 2θ = 24.8°, 34.6°, and 50.3°, which matches well with the data from JCPDS 01-083-0950 (monoclinic WO$_3$ crystal structure). Crystalline Co$_2$O$_4$ film annealed at 500 °C show single crystalline phase with peaks consistent with the corresponding literature data in the JCPDS database (00-043-1003 and 01-078-0429 respectively). Thus,
the XRD data confirmed that the desired oxide materials have been obtained from the sol-gel process. In addition, the deposition of an ultra-thin layer of Co$_3$O$_4$ cocatalyst film on WO$_3$ did not result in any crystallinity change for the WO$_3$ film (Figure S1 in the ESI). Figure 2 shows the evolution of the XRD spectra of Co$_3$O$_4$ film at different annealing temperatures. From the XRD spectra, it can be seen that the Co$_3$O$_4$ film is completely amorphous at 200 °C, while a nano-crystalline phase starts to emerge at 300 and 400 °C. At 500 °C, highly crystalline Co$_3$O$_4$ phase can be observed from the XRD pattern. Using Scherrer equation, the crystallite size of Co$_3$O$_4$ increases from 3.7 nm (at 400 °C) to 7.8 nm (at 500 °C).

The optical absorption properties of WO$_3$ and Co$_3$O$_4$/WO$_3$ film are shown in Figure 3. Figure 3a shows that WO$_3$ film absorbs photons in the UV spectrum with its absorption edge at about 450 nm. With an ultra-thin layer of Co$_3$O$_4$, there is a very slight increase in absorbance at wavelengths up to around 600 nm. This is due to the smaller bandgap of Co$_3$O$_4$, previously reported to be 2.07 eV.\(^{21}\) With the Tauc plot, the band gap of the deposited WO$_3$ film is determined to be 2.6 eV which is similar to reported works in the literature.\(^{22}\)

Morphology of the deposited WO$_3$ and Co$_3$O$_4$/WO$_3$ thin films can be seen from the SEM images shown in Figure 4. The sol-gel deposited WO$_3$ film shows a porous structure with some short interconnecting rods of WO$_3$ particles connecting between different growth regions on the film. With an ultra-thin layer of Co$_3$O$_4$ deposited on top, little change in the film morphology is observed. Cross-sectional SEM image (Figure S2 in the ESI) shows only the WO$_3$ layer (with a thickness of around 1.4 μm), while the Co$_3$O$_4$ layer is unobservable. Further analysis using energy dispersive X-ray (EDX) (Figure S3 in the ESI) could not detect any cobalt ions from the cocatalyst layer, and only tungsten and tin (from the FTO layer) ions showed up in the spectrum.

As XRD, SEM and EDX analysis could not detect the presence of the ultra-thin layer of Co$_3$O$_4$ cocatalyst, further analysis was performed using XPS. Figure 5 shows the XPS data for a Co$_3$O$_4$/WO$_3$ thin film sample with the cocatalyst annealed to 350 °C. The Co 2p spectra consist of two main peaks at 797.1 and 781.2 eV, which corresponds to Co 2p$^{3/2}$ and 2p$^{1/2}$ binding energies respectively and confirms the presence of Co on the surface. Our value for the Co 2p$^{3/2}$ binding energy is slightly higher than the typically reported range of 780.0-780.9 eV.\(^{23,24}\) It is known that the 2 cobalt oxidation states

\[ \alpha = 2.302 \frac{A}{\lambda} \]  
\[ (\alpha E)^{1/2} \propto (E - E_g) \]  

where $\alpha$ is the absorption coefficient, $A$ is the film absorbance, $E$ is the photon energy, $E_g$ is the band gap and the exponential $\gamma$ equals to 0.5 for indirect band gap material. With the Tauc plot, the band gap of the deposited WO$_3$ film is determined to be 2.6 eV which is similar to reported works in the literature.\(^{22}\)
present in Co$_3$O$_4$, namely Co$^{3+}$ and Co$^{2+}$, have binding energies of 780 and 782 eV respectively. Thus, the slightly higher binding energy observed for our sample may be indicative of a larger percentage of Co$^{2+}$ ions. The other two peaks at 803.1 and 787.1 eV can be attributed to its shake up satellite peaks.

To investigate the photocurrent generation capabilities of WO$_3$ and Co$_3$O$_4$/WO$_3$, linear sweep voltammetry was utilized under dark and light condition using Ag/AgCl as the reference electrode. Figure 6 shows the PEC current-voltage curve of bare WO$_3$ and Co$_3$O$_4$/WO$_3$. Under dark condition, all the deposited films show negligible current flowing through the system, as can be observed for WO$_3$ film in the dark. With AM 1.5 illumination, WO$_3$ film shows a measured photocurrent of 0.42 mA/cm$^2$ at 1.2V (vs Ag/AgCl). This is comparable to WO$_3$ films deposited with other synthetic methods but lower than nanostructured films with high surface area. With a layer of cocatalyst deposited, the WO$_3$ film shows an almost 40% increase in photocurrent generation. The results show that the Co$_3$O$_4$ is effective in improving the photoactivity of the WO$_3$ film. The amount of cocatalyst can be controlled by varying the cocatalyst thickness, which is determined by the number of spin-coated layers. A thicker cocatalyst layer, however, have a deteriorative effect as can be seen with 3 layers of Co$_3$O$_4$ film. The decrease in photocurrent is due to better coverage of the 3 layer coating which blocks the active sites in the WO$_3$ film.

Figure 7 presents the change in photocurrent with annealing temperature of the cocatalyst. The photocurrent shows an initial increase with annealing temperature before deteriorating at annealing temperature of more than 400 °C. The deterioration in photocurrent may be attributed to the increasing crystallinity of the cocatalyst film at higher annealing temperatures. In order to verify if this effect is also observable for other cocatalysts, a similar study was performed on WO$_3$ films loaded with NiO. The same trend was observed with the NiO cocatalyst, whereby amorphous or nanocrystalline cocatalysts annealed below 400 °C outperform highly crystalline cocatalysts annealed at higher temperatures (Figures S4-S6 in the ESI).

A systematic mechanistic study of the above-mentioned effects was performed using electrochemical impedance spectroscopy (EIS). Figure 8 shows the EIS data of Co$_3$O$_4$ cocatalyst deposited on WO$_3$ film under light illumination. The EIS Nyquist plot consist of 2 semi-circles, with the high frequency arc (first semicircle) corresponding to the fast charge transport through the WO$_3$ and cocatalyst film ($R_{\text{bulk}}$ and $CPE_{\text{bulk}}$) and the low frequency arc (second semicircle) corresponding to the slower interfacial charge transfer at the film-electrolyte interface ($R_{\text{CT}}$ and $CPE_{\text{CT}}$). Using the model in Figure 8b for equivalent circuit fitting, the values for $R_{\text{bulk}}$, $CPE_{\text{bulk}}$, $R_{\text{CT}}$, and $CPE_{\text{CT}}$ are obtained and shown in Table 1.

At low cocatalyst annealing temperature (< 400 °C), the value of the charge transfer resistance ($R_{\text{CT}}$) is found to be lower for the cocatalyst/WO$_3$ films compared to bare WO$_3$. The
Element (CPE) to achieve a good fitting. Rmodelling the electrochemical cell. All capacitance s are modelled using constant phase capacitance across the bulk semiconductor while RCT and CPECT correspond to the charge transfer interfacial layer between the electrode and the electrolyte.

Table 1. Rbulk, CPEbulk, RCT, CPECT values as obtained from electrochemical impedance spectroscopy simulation fit.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Samples</th>
<th>Cocatalyst annealing temperature (°C)</th>
<th>Rbulk (Ω)</th>
<th>CPEbulk (µF)</th>
<th>RCT (Ω)</th>
<th>CPECT (µF)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>WO3</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>49</td>
<td>1.10</td>
<td>284</td>
<td>55.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Co3O4/WO3</td>
<td>200</td>
<td>73</td>
<td>0.26</td>
<td>148</td>
<td>217</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>300</td>
<td>52</td>
<td>0.28</td>
<td>172</td>
<td>138</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>350</td>
<td>51</td>
<td>0.42</td>
<td>150</td>
<td>130</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>400</td>
<td>43</td>
<td>0.55</td>
<td>139</td>
<td>126</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>500</td>
<td>351</td>
<td>19.10</td>
<td>303</td>
<td>5.15</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

In comparison, the EIS data indicates significant increases in both RCT and Rbulk, and a huge decrease in CPECT value for highly crystalline cocatalysts annealed at 500 °C, corresponding to a significant decrease in photocurrent (Figure 7). The drop in CPECT is especially significant, from 126 µF to 5.15 µF when comparing cocatalysts annealed at 400 °C and 500 °C, respectively. The lower CPECT value shows that the highly crystalline cocatalyst has a lower density of lesser surface state while the higher RCT indicates poorer charge transfer efficiency at the electrode/electrolyte interface. This corroborates with our earlier claim that highly crystalline cocatalysts exhibit lower density of unsaturated surface sites that are catalytically active. In addition to the decrease in surface states, the increase crystallite size for Co3O4, as calculated using Scherrer’s equation, also contributes to the poorer charge transfer properties due to a decrease in surface area.

On the other hand, the higher Rbulk indicates inefficient charge transfer between the highly crystalline cocatalyst and WO3 film. Indeed, the bulk resistance increases dramatically from 43 Ω to 351 Ω when comparing cocatalysts annealed at 400 °C and 500 °C. In order to understand this, we examined the band alignment between WO3 and the cocatalyst. From Figure 9, which shows the relative conduction and valance
band edge positions of CoO$_3$ and WO$_3$ as obtained from literature.\textsuperscript{21,22} It can be seen that the CoO$_3$ cocatalyst forms unfavourable Type I heterojunction with WO$_3$ film. This encourages recombination of charge carriers upon charge transfer and can lead to high bulk resistance. It should be noted, however, that this is applicable only to highly crystalline materials that exhibit band transport and have well-defined energy bands. In contrast, charge transport in disordered amorphous semiconductors or nanocrystalline materials are typically described by a variable-range hopping model,\textsuperscript{34} and thus are less affected by the effect of the unfavourable band alignment. We believe this is likely the reason for the increase in bulk resistance upon improvement in cocatalyst crystallinity. Thus, due to poorer charge transfer efficiency at the electrode/electrolyte interface and unfavourable energy band alignment of the cocatalysts with WO$_3$, the formation of crystalline cocatalyst film has a detrimental effect to the generated photocurrent.

Using amorphous CoO$_3$ annealed at 350 °C as the cocatalyst film, the H$_2$ and O$_2$ gas evolution rate from the water splitting process was measured. Figure 10 shows the H$_2$ and O$_2$ gas evolution of WO$_3$ and CoO$_3$/WO$_3$ film as a function of time. A linear gas evolution curve is observed which indicates that photocorrosion of the CoO$_3$/WO$_3$ did not take place. From the gradient of the gas evolution curve, bare WO$_3$ film shows a H$_2$ evolution rate of 3.2 μmol/h and an O$_2$ evolution rate of 1.5 μmol/h. This corresponds to a H$_2$:O$_2$ ratio 2.13 which is close to the stoichiometry ratio of water splitting. On the other hand, CoO$_3$/WO$_3$ film has a higher gas evolution rate with its H$_2$ evolution rate at 34% higher than that of WO$_3$ film. The H$_2$ and O$_2$ evolution rate of CoO$_3$/WO$_3$ film is 4.3 μmol/h and 1.9 μmol/h respectively. From the amount of gas evolved and the measured photocurrent, the Faradaic efficiency of the reaction is calculated using Equation 3:\textsuperscript{35, 36}

\[
\text{Faradaic efficiency} = \frac{n_{\text{H}_2}}{Q/zF}
\] (3)

where $n_{\text{H}_2}$ is the number of moles of hydrogen gas obtained, F is Faraday’s constant (96,485 C/mol), Q is the total amount of charge passed through the cell, and z is the number of electrons transferred per hydrogen molecule (which is equal to 2). The total number of moles of hydrogen obtained from a 4 hour illumination period is 17.3 μmol at an average photocurrent of 0.256 mA. Thus, $n_{\text{H}_2} = 1.73 \times 10^{-3}$ mol and Q = 0.256 mA × 4 × 3600 s = 3.69 C. Plugging the above values into the equation, we obtained a high Faradaic efficiency of 90.0% for CoO$_3$/WO$_3$ film. This is a typical value for water splitting with PEC cell, and the less than unity efficiency can be explained by the back reaction occurring at the platinum counter electrode.\textsuperscript{37} The gas evolution analysis confirms that the higher photocurrent led to higher gas evolution.

**Conclusions**

CoO$_3$ cocatalyst enhances the photocatalytic property of WO$_3$ at low annealing temperatures before the onset of crystallinity. The highest enhancement attained shows an increase of 40% in PEC property and 34% in H$_2$ gas evolution. The superior performance of CoO$_3$ is attributed to its excellent charge transfer property, from the photocatalyst to the electrolyte, which is indicative of high catalytic activity. The enhancement indicates the beneficial effects of an amorphous cocatalyst in improving the efficiency of photocatalytic water splitting process. At higher annealing temperatures, we conclude based on EIS data that the reduction of unsaturated active surface sites as well as mismatch of band structure between crystalline cocatalyst and WO$_3$ led to a deterioration of the generated photocurrent. These results help to explain the superior catalytic performance of amorphous cocatalyst, as well as elucidate the role played by cocatalysts in the photocatalytic water splitting process.

**Acknowledgements**

This work is supported by the Institute of Materials Research and Engineering (IMRE), A*STAR, through funding from assured project IMRE/13-1C0102 and facilitated by a VC scholarship to DA from the University of Southampton. We would like to acknowledge technical support from the nanofabrication, processing and characterization facility (SnFPC) at IMRE.

**Notes and references**


---

Figure 10 Hydrogen evolution under light illumination of (a) CoO$_3$/WO$_3$ and (b) WO$_3$. Oxygen evolution under light illumination of (c) CoO$_3$/WO$_3$ and (d) WO$_3$. 

---

Journal Name