This is an Accepted Manuscript, which has been through the Royal Society of Chemistry peer review process and has been accepted for publication.

Accepted Manuscripts are published online shortly after acceptance, before technical editing, formatting and proof reading. Using this free service, authors can make their results available to the community, in citable form, before we publish the edited article. We will replace this Accepted Manuscript with the edited and formatted Advance Article as soon as it is available.

You can find more information about Accepted Manuscripts in the Information for Authors.

Please note that technical editing may introduce minor changes to the text and/or graphics, which may alter content. The journal’s standard Terms & Conditions and the Ethical guidelines still apply. In no event shall the Royal Society of Chemistry be held responsible for any errors or omissions in this Accepted Manuscript or any consequences arising from the use of any information it contains.
The B\textsubscript{32} cluster has the most stable bowl structure with a remarkable heptagonal hole

Truong Ba Tai* and Minh Tho Nguyen*

Boron clusters continue to attract great interest in part due to the conundrum of their structural characteristics.\textsuperscript{1,5} While the growth mechanism and bonding motif of atomic clusters of most elements are simple, the characteristics of boron clusters are unpredictably complex and remain a great challenge for both theory and experiment. Small boron clusters B\textsubscript{n} with n ≤ 19 were found to have quasi-planar and planar structures containing triangular B\textsubscript{3} units.\textsuperscript{6,7} A few larger clusters B\textsubscript{2n} such as B\textsubscript{20}, B\textsubscript{22}, B\textsubscript{24} and B\textsubscript{32} were reported to exhibit tubular forms in which two n-membered rings are connected together in the antiprism bonding motif.\textsuperscript{8-11} This bonding motif was expected to be presented in larger clusters since similar structural characteristics were observed for cationic boron clusters B\textsubscript{9}\textsuperscript{+} with n = 16-25.\textsuperscript{12} On the other hand, boron bulk materials such as boron nanosheets, all-boron fullerenes are formed on the basis of triangular B\textsubscript{3} units and contain either pentagonal or hexagonal holes.\textsuperscript{13-15} The presence of pentagonal and hexagonal holes in these materials was very interesting, but not observed in small sized clusters. Recent findings are useful to provide us with more insight into such a problem.

Based on theoretical studies carried out by quantum chemical calculations, we found that the B\textsubscript{30} cluster is an aromatic bowl structure containing one central pentagonal hole.\textsuperscript{16} This species is proposed as a stable structural unit that eventually leads to the stable buckyballs B\textsubscript{40} and B\textsubscript{42}. Wang and coworkers\textsuperscript{17} recently reported a bowl B\textsubscript{36} containing one central hexagonal hole. The presence of a six-membered hole in B\textsubscript{36} gave more evidence about the existence of boron nanosheets theoretically proposed earlier.\textsuperscript{18} The most recent explorations pointed out that the B\textsubscript{38} and B\textsubscript{40} clusters are intriguing all-boron fullerenes. The B\textsubscript{38} can be considered as a transition size between two-dimensional (2D) and three-dimensional (3D) boron clusters since there is competition in energy between the fullerene and a quasi-planar structure containing two hexagonal rings.\textsuperscript{18,19} More interestingly, while the fullerene B\textsubscript{38} contains four hexagonal holes, the B\textsubscript{40} contains two hexagonal holes and four heptagonal holes.\textsuperscript{20,21} A question thus emerges as to whether a heptagonal hole cluster could be stable. Additionally, since both B\textsubscript{30} and B\textsubscript{36} are bowled structures, is the tubular form a real global minimum of B\textsubscript{32}? In the present work, we set out to tackle these basic problems of boron clusters.

We performed the search for the global minima of the cluster B\textsubscript{32} in both neutral and anionic states using DFT and MO computational methods. We interestingly found that the neutral B\textsubscript{32} is actually a bowl structure containing one heptagonal hole (Figure 1), rather than a double-ring structure as previously reported.\textsuperscript{11} Moreover, this bowl B\textsubscript{32} has an aromatic character. These findings not only end the long controversy over structural characteristics of the B\textsubscript{32}, but also play a key role to explain the presence of heptagonal holes in the fullerene B\textsubscript{40}. Importantly, the existence of a series of boron clusters containing 5-, 6- and 7-membered holes suggests a new family of boron clusters containing holes that are similar to the family of [n]-circulenes of hydrocarbons.

We performed an unbiased search for possible B\textsubscript{32} structures by using a stochastic search method that was recently implemented by us.\textsuperscript{22} The local minima with relative energies of 0.0-5.0 eV were further optimized using several density functionals including the TPSSh, PBE and PBE0 functionals, with the 6-311+G(d) basis set. Our calculations pointed out that the basis set 6-311+G(d) provides realistic computed results which is comparable to those obtained at the larger basis set.
def2-TZVP (Table S3, supplementary information). Finally, the calculations of single-point electronic energies for four lowest-lying isomers of the $B_3$ cluster were performed using the coupled-cluster theory CCSD(T)/6-31G(d) and CCSD(T)/6-311G(d) levels at the TPSSH/6-311+G(d) optimized geometries. Due to the limit of our computer resources, the anionic species $B_{32}$ are calculated using the UCCSD(T)/6-31G(d) method. Our benchmark on the $B_8$ clusters showed that this basis set can provide realistic relative energies for boron clusters that are comparable to those derived using the larger basis sets, including 6-311G(d), 6-311+G(d) and aug-cc-pVTZ (Table S4, supplementary information).

![Figure 1](https://example.com/figure1.png)

**Figure 1** Shapes and relatives energy of a) neutral $B_{32}$ and b) anionic $B_{32}$ clusters. The energy values in eV are calculated using CCSD(T)/6-31G(d) and CCSD(T)/6-311G(d) (in parentheses). The values in curly bracket are computed using the PBE0, PBE and TPSSH functionals, respectively.

Our computed DFT results show that the tubular form $32n.4$ ($C_{16}$; $^1A$) was the most stable isomer but it is only 0.08 eV more stable than $32n.1$ (PBE0/6-311+G(d), Figure 1a). However, at CCSD(T) levels, the isomer $32n.1$ ($C_{16}$; $^1A'$) containing one heptagonal ring is now found to be the most stable structure and is about 0.17 eV more stable than $32n.4$. Two quasi-planar structures $32n.2$ ($C_1; ^1A$) and $32n.3$ ($C_1; ^1A$) are also located on the energy landscape of $B_{32}$ but are 0.31 and 0.34 eV higher in energy as compared to the global minimum $32n.1$. These results are quite remarkable since stable 2D boron clusters containing seven-membered ring have never been observed before. It is worthy to note that the quasi-planar 2D structures without defect holes are found for small boron clusters $B_n$ with $n = 2$-19. While the tubular double-ring form tends to be favoured for $B_{32}$-$B_{34}$, as stated above, the bowl structures containing pentagonal and hexagonal were found for the clusters $B_{30}$ and $B_{36}$. The present results emphasize that the hole defect structures seem to be a common bonding motif for $B_n$ with $n = 30$-$36$, since both $B_{38}$ and $B_{39}$ are 3D fullerenes.

Similar observations were found for the anionic $B_{32}^-$ cluster. At the TPSSH/6-311+G(d) level, the isomer $32a.4$ ($C_{8y}$; $^2A'$) is the lowest isomer. The energy ordering of isomers is reversed when higher accuracy computational methods were used. At the CCSD(T)/6-31G(d) level, $32a.1$ ($C_{18}$; $^2A'$) which is the anionic form of $32n.2$, is the most stable isomer (Figure 1b). The heptagonal hole defect structure $32a.2$ ($C_{18}$; $^2A''$) is also located as a stable isomer and is only ~0.07 eV less stable than the first.

![Figure 2](https://example.com/figure2.png)

**Figure 2** Photoelectron spectrum of $32a.1$ and $32a.2$ simulated by using TD-TPSSH/6-311+G(d) method

In order to verify the reality of computational methods used, the T1 diagnostic values are calculated using CCSD(T) methods. The values given in Table S5, supplementary information showed that the T1 diagnostic values of anionic species $B_{32}^-$ are in range of $0.023 \pm 0.035$, while those of neutral species $B_{32}$ vary in range of $0.017 \pm 0.029$. These values are comparable to the values of 0.04 for opened shell systems and 0.02 for close shell systems where the electronic structure of system has single-referential nature. Consequently, the computational methods used in this report can provide realistic computed results for the boron clusters $B_{32}$.

The vertical detachment energies (VDEs) of the lowest-lying isomers $32a.1$ and $32a.2$ were calculated using time-dependent TD-DFT method. The calculated values are given in Table S1 and S2 of the Supplementary information, while the simulated photoelectron spectra are shown in Figure 2. The adiabatic (ADE) and vertical (VDE) detachment energies of $32a.1$ and $32a.2$ equal to 3.6/3.8 and 3.1/3.2 eV, respectively. As shown in Figure 2, there are overlaps between peaks of $32a.1$ and $32a.2$ in the range of 4.3 to 5.2 eV. These characteristics are similar to those of anionic boron clusters previous reported where many degenerate in energy isomers are present in their experimental PES spectra. This indicates that both isomers $32a.1$ and $32a.2$ co-exist as stable isomers of the
of the neutral $32n.1$. Consequently, the anion $32a.2$ will be antiaromatic species because its π-electrons fulfill only one of two degenerate 2δ-MOs with the electronic configuration $1\sigma^21\pi^41\delta^22\sigma^11\phi^62\pi^22\delta^1$.

NICS calculations agree well with the above discussion. The NICS values were calculated at the centre of heptagonal hole of $32n.1$ and $32a.2$. The ghost atoms were placed at positions of 0, 1, 2, and 3 Å along z-axis that is normal to the plane containing the heptagonal hole. The NICS values of $32n.1$ are highly negative (NICS$_{zz}$(0) = -9.4, NICS$_{zz}$(1) = -37.5, NICS$_{zz}$(2) = -50.7 and NICS$_{zz}$(3) = -43.6), while the NICS values of $32a.1$ are highly positive (NICS$_{zz}$(0) = +47.6, NICS$_{zz}$(1) = +40.4, NICS$_{zz}$(2) = +13.2 and NICS$_{zz}$(3) = +2.0). Thus the $32n.1$ exhibits a pronounced aromatic character, and the $32a.2$ is anti-aromatic. These aromatic features can be one of main reasons that lead to a high thermodynamic stability of $32n.1$.

The existence of bowl structures containing pentagonal, hexagonal and heptagonal holes is intriguing in boron chemistry. Recently, a breakthrough was marked when the the existence of all-boron fullerene $B_{40}$ containing 4 heptagonal holes and 2 hexagonal holes at both neutral and anionic states$^{21}$ was demonstrated. To gain more insights into these structural characteristics, we examined further on the smaller species I-III displayed in Figure 4. All structures considered were optimized at the TPSSH/6-311+G(d) level and their harmonic vibrational frequencies and average binding energies ($BE$) were calculated at the same level. Although being less stable than the corresponding global minima, all structures I-III are located as local minima without imaginary frequency. The binding energies are consistently increased from I to III as size of boron clusters increased. Stabilizing I, II and III by surrounding B-atoms results in larger clusters $B_{30}$, $B_{36}$ and $B_{32}$, respectively. This growth motif can be expected at other sizes in series of intermediate-sized boron clusters $B_n$.

More interestingly, our calculations show that the III-A containing a heptagonal hole is also located on the energy landscape of cluster $B_{36}$ and even more stable than II.

Shapes of π molecular orbitals (MOs) of the global minimum reveal that the bowl $32n.1$ contains 20 valence π-electrons that fully occupy 10 π-orbitals (HOMO, HOMO-2, HOMO-3, HOMO-4, HOMO-7, HOMO-11, HOMO-12, HOMO-21, HOMO-23 and HOMO-25) in ascending order of $1\sigma^21\pi^41\delta^22\sigma^11\phi^62\pi^22\delta^1$ (Figure 3). Accordingly, $32n.1$ exhibits a disk-aromatic features similar to the MO configuration of $B_{40}$. In the anionic state, the excess electron will occupy the 2δ-LUMO

Figure 3 Shapes of π-molecular orbitals of the neutral $32n.1$

Shapes of π molecular orbitals (MOs) of the global minimum reveal that the bowl $32n.1$ contains 20 valence π-electrons that fully occupy 10 π-orbitals (HOMO, HOMO-2, HOMO-3, HOMO-4, HOMO-7, HOMO-11, HOMO-12, HOMO-21, HOMO-23 and HOMO-25) in ascending order of $1\sigma^21\pi^41\delta^22\sigma^11\phi^62\pi^22\delta^1$ (Figure 3). Accordingly, $32n.1$ exhibits a disk-aromatic feature similar to the MO configuration of $B_{40}$. In the anionic state, the excess electron will occupy the 2δ-LUMO

$$E = \frac{n^2(a_{mn})^2}{2\mu R^2} \quad \text{with: } n = 1,2,3, \ldots m = 0, \pm 1, \pm 2, \pm 3 \quad (1)$$

where $a_{mn}$ quantities are dimensionless, $n$ is a radial quantum number that counts the zeroes, and $m$ is the rotational quantum numbers are usually denoted by Greek letters as $m = \sigma, \pi, \delta, \phi, \gamma$... States with non-zero values for $m$ will be twofold degenerate. The lowest eigenstates in ascending order are $1\sigma, 1\pi, 1\delta, 2\sigma$ etc (more detail about the model can be seen at ref. 16 and 24 and Supplementary Information). We consider that the systems containing the number of 2, 6, 10, 12, 16... electrons will exhibit a disk-aromaticity. Oppositely, the systems containing number of 4, 8, 14, 18... electrons will be disk-antiaromatic.

Figure 4 Shapes of small units containing pentagonal I, hexagonal II and II-A, and heptagonal holes III and III-A, and the fullerenes $B_{36}$ and $B_{40}$.
Oppositely, the II-A is unstable and its geometry is distorted to another form after geometry optimization. These observations indicate that the fullerene B_{56} is formed by connecting two units III-A together to the motif B_{40}A. The growth motif B_{40}B in which two unit II-A are connected each other is not preferred because of the inherent instability of II-A. This gives the reason for why the fullerene B_{56} is much less stable than the corresponding bowl form.\textsuperscript{17,18}

Conclusions
In conclusion, we performed a theoretical investigation of structural and aromatic characteristics of the B_{32} clusters in both neutral and anionic states. We found that the neutral B_{32} exhibits a bowl and aromatic structure 32n.1 containing one heptagonal hole, while in the anionic state both isomers 32a.1 and 32a.2 are almost degenerate in energy. These findings not only give more insight into the structural feature of intermediate-sized boron clusters, but also a key result to explain the presence of heptagonal holes in the fullerene B_{56}. In addition, the existence of a series of boron clusters containing 5-, 6- and 7-membered holes foreshadows a new family of boron clusters containing holes that are similar to family of [n]-circulenes of hydrocarbons. We would hope that relevant experimental studies can be performed in a near future on the intriguing B_{32} clusters.

Notes and references
\footnotesize
18 J. Lu, Y. Wang, L. Zhu and Y. Ma, Nanoscale, 2014, 6, 11692

This journal is © The Royal Society of Chemistry 2012