This is an Accepted Manuscript, which has been through the Royal Society of Chemistry peer review process and has been accepted for publication.

Accepted Manuscripts are published online shortly after acceptance, before technical editing, formatting and proof reading. Using this free service, authors can make their results available to the community, in citable form, before we publish the edited article. We will replace this Accepted Manuscript with the edited and formatted Advance Article as soon as it is available.

You can find more information about Accepted Manuscripts in the Information for Authors.

Please note that technical editing may introduce minor changes to the text and/or graphics, which may alter content. The journal’s standard Terms & Conditions and the Ethical guidelines still apply. In no event shall the Royal Society of Chemistry be held responsible for any errors or omissions in this Accepted Manuscript or any consequences arising from the use of any information it contains.
FeCo$_2$O$_4$ submicron-tube arrays grown on Ni foam as high-rate-capability and cycling-stability electrodes allowing superior energy and power densities with symmetric supercapacitors†

Baogang Zhu,† Shaochun Tang,‡ Sascha Vongehr, Hao Xie, Jian Zhu and Xiangkang Meng*

Template-free chemical growth on Ni foam and thermal treatment results in homogeneous FeCo$_2$O$_4$ submicron-tube arrays which serve as binder-free electrodes with high capacitance, rate-capability and cycling-stability owing to FeCo$_2$O$_4$ conductivity, high porosity, and strong bonding between tubes and Ni foam, all allowing even symmetric devices to have superior energy density.

With rapidly increasing demand for electric energy storage, supercapacitors (SCs) have attracted extensive research interest due to their fast recharge capability, high power density and long cycle life. Transition metal (Ni, Co, Mn, etc.) oxides are widely explored as active materials for SCs based on reversible redox reactions because of their low cost, low toxicity, and high theoretical capacitances (> 1000 F/g). However, their conductivity is typically too low to support fast electron transport, which decreases the rate capability. Mixed transition metal oxides such as MCo$_2$O$_4$ (M = Ni$^4$, Cu$^2$ and Zn$^6$) perform well owing to their multiple oxidation states and much higher electrical conductivity. NiCo$_2$O$_4$ exhibits a by 2 orders of magnitude higher electric conductivity than nickel or cobalt oxides. Since Co oxides$^4$ and Fe oxides$^5$ both provide excellent electrochemical performance, Fe-Co oxide (FeCo$_2$O$_4$) is expected to be an excellent electrode material that offers richer redox reactions than corresponding single components, in much the same way as NiCo$_2$O$_4$ compared with their single component oxides.$^4$ So far, research on FeCo$_2$O$_4$ is limited,$^9$ but the results on its energy storage properties suggest that its potential in SCs should be further explored.

Electrodes with porous microstructures enhance not only power density but also rate capability, because the porosity increases the electrode/electrolyte contact interface and electrolyte penetration.$^{11-13}$ Therefore, developing novel porous architectures is an effective route to achieve high electrochemical performance. Much current research focuses on growing pseudocapacitive materials on three-dimensional conducting backbones such as Ni foam,$^{14,15}$ which increases not only electrical conductivity but also mechanical stability. Various synthetic methods such as sacrificial template-accelerated hydrolysis,$^{16}$ in-situ sacrificial template,$^{17}$ and anion-exchange$^{18}$ have been developed to grow tubular nanostructures which are promising because electrochemical reactions may also occur on inner surfaces. These are all focused on nanosized tubes, and the methods are complicated. Submicron/micron-sized porous materials were demonstrated to be excellent electrode materials for SCs due to their sizes for desirable mechanical properties and high cycling stability.$^{19}$

In this communication, novel FeCo$_2$O$_4$ submicron-tube arrays were grown on Ni foam via a template-free chemical deposition followed by thermal treatment. The tubes are separated from each other and distribute homogeneously on the foam, forming a highly porous structure. Such arrays possess the following advantages: (1) they can be used directly as electrodes, which avoids polymer binder additives; (2) the high porosity leads to excellent specific areal capacitances; (3) the high conductivity of FeCo$_2$O$_4$ and a good connection between the tubes and the Ni endow the arrays with good electric conductivity and thus good rate capability; (4) and the direct growth results in excellent long-term cycling stability. All-solid-state symmetric supercapacitors were assembled from the novel electrodes and resulted in excellent power and current densities superior to other symmetric devices with similar electrodes. The results instead fit together among asymmetric supercapacitors based on similar mixed oxides.

The preparation procedures are described in detail in the ESI.$^†$ SEM and TEM images of the products before thermal treatment (ESI,$^†$ Fig. S1a-b) show that hollow tubes are already obtained with 310 ± 20 nm thick walls. TEM (ESI,$^†$ Fig. S1c) and HRTEM images (ESI,$^†$ Fig. S1d) indicate the single crystalline nature of an individual tube. During the chemical deposition,
fast nucleation and initial growth result in polyhedral sub-
micron hollow particles on Ni, and subsequent anisotropic
growth along preferred directions leads to single-crystalline
submicron tubes. A transformation to resulting FeCo$_2$O$_4$ hollow particles on Ni, and subsequent aniso-
tropic fast nucleation and initial growth result in polyhe-
dral sub-

**Fig. 1** (a) low- and (b) high-magnification SEM images of typical FeCo$_2$O$_4$ tubes on Ni foam, (c) SEM image showing one tip of a tube, (d) a broken tube, and (e) XRD pattern of the sample.

SEM images of the products obtained with different reactants’ concentrations (defined as C$_{Fe^{3+}}$, the concentrations of Co$^{3+}$ and oxalic acid changed correspondingly) are shown in ESI,† Fig. S3. At a low C$_{Fe^{3+}}$ of 1.3 mM, many intersecting thin flakes with ~200 nm diameters cover the Ni foam’s ligaments (ESI, † Fig. S3a). Increasing the C$_{Fe^{3+}}$ to 5 mM, many aggregations with irregular shapes form (ESI, † Fig. S3b). Only at around 10 mM (Fig. 1) and 12.5 mM (ESI,† Fig. S3c) are the tubular nanostructures obtained. At and beyond 17.5 mM, the porosity on the micron scale is absent (ESI, † Fig. S3d). According to the TAG results (ESI, † Fig. S4), the loadings of FeCo$_2$O$_4$ on Ni foams are 0.4, 1.5, 2.6 and 5.9 mg/cm$^2$ when the C$_{Fe^{3+}}$ values are 5, 10, 12.5, and 17.5 mM, respectively.

The FeCo$_2$O$_4$-tube arrays covered Ni foams can be directly used as electrodes. Fig. 3a shows the CV curves of the electrodes obtained with different C$_{Fe^{3+}}$ at a scan rate of 40 mV/s. The curves’ shapes and redox peaks indicate a pseudocapacitive nature of the charging reactions. The redox current peaks are attributed to the reversible reaction between Co$^{3+}$/Co$^{2+}$ and Fe$^{3+}$/Fe$^{2+}$. The area integrated under the curves changes with the concentration, the largest specific capacitance being at 10 mM. The potential difference between the oxidation peak and the reduction peak is a measure of the irreversibility in the redox reaction. Smaller values correspond to better reversibility.$^{20}$ The potential difference is lowest, namely only about 105 mV, at C$_{Fe^{3+}}$ = 10 mM. The CD curves at a current density of 2 mA/cm$^2$ (Fig. 3b) show that the best galvanostatic charge-discharge performance is also obtained at 10 mM (700 seconds), indicating maximum specific capacitance. The corresponding specific areal capacitances (C$_{area}$) of the electrodes at different current densities are shown in Fig. 3c. They are again optimal at C$_{Fe^{3+}}$ = 10 mM. The optimum being at 10 mA for all these electrochemical measurements coincides with the homogeneous and highly porous structure characteristics (see the SEM images in ESI,† Fig. S3).

Nyquist plots of three electrodes obtained with low, optimal, and high C$_{Fe^{3+}}$ are shown in Fig. 3d. The equivalent circuit (inset) has a bulk solution resistance $R_s$ charge-transfer resistance $R_t$, and the Warburg impedance (W). A larger electroactive surface area indicates a lower charge-transfer resistance. $R_t$ is related to the conductivity of the electrolyte and internal resistance of the electrode. The electrode obtained with C$_{Fe^{3+}}$ = 10 mM has the lowest $R_t$ = 0.31 Ω and $R_s$ = 1.44 Ω. These values are close to those for the widely
investigated highly conductive NiCo$_2$O$_4$ indicating that FeCo$_2$O$_4$ is also much enhanced in electric conductivity over the corresponding single metal oxides, much like NiCo$_2$O$_4$. The lowest values of $R_a$ and $R_i$ at the optimized point are consistent with that of specific capacitances. These low values are mainly due to the highly porous structure providing large electroactive surface area, which facilitates ion insertion/extraction during electrochemical reactions. The direct connection between tubes and Ni foam decreases the contact resistance.

Fig. 4a shows CV curves of the optimal electrode at various scan rates. The area inside the curves increases with the scan rate. In CD curves (Fig. 4b), triangular symmetry and near linear slopes reveal excellent electrochemical performance of the optimal electrode. After the maximum, a small but steep potential drop is attributed to the internal resistance of the electrode and ionic resistance of electrolyte. A small drop indicates a low resistance consistent with the EIS results. Fig. 4c illustrates the change of the areal capacitance $C_{area}$ with current density, which is calculated from the discharge curves. The values are 1.88, 1.78, 1.64, 1.56, 1.46 and 1.38 F/cm$^2$ at 2, 4, 10, 20, 40 and 100 mA/cm$^2$. Note that they are calculated from selected, linear voltage drop ranges $\Delta V$ and corresponding $\Delta t$ (details in the ESI†). The specific gravimetric capacitances ($C_g$) are 1254, 1186, 1094, 1040, 974, 920 F/g, respectively. The optimized specific capacitances of the FeCo$_2$O$_4$-tube electrode are not only higher than reported values for the corresponding single metal iron or cobalt oxides, but also even higher than other mixed metals oxide nanostructures such as MnCo$_2$O$_4$ nanoparticles, CuCo$_2$O$_4$ particles, ZnCo$_2$O$_4$ nanotubes, NiCo$_2$O$_4$ with different morphologies (ESI, Table S1). The high $C_g$ is mainly attributed to that the electrolyte can diffuse into the whole porous skeleton of electrode, leading to that all the active material participates in electrochemical reactions. The areal capacitance is still at 1.38 F/cm$^2$ even at a high current density of 100 mA/cm$^2$, a 74% capacity retention is much higher than 52% (from 1 to 20 A/g) for NiCo$_2$O$_4$ nanosheets, and 26% (from 1 to 50 A/g) for CuCo$_2$O$_4$ particles. The high rate capability is mainly attributed to the homogeneous distribution of tubes and high porosity of the arrays. The cycling life was evaluated by galvanostatic CD measurements. 91% of the initial areal capacitance remained after 5000 cycles at a current density of 10 mA/cm$^2$ (Fig. 4d), which indicates a superior cycling stability over the above-mentioned MCo$_2$O$_4$ (M = Ni, Zn and Mn) electrodes. The arrays’ porous structure is unchanged after 5000 cycles (see the inset), confirming a high mechanical stability. The high cycling stability is mainly attributed to the strong bonding between tubes and Ni foam, which is demonstrated by that the same morphology and CV shapes of typical FeCo$_2$O$_4$ tube arrays on Ni foam are unchanged after ultrasound (see ESI, Fig. S5).

An all-solid-state symmetric supercapacitor was assembled by using the FeCo$_2$O$_4$/Ni foam as electrodes, and PVA/KOH as separator and electrolyte. Fig. 5a shows CV curves of the device between 0 and 1.0 V at various scan rates. The integrated areas increase with the scan rate from 10 mV/s to 100 mV/s. The non-rectangular shape and weak peak indicate a combination of both, pseudocapacitive and electrical double-layer capacitor behaviors. The discharge curves for different current densities are shown in Fig. 5b. The device exhibits high areal capacitances as calculated from the discharge curves: 0.67, 0.59, 0.46, 0.39, and 0.28 F/cm$^2$ at discharge currents of 2, 3, 5, 8, and 10 mA/cm$^2$, respectively.

The Ragone plot is shown in Fig. 5c. An energy density of 30.9 Wh/kg is achieved at a power density of 1551 W/kg, and still remains 13.1 Wh/kg at 5240 W/kg (black curve). The specific energy and power densities are superior to those of symmetric supercapacitors with similar electrodes such as...
NiCo$_2$O$_4$/polypyrrole (7.5 Wh/kg at 500 W/kg)\(^{27}\) and NiCo$_2$O$_4$ (8.47 Wh/kg at 1 A/g)\(^{28}\). Even the results instead fit together with asymmetric supercapacitor devices based on similar mixed oxides, although asymmetric devices generally perform better than symmetric ones. We compared to asymmetric devices (Fig. 5c) employing activated carbon (AC) and reduced graphene oxide (RGO) as the other electrode, including FeCo$_2$O$_4$/AC (14 Wh/kg at 3780 W/kg),\(^{29}\) NiCoSC NSAs/AC (26.74 Wh/kg at 1414.8 W/kg),\(^{30}\) NiCo$_2$O$_4$/RGO (23.9 Wh/kg at 650 W/kg),\(^{31}\) Ni-Co oxides/AC (34.9 Wh/kg at 875 W/kg),\(^{32}\) and ZnCo$_2$O$_4$/AC (16.63 Wh/kg at 2561 W/kg).\(^{33}\) Galvanostatic CD testing at 4 mA/cm\(^2\) shows that 94% of the initial capacitance remained after 2000 cycles (Fig. 5d), indicating that the FeCo$_2$O$_4$/Ni foam devices have excellent long-term electrochemical stability. The inset shows the last ten periods, revealing a very regular cycling process.

In conclusion, novel FeCo$_2$O$_4$ submicron-tube arrays on Ni foams were prepared by a simple template-free chemical growth followed by thermal treatment. The dependence of the microstructures on reactant concentration was investigated and the electrochemical performance thus optimized at $C_{\text{ele}} = 10 \text{ mF}$, the high porosity, good electric conductivity and strong bonding between the directly grown FeCo$_2$O$_4$ and the Ni foam lead to outstanding electrochemical performance with a high specific areal capacitance, excellent rate capability (74% retention at 100 mA/cm$^2$) and excellent cycling stability (91% after 5000 cycles). The assembly of a simple symmetric capacitor led immediately to energy/power densities that surpass other symmetric devices. This obviously demands further research into asymmetric devices with our novel electrodes, which may lead to even better supercapacitors.

**Notes and references**