

Cite this: *RSC Sustainability*, 2023, 1, 1908

# Renewably powered electrochemical CO<sub>2</sub> reduction toward a sustainable carbon economy

Zhenyu Sun\*

DOI: 10.1039/d3su90049e

rsc.li/rscsus

The scale of global energy consumption and manufacturing demands continues to increase, leading to dangerous emission and accumulation of CO<sub>2</sub> from the prevalent use of fossil fuels. The average atmospheric CO<sub>2</sub> concentration in 2022 was 417.2 parts per million (ppm) and is forecast to be 419.2 for 2023. This will bring about increasingly severe climate change and catastrophic effects for human society in unprecedented and in some cases, irreversible, ways. Note that the last time CO<sub>2</sub> levels exceeded 400.0 ppm was four million years ago, with a global temperature 2.0–4.0 °C warmer and a 10.0–25.0 meter higher sea level than today. To alleviate this continued warming (with an international goal <2.0 °C), a massive concerted effort is ongoing to develop CO<sub>2</sub> capture and sequestration technologies, and to implement strategies that improve combustion efficiency to attenuate CO<sub>2</sub> emissions.<sup>1</sup> At the same time, CO<sub>2</sub> is recognized as a nontoxic, inexpensive, and sustainable C<sub>1</sub> carbon source. Converting CO<sub>2</sub> directly into fuels and useful chemicals by harnessing renewable and clean energy, enables a transition from a fossil-based to a low- or net-zero-emission carbon economy. Electrochemical CO<sub>2</sub> reduction (ECR) is one such appealing route for driving CO<sub>2</sub>

chemical transformation, using water or other low-cost feedstocks as a source of protons without the need for fossil fuels and H<sub>2</sub>.<sup>2</sup> CO<sub>2</sub> electro-valorisation also has the benefit of not requiring centralized infrastructure, and thus can provide the ability to store intermittent and distributed renewable sources in a chemical energy product.

ECR was first attempted as early as the 1950s.<sup>3</sup> A subsequent work by Hori and co-workers in the 1980s addressed the quantification of the gaseous and liquid products.<sup>4</sup> After being static for nearly 10 years, the field was re-ignited in 2010 with the decreasing price of renewably generated electricity following the works by Peterson *et al.*<sup>5</sup> and Schouten *et al.*<sup>6</sup> Over the past three decades, a large body of research has been concentrated on searching for and developing advanced electrocatalysts to boost the rate (catalytic current density), efficiency (overpotential), selectivity (or faradaic efficiency, FE), and stability of CO<sub>2</sub> conversion.<sup>7</sup>

## State-of-the-art ECR performance

Over 16 reduction products have been identified from CO<sub>2</sub> electrolysis. Carbon monoxide (CO) and formic acid/formate (HCOOH/HCOO<sup>-</sup>), which requires two electron/proton transfers, can be selectively produced from ECR with

a corresponding FE approaching 100.0% using single-atom catalysts<sup>8</sup> and Bi-based materials,<sup>9</sup> respectively.

Other C<sub>1</sub> or C–C coupled products need transfers of 6–18 or more electrons and protons. A Cu-based metal–organic framework [Cu<sub>4</sub>ZnCl<sub>4</sub>(btdd)<sub>3</sub>] (Cu<sub>4</sub>-MFU-4l, H<sub>2</sub>btdd = bis(1*H*-1,2,3-triazolo-[4,5-*b*], [4',5'-*i*])dibenzo-[1,4]-dioxin) was reported to enable selective reduction of CO<sub>2</sub> to methane (CH<sub>4</sub>) in neutral aqueous electrolytes, yielding an FE of 92.0%/88.0% and a respectable partial current density of −9.8/−18.3 mA cm<sup>-2</sup> at −1.2/−1.3 V (*versus* (*vs.*) reversible hydrogen electrode (RHE)).<sup>10</sup> The largest FE for methanol (CH<sub>3</sub>OH) formation has been up to 97.0%, albeit with a very low partial current density (∼−0.6 mA cm<sup>-2</sup>), at −0.98 V (*vs.* saturated calomel electrode) on a Co(CO<sub>3</sub>)<sub>0.5</sub>(OH)·0.11H<sub>2</sub>O catalyst.<sup>11</sup> In an ionic liquid aqueous solution ([Bmim]BF<sub>4</sub>/H<sub>2</sub>O), the CH<sub>3</sub>OH partial current density can be improved to −67.0 mA cm<sup>-2</sup> at −2.0 V (*vs.* Ag/AgCl) on Sn-modified defective CuO.<sup>12</sup> The maximum FE toward ethanol (C<sub>2</sub>H<sub>5</sub>OH) also exceeds 90.0% with a small cathodic reduction current density (∼−1.1 mA cm<sup>-2</sup>) at −0.6 V (*vs.* RHE) on hydroxyl group-stabilized Cu<sub>3–4</sub> clusters.<sup>13</sup> The highest partial current density for the C<sub>2</sub>H<sub>5</sub>OH product was up to −423.3 mA cm<sup>-2</sup> under −0.56 V (*vs.* RHE) on F and K co-modified Cu.<sup>14</sup>

State Key Laboratory of Organic–Inorganic Composites, Beijing University of Chemical Technology, Beijing 100029, China. E-mail: zhenyus@mail.buct.edu.cn



Attaining ECR products with two or more carbons can pose a significant challenge. A conductive two-dimensional copper phthalocyanine-based covalent organic framework was demonstrated to catalyse the ECR to acetate ( $\text{CH}_3\text{COO}^-$ ) with an FE of 90.3% at  $-0.8$  V (vs. RHE).<sup>15</sup> Even greater efficiency has been achieved on indium using a Keggin type POM  $[\text{SiW}_9\text{V}_3\text{O}_{40}]^-$  ( $\text{SiW}_9\text{V}_3$ ) as a catholyte, with an unprecedented  $\text{CH}_3\text{COO}^-$  FE as high as 96.5% at  $-0.7$  V (vs. RHE).<sup>16</sup> Selective production of acetaldehyde ( $\text{CH}_3\text{CHO}$ ) with an FE of 60.0% was obtained at  $-0.4$  V (vs. RHE) using hexagonal-close-packed Co nanosheets.<sup>17</sup> To produce ethylene glycol ( $(\text{CH}_2\text{OH})_2$ ) from ECR, the two oxygen atoms in  $\text{CO}_2$  need to be retained. This has been accomplished using an imidazolium ion-terminated self-assembled monolayer-modified Au electrode, affording a  $(\text{CH}_2\text{OH})_2$  FE of 87.0% at  $-0.58$  V (vs. RHE).<sup>18</sup> Compared to other  $\text{C}_{2+}$  products, ethylene ( $\text{C}_2\text{H}_4$ ) is more easily fabricated at a high reduction rate, with an FE of 84.5% at  $-200$   $\text{mA cm}^{-2}$  on Cu/Cu<sub>2</sub>O interfaces in a flow cell.<sup>19</sup> On a nitrogen-doped  $\gamma\text{-Fe}_2\text{O}_3$  electrocatalyst, ethane ( $\text{C}_2\text{H}_6$ ) was obtained as the major product with an FE of 42.0% and partial current density of  $-32.0$   $\text{mA cm}^{-2}$  at  $-2.0$  V (vs. Ag/Ag<sup>+</sup>) in an H-cell.<sup>20</sup>

The production of propylene ( $\text{C}_3\text{H}_6$ ) has been rarely reported, which is due to the kinetic barriers associated with transferring the necessary 18 electrons and the easy desorption of the allyl alkoxy ( $\text{CH}_2=\text{CHCH}_2\text{O}$ ) intermediate in an alkaline microenvironment, causing an unfavourable yield of  $\text{C}_3\text{H}_6$ .<sup>21</sup> A partial current density of  $\sim -5.5$   $\text{mA cm}^{-2}$  toward  $\text{C}_3\text{H}_6$  formation with an FE of  $\sim 1.2\%$  was achieved at  $-0.65$  V (vs. RHE) on Cu nanocrystals consisting of Cu(100) and Cu(111) facets.<sup>21</sup> To date, the FE toward *n*-propanol ( $\text{C}_2\text{H}_5\text{CH}_2\text{OH}$ ) is less than 30.0%, with an absolute partial current density  $< 26.2$   $\text{mA cm}^{-2}$ .<sup>22</sup>  $\text{C}_3$  and  $\text{C}_4$  oxyhydrocarbons of methylglyoxal ( $\text{CH}_3\text{COCHO}$ ) and 2,3-furandiol have been produced on nickel phosphides with FEs reaching 84.0% and 70.0%, respectively.<sup>23</sup> But the absolute partial reduction current densities in both cases are lower than  $1.0$   $\text{mA cm}^{-2}$ . Likewise, although high-value *n*- $\text{C}_4\text{H}_9\text{OH}$ ,<sup>24</sup> 3-

hydroxybutanal ( $\text{CH}_3\text{CHOHCH}_2\text{CHO}$ ),<sup>24</sup> and *t*- $\text{C}_4\text{H}_9\text{OH}$  ( $(\text{CH}_3)_3\text{COH}$ )<sup>25</sup> products have been detected from ECR with an FE of 42.0%, 23.0%, and 14.8%, respectively, the corresponding absolute cathodic current densities in all cases is less than  $0.5$   $\text{mA cm}^{-2}$ .

## What's next for $\text{CO}_2$ electrolysis

Given the strikingly rapid decrease in the price of renewable electricity,  $\text{CO}_2$  electrolysis could be a cost-competitive technology to produce desired commodity chemicals in future global markets. Currently, the conversion of  $\text{CO}_2$  into CO is close to commercialization with designed pilot-scale electrolyzers. A zero-gap cell enables a CO FE of 97.0% at  $-200.0$   $\text{mA cm}^{-2}$  for over 3500.0 h at room temperature. The cathodic currents can be further improved to  $-1.5$   $\text{A cm}^{-2}$  by mildly lifting the electrolyser pressure and circulating alkaline aqueous solution through the anode. To enable this commercial transition, there are several threads of development that should be considered:

(i) Practically, waste  $\text{CO}_2$  from steel and cement fabrication and power plant flue gas (containing  $\text{SO}_x$  and  $\text{NO}_x$  impurities), or even atmospheric  $\text{CO}_2$ , would likely need to be utilized instead of pure  $\text{CO}_2$ . As a result, efficient and robust catalysts that can continue to function effectively in the presence of inevitable contaminants need to be developed.

(ii) To facilitate large-scale application of  $\text{CO}_2$ -to- $\text{C}_{2+}$  electrolysis, the energy penalties associated with electrolyzers and downstream separations need to be substantially reduced. To this end, boosting the selectivity for a target product and coupling with an alternative anode reaction with a lower positive equilibrium potential compared to the oxygen evolution reaction (OER) is desirable. Replacing the OER with a liquid-phase anodic process, such as the oxidation of 5-hydroxymethylfurfural, glycerol, other biomass polyols, and glucose, are especially preferred. This can result in high-purity re-generated  $\text{CO}_2$  at the anode, allowing for its direct recycling to the cathode to increase carbon

utilization. However, for these alternative anodic reactions to be practically used, the separation of the anode products from the anolyte needs to be considered.

(iii) Performing ECR with acidic electrolytes would help alleviate  $\text{CO}_3^{2-}/\text{HCO}_3^-$  formation and the loss of carbon efficiency that is found with alkaline and neutral electrolytes. This necessitates the design of a bimetallic Cu catalyst by maximizing the co-adsorption of CO and  $\text{CO}_2$  while suppressing H binding, or creating asymmetric  $^*\text{CO}$  adsorption and coverage on binary sites.

(iv) Membrane-electrode assemblies (MEAs) can greatly reduce ohmic resistance (from the catholyte) and improve current density permitting an industrial scale-up. Membranes that possess stability and high conductivity, while also maintaining highly selective diffusion, need to be developed for MEAs.

(v) A cascade reactor could be utilized to convert  $\text{CO}_2$  first to CO in an electrolyser, with the CO then further reduced to  $\text{C}_{2+}$  products (such as  $\text{CH}_3\text{COOH}/\text{CH}_3\text{COO}^-$ ) in a second electrolyser. This can enhance  $\text{CO}_2$  conversion and enable a high  $\text{C}_{2+}$  selectivity at industrially relevant current densities.

(vi) Fundamental research, which diagnoses the reaction kinetics and pathways, microenvironments, and the nature of catalytic active sites will aid in the design of electrolyzers and the optimization of operation conditions.

To expedite the commercialization of  $\text{CO}_2$  electrolysis, a system sustaining over 1000.0 h of stable operation at high current densities should be realized before implementation of a pilot plant. Note that for industrial-scale  $\text{CO}_2$  electrolyzers, the electrode areas are usually larger than  $5.0$   $\text{cm}^2$ , causing heating issues at high current densities. This effect on stability needs to be considered when looking at industrial scale-up of laboratory level reactors. Beyond  $\text{C}_2$  and  $\text{C}_3$  products, the conversion of  $\text{CO}_2$  to  $\text{C}_{4+}$  products remains a challenge, however the coupling of electrolysis and biocatalytic fermentation processes appears attractive for the production of long-chain fuels and chemicals.



## Acknowledgements

This work was supported by the National Natural Science Foundation of China (No. 21972010), National Key Research and Development Program of China (No. 2022YFC2105900), and the Fundamental Research Funds for the Central Universities (No. JD2310 and ZY2317).

## References

- 1 S. A. Matlin, G. Mehta, S. E. Cornell, A. Krief and H. Hopf, Chemistry and pathways to net zero for sustainability, *RSC Sustain.*, 2023, **1**, 1704.
- 2 Y. Yang, S. Louisia, S. Yu, J. B. Jin, I. Roh, C. B. Chen, M. V. F. Guzman, J. Feijoo, P. C. Chen, H. S. Wang, C. J. Pollock, X. Huang, Y. T. Shao, C. Wang, D. A. Muller, H. D. Abruna and P. D. Yang, Operando studies reveal active Cu nanograins for CO<sub>2</sub> electroreduction, *Nature*, 2023, **614**, 3523.
- 3 T. Teeter and P. V. Rysselberghe, Reduction of carbon dioxide on mercury cathodes, *J. Chem. Phys.*, 1954, **22**, 759.
- 4 Y. Hori, K. Kikuchi and S. Suzuki, Production of CO and CH<sub>4</sub> in electrochemical reduction of CO<sub>2</sub> at metal electrodes in aqueous hydrogencarbonate solution, *Chem. Lett.*, 1985, **14**, 1695.
- 5 A. A. Peterson, F. Abild-Pedersen, F. Studt, J. Rossmeisl and J. K. Nørskov, How copper catalyzes the electroreduction of carbon dioxide into hydrocarbon fuels, *Energy Environ. Sci.*, 2010, **3**, 1311.
- 6 K. J. P. Schouten, Y. Kwon, C. J. M. van der Ham, Z. Qin and M. T. M. Koper, A new mechanism for the selectivity to C<sub>1</sub> and C<sub>2</sub> species in the electrochemical reduction of carbon dioxide on copper electrodes, *Chem. Sci.*, 2011, **2**, 1902.
- 7 X. Li, Y. Chen, X. Zhan, Y. Xu, L. Hao, L. Xu, X. Li, M. Umer, X. Tan, B. Han, A. W. Robertson and Z. Sun, *Innov. Mater.*, 2023, **1**, 100014.
- 8 C. Lu, K. Jiang, D. Tranca, N. Wang, H. Zhu, F. Rodríguez-Hernández, Z. Chen, C. Yang, F. Zhang, Y. Su, C. Ke, J. Zhang, Y. Han and X. Zhuang, Electrochemical reduction of carbon dioxide with nearly 100% carbon monoxide faradaic efficiency from vacancy-stabilized single-atom active sites, *J. Mater. Chem. A*, 2021, **9**, 24955.
- 9 F. Yang, A. O. Elnabawy, R. Schimmenti, P. Song, J. Wang, Z. Peng, S. Yao, R. Deng, S. Song, Y. Lin, M. Mavrikakis and W. Xu, Bismuthene for highly efficient carbon dioxide electroreduction reaction, *Nat. Commun.*, 2020, **11**, 1088.
- 10 H.-L. Zhu, J.-R. Huang, X.-W. Zhang, C. Wang, N.-Y. Huang, P.-Q. Liao and X.-M. Chen, Highly efficient electroconversion of CO<sub>2</sub> into CH<sub>4</sub> by a metal-organic framework with trigonal pyramidal Cu(I)N<sub>3</sub> active sites, *ACS Catal.*, 2021, **11**, 11786.
- 11 J. Huang, Q. Hu, X. Guo, Q. Zeng and L. Wang, Rethinking Co(CO<sub>3</sub>)<sub>0.5</sub>(OH)·0.11H<sub>2</sub>O: a new property for highly selective electrochemical reduction of carbon dioxide to methanol in aqueous solution, *Green Chem.*, 2018, **20**, 2967.
- 12 W. Guo, S. Liu, X. Tan, R. Wu, X. Yan, C. Chen, Q. Zhu, L. Zheng, J. Ma, J. Zhang, Y. Huang, X. Sun and B. Han, Highly efficient CO<sub>2</sub> electroreduction to methanol through atomically dispersed Sn coupled with defective CuO catalysts, *Angew. Chem., Int. Ed.*, 2021, **60**, 21979.
- 13 H. Xu, D. Rebolgar, H. He, L. Chong, Y. Liu, C. Liu, C.-J. Sun, T. Li, J. V. Muntean, R. E. Winans, D.-J. Liu and T. Xu, Highly selective electrocatalytic CO<sub>2</sub> reduction to ethanol by metallic clusters dynamically formed from atomically dispersed copper, *Nat. Energy*, 2020, **5**, 623.
- 14 C. Peng, S. Yang, G. Luo, S. Yan, M. Shakouri, J. Zhang, Y. Chen, W. Li, Z. Wang, T.-K. Sham and G. Zheng, Surface Co-Modification of halide anions and potassium cations promotes high-rate CO<sub>2</sub>-to-ethanol electrosynthesis, *Adv. Mater.*, 2022, **34**, 2204476.
- 15 X.-F. Qiu, J.-R. Huang, C. Yu, Z.-H. Zhao, H.-L. Zhu, Z. Ke, P.-Q. Liao and X.-M. Chen, A stable and conductive covalent organic framework with isolated active sites for highly selective electroreduction of carbon dioxide to acetate, *Angew. Chem., Int. Ed.*, 2022, **61**, e202206470.
- 16 B. Zha, C. Li and J. Li, Efficient electrochemical reduction of CO<sub>2</sub> into formate and acetate in polyoxometalate catholyte with indium catalyst, *J. Catal.*, 2020, **382**, 69.
- 17 J. Yin, Z. Yin, J. Jin, M. Sun, B. Huang, H. Lin, Z. Ma, M. Muzzio, M. Shen, C. Yu, H. Zhang, Y. Peng, P. Xi, C.-H. Yan and S. Sun, A new hexagonal cobalt nanosheet catalyst for selective CO<sub>2</sub> conversion to ethanal, *J. Am. Chem. Soc.*, 2021, **143**, 15335.
- 18 J. Tamura, A. Ono, Y. Sugano, C. Huang, H. Nishizawa and S. Mikoshiba, Electrochemical reduction of CO<sub>2</sub> to ethylene glycol on imidazolium ion-terminated self-assembly monolayer-modified Au electrodes in an aqueous solution, *Phys. Chem. Chem. Phys.*, 2015, **17**, 26072.
- 19 W. Liu, P. Zhai, A. Li, B. Wei, K. Si, Y. Wei, X. Wang, G. Zhu, Q. Chen, X. Gu, R. Zhang, W. Zhou and Y. Gong, Electrochemical CO<sub>2</sub> reduction to ethylene by ultrathin CuO nanoplate arrays, *Nat. Commun.*, 2022, **13**, 1877.
- 20 P. Chen, P. Zhang, X. Kang, L. Zheng, G. Mo, R. Wu, J. Tai and B. Han, Efficient electrocatalytic reduction of CO<sub>2</sub> to ethane over nitrogen-doped Fe<sub>2</sub>O<sub>3</sub>, *J. Am. Chem. Soc.*, 2022, **144**, 14769.
- 21 J. Gao, A. Bahmanpour, O. Kröcher, S. M. Zakeeruddin, D. Ren and M. Grätzel, Electrochemical synthesis of propylene from carbon dioxide on copper nanocrystals, *Nat. Chem.*, 2023, **15**, 705.
- 22 T.-T. Zhuang, Z.-Q. Liang, A. Seifitokaldani, Y. Li, P. De Luna, T. Burdyny, F. Che, F. Meng, Y. Min, R. Quintero-Bermudez, C. T. Dinh, Y. Pang, M. Zhong, B. Zhang, J. Li, P.-N. Chen, X.-L. Zheng, H. Liang, W.-N. Ge, B.-J. Ye, D. Sinton, S.-H. Yu and E. H. Sargent, Steering post-C-C coupling selectivity enables high efficiency electroreduction of carbon dioxide to multi-carbon alcohols, *Nat. Catal.*, 2018, **1**, 421.
- 23 K. U. D. Calvino, A. B. Laursen, K. M. K. Yap, T. A. Goetjen, S. Hwang, N. Murali, B. Mejia-Sosa, A. Lubarski,



- K. M. Teeluck, E. S. Hall, E. Garfunkel, M. Greenblatt and G. C. Dismukes, Selective CO<sub>2</sub> reduction to C<sub>3</sub> and C<sub>4</sub> oxyhydrocarbons on nickel phosphides at overpotentials as low as 10 mV, *Energy Environ. Sci.*, 2018, **11**, 2550.
- 24 S. P. Cronin, S. Dulovic, J. A. Lawrence, K. A. Filsinger, A. P. Hernandez-Gonzalez, R. Evans, J. W. Stiles, J. Morris, I. Pelczer and A. B. Bocarsly, Direct synthesis of 1-butanol with high faradaic efficiency from CO<sub>2</sub> utilizing cascade catalysis at a Ni-enhanced (Cr<sub>2</sub>O<sub>3</sub>)<sub>3</sub>Ga<sub>2</sub>O<sub>3</sub> electrocatalyst, *J. Am. Chem. Soc.*, 2023, **145**, 6762.
- 25 M.-G. Kim, J. Park, Y. Choi, H. C. Song, S.-H. Kim, K.-M. Bang, H. C. Ham, N.-K. Kim, D. H. Won, B. K. Min, S. J. Yoo and W. Kim, CuIr nanoparticles for electrochemical reduction of CO<sub>2</sub> to *t*-BuOH, *Adv. Energy Mater.*, 2023, **13**, 2300749.

