This is an Accepted Manuscript, which has been through the Royal Society of Chemistry peer review process and has been accepted for publication.

Accepted Manuscripts are published online shortly after acceptance, before technical editing, formatting and proof reading. Using this free service, authors can make their results available to the community, in citable form, before we publish the edited article. We will replace this Accepted Manuscript with the edited and formatted Advance Article as soon as it is available.

You can find more information about Accepted Manuscripts in the Information for Authors.

Please note that technical editing may introduce minor changes to the text and/or graphics, which may alter content. The journal’s standard Terms & Conditions and the Ethical guidelines still apply. In no event shall the Royal Society of Chemistry be held responsible for any errors or omissions in this Accepted Manuscript or any consequences arising from the use of any information it contains.
Improved electrochemical performance of Na$_3$V$_2$(PO$_4$)$_3$ cathode by B-doping of carbon coating layer for sodium-ion batteries

Wei Shen$^a$, Hui Li$^d$, Cong Wang$^a$, Zhihong Li$^b$, Qunjie Xu$^b$, Haimei Liu$^{a,b,*}$, Yonggang Wang$^{c,*}$

$^a$State Key Laboratory of Chemical Resource Engineering, Beijing University of Chemical Technology, Beijing 100029, China

$^b$Shanghai Key Laboratory of Materials Protection and Advanced Materials in Electric Power, Shanghai University of Electric Power, Shanghai 200090, China

$^c$Department of Chemistry and Shanghai Key Laboratory of Molecular Catalysis and Innovative Materials, Fudan University, Shanghai 200433, China.

$^d$Beijing Key Laboratory of Environmental Science and Engineering, Beijing Institute of Technology, Beijing 100081, China.

* The authors to whom correspondence should be addressed, e-mail: liuhm@shiep.edu.cn (H. Liu), ygwang@fudan.edu.cn (Y. Wang)
Abstract: Boron-doped carbon coating is initially used to improve the electrochemical performance of Na$_3$V$_2$(PO$_4$)$_3$ cathode materials of sodium-ion batteries. Based on the precise analysis of Raman spectroscopy, electrochemical impedance spectroscopy and X-ray photoemission spectroscopy, it is found that there are four different B-doping species (B$_4$C, BC$_3$, BC$_2$O and BCO$_2$) in various Boron-doped carbon coated Na$_3$V$_2$(PO$_4$)$_3$ samples; moreover, different B-doping species in the carbon coated layer have different impacts on the improvement of the electrochemical performance of Na$_3$V$_2$(PO$_4$)$_3$. Compared to lithium-ion batteries, the mechanism of B-doped carbon coating on the improvement of the electrochemical performance in sodium-ion batteries are different. Due to the introduction of O atom in the carbon coated layer, BC$_2$O and BCO$_2$ significantly increase numerous extrinsic defects and active sites, which could significantly accelerate Na$^+$ transport in the carbon layer. Therefore, it is unexpectedly demonstrated that the Na$_3$V$_2$(PO$_4$)$_3$/C+B, in which with the largest total amounts of BC$_2$O + BCO$_2$, exhibits the best electrochemical performance, particularly the high-rate performance and cycling stability, as an example, when the discharging rate increased from 0.2 C to 5 C, it delivers 95.8 mAh g$^{-1}$ to 90.3 mAh g$^{-1}$ and an amazing capacity retention of 94% is achieved.

Introduction

It is undeniable that the world has to face energy management issues in recent years,\textsuperscript{1} for this reason, and taking into consideration recent concerns about a possible
lithium shortage with the spread of electronic devices and electric vehicles, it is highly 
desired to develop alternative energy storage systems that could complement the 
existing lithium-ion batteries (LIBs). For this purpose, sodium-ion batteries (SIBs) 
may be a suitable choice depending on battery cost, safety and raw material abundance. 
Therefore, in order to get more economic, safer, high energy density and long life 
batteries, it is of the greatest importance to search for and optimize new electrode 
materials for cathodes and anodes.2

Recently, active phosphates with NASICON structure, particularly sodium 
vanadium phosphate (Na$_3$V$_2$(PO$_4$)$_3$), have larger reversible gravimetric energy density 
(400 Wh/kg$^{-1}$, 117.6 mAh g$^{-1}$ × 3.4 V for the V$^{5+}$/V$^{4+}$ redox couple) than other related 
compounds, such as NaCoO$_2$, NaNiO$_2$ and Na$_3$Fe$_2$(PO$_4$)$_3$.3,4 Moreover, during the 
charge/discharge process, the large sodium ions (ionic radius 1.02 Å)$^5$ can be easily 
inserted into/extracted from Na$_3$V$_2$(PO$_4$)$_3$ because it possesses a large sodium site 
based on a 3D framework, as shown in Scheme 1. In this structure, the V$_2$(PO$_4$)$_3$ 
scaffold is built of each VO$_6$ octahedron links via corners sharing with three PO$_4$ 
tetrahedrons, whereas Na$^+$ are occupied two different sites. At low Na$^+$ content (x < 1 
in Na$_x$V$_2$(PO$_4$)$_3$) an octahedral site, Na1, is selectively occupied. With x > 1, the Na$^+$ 
are randomly distributed among the Na1 and three 8-coordinate sites, Na2. Moreover, 
both Na1 and Na2 are accommodated in large tunnels of different plane. Therefore, 
the open 3D nature of the structure allows easy migration of the Na$^+$ between Na1 and 
Na2.2 The theoretical discharge capacity of Na$_3$V$_2$(PO$_4$)$_3$ varies between 117.6 and
236 mAh g\(^{-1}\) depending on the voltage range and the variation between \(V^{3+}/V^{4+}\) and \(V^{2+}/V^{3+}\) redox states, corresponding to the voltage plateaus at 3.4 V and 1.6 V vs. Na\(^{+}\)/Na, respectively.\(^6,7\) However, the unfavorable electronic conductivity of phosphate framework restricts the high rate operation and cycling stability of Na\(_3\)V\(_2\)(PO\(_4\))\(_3\), which is similar to LiFePO\(_4\), Li\(_3\)V\(_2\)(PO\(_4\))\(_3\) and Li\(_2\)FeSiO\(_4\).\(^8-10\) Therefore, a new strategy is required to realize ultra-high power Na\(_3\)V\(_2\)(PO\(_4\))\(_3\) by enhancing its electronic conductivity.

One of the low cost and high-efficiency ways to improve the electronic conductivity of NASICON-structured cathode materials is to coat the conductive carbon layers on the surfaces of these materials.\(^11-15\) Compared with other kinds of surface coating approaches, carbon coating has many advantages: (1) the carbon coated layer can effectively enhance the electronic conductivity of electrode materials; (2) it can uniformly adhere to the surface of electrode materials, thus restricting the growth of particle of electrode materials; (3) it can also avoid the electrode materials direct contact with the electrolyte, thereby avoiding occurrence of side reaction.\(^16,17\) As a result, the electrochemical performance of the electrode materials will be obviously improved. Therefore, how to improve the electronic conductivity of carbon layer is highly desirable. At present, non-metallic elements doping which include nitrogen, boron and sulfur doping are widely used in carbon coated electrode materials in LIBs\(^9,18-22\) or pure carbon-based materials\(^23,24\) and exhibits excellent modification effects. In our previous work, a cathode material Li\(_3\)V\(_2\)(PO\(_4\))\(_3\) of LIBs
was modified by boron-doped carbon coating, and demonstrated that the graphite-like BC$_3$ dopant species played a huge role on improving the electronic conductivity and electrochemical activity. However, for SIBs, the related works are rarely reported, and moreover, whether the mechanism of boron-doing in SIBs is similar with the one in LIBs, and whether boron-doing in SIBs can also improve the electrochemical performance of electrode material as good as in LIBs, these are not having been systematically investigated and analyzed so far.

In this work, we firstly adopt boron doped carbon coating approach to modify the electrode materials of SIBs and explain in detail the causes of the modification effects. As a result, compared with the bare carbon coated Na$_3$V$_2$(PO$_4$)$_3$, boron-doped carbon coated Na$_3$V$_2$(PO$_4$)$_3$ composite exhibits a remarkable improvement in Na storage performance, especially its rate capability and cycling performance. Moreover, the relationship between the electrochemical performance of various boron-doped carbon coated samples and the doping species in carbon layer was analyzed and explained in detail in SIBs and LIBs.

**Experimental Section**

**Materials preparation**

Various kinds of NVP-C-B materials and NVP-C materials were synthesized by using of a sol-gel method, and NaOH, V$_2$O$_5$, H$_3$PO$_4$, citric acid and sodium tetraphenylborate (NaBC$_{24}$H$_{20}$) were used as raw materials. Citric acid and NaBC$_{24}$H$_{20}$ were used as carbon source and boron source, respectively. To synthesize the
NVP-C-B materials, citric acid and NaBC$_{24}$H$_{20}$ were dissolved in distilled water with continuous stirring at 80 °C and after being dissolved completely, NaOH, V$_2$O$_5$ and H$_3$PO$_4$ (85%wt.) in stoichiometric amounts were added into the above solution in turn under constant stirring. Meanwhile, the solution was continuously stirred and heated at 80 °C to form a uniform solution. The mixture was heated for several hours to evaporate the water until a green gel was generated from sol. After the transformation, the gel precursors were dried in an vacuum oven at 80 °C for at least 8 hours. The obtained powers were ground and pre-heated at 300 °C in nitrogen atmosphere for 4 h. Then, the powders were ground again and sintered at 850 °C in a nitrogen atmosphere for 8 h to obtain the final NVP-C-B material. To prepare the samples with different boron content, NVP-C-B with various molar ratios of B to C with 0.45 %, 0.75 % and 0.105 % were prepared and marked as NVP-C-B0.45%, NVP-C-B0.75% and NVP-C-B0.105%, respectively. For comparison, a controlled NVP-C sample was also prepared, and the synthetic method was the same as above-mentioned except for the addition of NaBC$_{24}$H$_{20}$.

Characterizations

Powder X-ray diffraction patterns of various NVP-C-B and NVP-C samples were performed at a scanning rate of 5 min$^{-1}$ in the 2θ range from 10 to 60° by using the D/max-Ultima III Diffractometer at 40 kV, 40 mA with Cu-Kα radiation ($λ = 0.154$ nm). The morphology and microstructure of the samples were characterized by using scanning electron microscopy (FE-SEM, Zeiss Supra 55) and energy-dispersive X-ray
spectroscopy (EDX). The HRTEM images were obtained using a high-resolution transmission electron microscope (Hitachi H-800). The structural property of NVP-C and various NVP-C-B samples were achieved on a labRAM ARAMIS laser Raman spectroscopy equipped with a 532 nm Ar-ion laser. The carbon content of the different samples were measured using organic element analyzer (Thermo Scientific, Flash 2000 series). The XPS spectra were performed at room temperature on a PHI Quantera SXM scanning X-ray microprobe with a 100 mm beam size, using an Al Ka (\(l = 0.83 \text{ nm, } h\nu = 1486.7 \text{ eV}\)) X-ray source operated at 2 kV and 20 mA.

**Electrochemical measurement**

Electrochemical performances of the NVP-C and various NVP-C-B samples were performed using 2032-type coin half-cells and using Na metal foil as the counter electrode. The work electrodes consisted of 80 wt.% of active material, 10 wt.% of carbon black, and 10 wt.% of a polyvinylidene difluoride (PVDF) dissolved in N-methylpyrrolidone as the binder. Then the slurry was spread onto aluminum foil and the electrodes were dried at 100 °C in vacuum for at least 10 h. The half cells were assembled in an Ar-filled glove box. The active material load in each coin cell was typically 2.0-2.5 mg cm\(^{-2}\). The electrolyte was 0.8 M NaClO\(_4\) in ethyl carbonate (EC) and diethyl carbonate (DEC) with the volumetric ratio of 1 : 1, and a polypropylene micro-porous film (Cell-gard 2300) was used as the separator. The assembled cells were cycled at different charge/discharge rates on a LAND CT2001A test system (Wuhan, China) at room temperature in the potential range of 2.7-4.0V.
(versus Na\(^+\)/Na). Before the charge/discharge measurements, the cells were pre-cycled three times. Electrochemical impedance spectroscopy (EIS) tests and cyclic voltammetry (CV) measurements were obtained on a CHI650D (Chenhua, Shanghai) electrochemical workstation.

**Results and discussion**

To confirm the effects of boron-doped carbon coating on the structure of Na\(_3\)V\(_2\)(PO\(_4\))\(_3\), XRD observations of the NVP-C and various NVP-C-B were tested and displayed in Fig. S1†. It is obvious that there is nearly no difference between NVP-C and various NVP-C-B samples, all the reflections could be well indexed to the R3-c space group and in good agreement with the framework of a rhombohedra NASICON structure, including the peak positions and intensities.\(^{25-27}\) Moreover, Rietveld refinements were also conducted for all the NVP samples (Fig. S2†). In this work, the refinements were carried out using the GSAS program suite. The data of calculated lattice parameters are listed in Tables S1†. It is demonstrated that the value of the a axis (a = b axis), c axis and the lattice volume are nearly no obvious difference for various Na\(_3\)V\(_2\)(PO\(_4\))\(_3\) samples, indicating B was not doped into Na\(_3\)V\(_2\)(PO\(_4\))\(_3\) structure and not affect its crystal structure. Besides, two relatively strong peaks (104) and (113) were selected and the ratios of \(I_{(104)}/I_{(113)}\) for various Na\(_3\)V\(_2\)(PO\(_4\))\(_3\) samples were calculated. The \(I_{(104)}/I_{(113)}\) for NVP-C, NVP-C-B0.24%, NVP-C-B0.38% and NVP-C-B0.51% are 0.6482, 0.6391, 0.6466 and 0.6522, respectively. It is noticed that the \(I_{(104)}/I_{(113)}\) of NVP-C and various NVP-C-B samples are very close to each other, that is also to say
boron-doped carbon coating does not affect the crystal structure of the Na$_3$V$_2$(PO$_4$)$_3$.

As shown in Fig. 1 and Supporting Information Fig. S3†, morphology and size of NVP-C and various NVP-C-B samples after annealing at 850 °C were further investigated by scanning electron microscopy (SEM). SEM images show that all the NVP-C and NVP-C-B samples have an irregular morphology and the average particle size are all about 1 to 2 µm. In other word, there is no difference on morphology between NVP-C and NVP-C-B. In order to confirm the composition and distribution of boron in the surface carbon coated layer, EDX mapping analysis was also carried out. Based on the EDX mapping images of B, C, Na, V and P elements in Fig. 1, it can be clearly observed that boron is successfully doped and the B-doped carbon coated layer was completely and uniformly distributed on the surface of Na$_3$V$_2$(PO$_4$)$_3$ particles, which is expected to provide facile electronic transport for the electrons in the charge/discharge process.

The detailed morphology and microstructure of the synthesized NVP-C and NVP-C-B0.38% were further explored by HRTEM, as shown in Fig. 2. It is noticeable that a homogeneous and uniform graphite-like amorphous carbon layer is formed on NVP-C and NVP-C-B0.38% surface, and the thickness is around 5 nm. Furthermore, the carbon contents of various Na$_3$V$_2$(PO$_4$)$_3$ composites in this report have been measured by the organic element analyzer. The carbon contents of NVP-C, NVP-C-B0.24%, NVP-C-B0.38% and NVP-C-B0.51% are about 8.60, 7.54, 6.43 and 5.44%, respectively. The HRTEM images and the selected area electron diffraction
(SAED) patterns in inset in Fig. 2b and d indicate the high crystallization character of both samples, and the marked lattice fringes with d-spacing of 0.251 and 0.373 nm corresponding to the (300) and (113) planes of the NASICON-type Na$_3$V$_2$(PO$_4$)$_3$.

In order to further observe the effects of B-doping on the defect level of various Na$_3$V$_2$(PO$_4$)$_3$ surface carbon layer, Raman spectra of NVP-C and various NVP-C-B samples are tested. It is obviously demonstrated in Fig. S4† that the Raman spectra of all samples show two conspicuous peaks of the disorder-induced phonon mode (D-band), graphite band (G-band) and a very weak 2D-band. Generally, the value of the intensity ratio of D-band to G-band ($I_D/I_G$) is used to estimate the degree of disorder and defects of carbon materials.$^{28,29}$ The values of $I_D/I_G$ for NVP-C, NVP-C-B0.24%, NVP-C-B0.38% and NVP-C-B0.51% are around 0.96, 1.02, 1.04 and 1.01, respectively. Obviously, the value of $I_D/I_G$ of all NVP-C-B samples are larger than that of NVP-C sample, indicating that more defects sites existed in the carbon coated layers in various NVP-C-B than in NVP-C, which is caused by the heterogeneous boron doping. However, it is noteworthy that the $I_D/I_G$ ratio of NVP-C-B0.38% is the highest in all four samples, indicating most defects sites are existed in NVP-C-B0.38% surface carbon coated layer. It is well-known that the ionic radius of Na$^+$ (1.02 Å) is much larger than Li$^+$ (0.76 Å) and the equivalent weight of Na is also higher than Li; therefore, compared with Li$^+$ diffusion, Na$^+$ diffusion across the interface between the electrolyte and electrode becomes more kinetically logy. Therefore, it is quite reasonable to imagine that the large amount of topological
defects sites produced by the boron doping, especially for the NVP-C-B0.38% sample, can be beneficial to Na$^+$ pass through and storage and thus further improve the electrochemical performance of NVP-C-B cathode materials.

In order to clarify the electrochemical intercalation behavior of Na ion, cyclic voltammetry for NVP-C and various NVP-C-B samples was performed in the potential window of 2.7-4.0 V at 0.09 mV/s, as shown in Fig. S5†. One couple of oxidation and the corresponding reduction peaks near 3.4 V can be observed, which are typical of Na-ion extraction and insertion with the $V^{4+}/V^{3+}$ redox couple. Obviously, all the oxidation peaks for various Na$_3$V$_2$(PO$_4$)$_3$ samples are almost located at 3.5 V; however, the potential of corresponding reduction peak for NVP-C is lower than those for all NVP-C-B samples, indicating that the larger polarization for NVP-C. Due to the slow scanning rate of 0.09 mV/s, the oxidation and the corresponding reduction peaks for various NVP-C-B samples are nearly no difference. Moreover, the CV for NVP-C-B0.38% was also performed in the potential window of 2.7-4.0 V with different scanning rates of 0.05, 0.07 and 0.09 mV/s, as exhibited in Fig. 3a. The oxidation peaks located at 3.457, 3.461 and 3.462 V, and corresponding reduction peaks are 3.254, 3.224 and 3.203 V at different scanning rates, respectively. The sharp peaks suggest the good reversibility of phase transformation from Na$_3$V$_2$(PO$_4$)$_3$ to NaV$_2$(PO$_4$)$_3$. The inset in Fig. 3a depicts the unit cell structures of typical two-phase reaction causing the change from the Na$_3$V$_2$(PO$_4$)$_3$ to the NaV$_2$(PO$_4$)$_3$ phase.30 In order to investigate the rate capability of NVP-C and various NVP-C-B electrodes at
different C-rates, an rate capability test from 0.2 to 5 C (where 1C corresponds to the complete discharge in 1h, 1 C = 117.6 mA g\(^{-1}\)) is conducted and shown in Fig. 3b). It is obvious that all NVP-C-B samples show much better rate capability than NVP-C; moreover, the doping content of boron in the carbon coated layer has an important impact on the electrochemical performances of NVP-C-B. Among the various NVP-C-B samples, NVP-C-B0.38% shows the best rate capability, followed by NVP-C-B0.24% and NVP-C-B0.51%. It must be point out that the variation tendency of electrochemical performance of various Na\(_3\)V\(_2\)(PO\(_4\))\(_3\) samples shows an unexcepted consistence with the variation of the intensity ratios of I\(_D\)/I\(_G\) in Raman spectra (Fig. S4†). That means the more extrinsic defects sites existed in the carbon coated layer, the better improvement of electrochemical performance of NVP-C-B electrodes. Fig. 3c shows a comparison of rate capability of the NVP-C and NVP-C-B electrodes from 0.2 C to 5 C. The NVP-C-B0.38% electrode with the best electrochemical performance could deliver high discharge capacities of 95.8 and 95.2 mAh g\(^{-1}\) at low rates of 0.2 and 0.5 C, respectively, which further demonstrates an excellent rate capability with a value of 93.1 at 1 C, 93.0 at 2 C, 93.0 at 3 C and 90.3 mAh g\(^{-1}\) at 5 C. When recycled at 3, 0.5 and 0.2 C, its discharge capacity can still reach 93.4, 93.8 and 93.9 mAh g\(^{-1}\), respectively. Compared with the initial rates, there is almost no specific capacity loss when recycled to the initial rates. Moreover, the discharge curves of NVP-C-B0.38% at various C-rates are further studied to confirm the excellent rate capability. It is apparent that the platform specific capacity of NVP-C-B0.38%
between small current densities and high current densities are almost similar as shown in Fig. 3d, and the potential polarization from 0.2, 0.5, 1, 2, 3 to 5 C are 0.09, 0.15, 0.18, 0.24, 0.28 and 0.36 V, respectively (inset in Fig. 3d). The rate performances of NVP-C-B cathode are clearly superior to most of recently reported Na$_3$V$_2$(PO$_4$)$_3$/C cathode materials prepared by solid-state and solution reaction routes.$^{7,30}$ For instance, a Na$_3$V$_2$(PO$_4$)$_3$/C cathode was synthesized by means of a polyol-assisted pyrosynthetic reaction, and its specific discharge capacities at 1.33 and 2.67 C were 88 and 65 mAh g$^{-1}$. Moreover, when the rate was increased to 5.33 C, the capacity was only approximately 25 mAh g$^{-1}$. Another Na$_3$V$_2$(PO$_4$)$_3$/C electrode with a novel one-dimensional (1D) nanostructure was prepared by electrospinning method, and its specific discharge capacities at 2 and 5 C were only 77 and 58 mAh g$^{-1}$.  

Furthermore, the cycle performance of NVP-C and NVP-C-B electrodes were further investigated at different discharge C-rates of 0.2, 1, 5 and 10 C, as shown in Fig. 4. It should be noted that in order to optimize the discharge capacity of various electrodes, a small charge C-rates of 0.2 C is employed. Obviously, all NVP-C-B electrodes exhibit much better electrochemical performances than NVP-C; moreover, the NVP-C-B0.38% also exhibits the best stable long-term cycle stability at different discharge C-rates. When cycled at small C-rates of 0.2 C and 1 C, the difference of the electrochemical performance between NVP-C and NVP-C-B electrodes is small; however, when cycled at high C-rates of 5 C and 10 C, the discharge specific capacity and cycle stability of NVP-C are far less than NVP-C-B electrodes. When the
NVP-C-B0.38% is cycled at 5 C (Fig. 4c), its initial capacity could reach up to 95.4 mAh g\(^{-1}\), after 50 cycles, its specific capacity is still 76.6 mAh g\(^{-1}\), which is much higher than the NVP-C with 78.2 mAh g\(^{-1}\) at first cycle, and 13.0 mAh g\(^{-1}\) at 50th cycles. Even at higher C-rates of 10 C (Fig. 4d), the NVP-C-B0.38% also exhibits the best rate capability and cycle stability, its discharge specific capacity exhibits better retention from an initial value of 87.1 mAh g\(^{-1}\), finally stabilized at 70.5 mAh g\(^{-1}\) at 50 cycles. In addition, the coulombic efficiency (calculated from the discharge/charge capacity) can reach up to approximately 100% in the overall battery operation, demonstrating a prominent high-rate cycling performance of NVP-C-B0.38% electrode.

Meanwhile, the cycle stability of NVP-C-B0.38% under 0.2 C and 10 C was further explored and presented in Fig. S6†. Fig. S6a† shows the typical initial charge/discharge profiles of NVP-C-B0.38% in the potential range of 2.7-4.0 V vs. Na\(^+\)/Na at 0.2 C, the initial specific capacity is 98.3 mA g\(^{-1}\), after 40 cycles, its specific capacity is still 96.6 mAh g\(^{-1}\); moreover, the charge/discharge profiles nearly no apparent change in the cycling test, including potential platform and discharge specific capacity. Furthermore, the obvious charge/discharge plateau is observed at 3.42/3.33 V at the first cycle, with only a little potential polarization (0.09 V) during the charge/discharge process. Even at higher current density of 10 C (Fig. S6b†), the NVP-C-B0.38% also exhibits the high-rate capability and stable long-term cycle stability; however, it must be pointed that under such a large discharge current density
of 10 C, the potential polarization obviously increases to 0.48 V.

In order to carefully analyze the chemical bonding between carbon and boron in the carbon-coated layer, X-ray photoemission spectroscopy (XPS) studies were examined. Moreover, based on the atom percents (At%) of carbon and boron in XPS data as well as the carbon contents of various NVP-C-B samples, the B-doping ratio in various NVP-C-B has been calculated, and the actual percentage composition of boron in NVP-C-B0.24%, NVP-C-B0.38% and NVP-C-B0.51% are 0.578%, 0.709% and 0.837%, respectively. Based on the C1s spectrum of NVP-C (Fig. 5a), the peak at binding energy of 284.6 eV belongs to the sp² graphite C=C bond. The other peaks at higher energy can be attributed to the sp³ carbon with some different C-O bonding configurations. These C-O bonding configurations contain the C-O bond at 285.8 eV, C=O bond at 287.8 eV and O=C-O bond at 289.3 eV. However, after boron doped in the carbon layer, an obvious new peak located at ~283.6 eV, which can be ascribed to the C-B species, is clearly appeared in C1s spectra for all NVP-C-B samples as shown in Fig. 5b-d. Moreover, with the gradual increase of the B content, the peak area of the C-B species exhibits the similar increase tendency; thus demonstrating the boron have been successfully doped into the interior carbon coated layer on different NVP-C-B samples. Besides, intensity of the peak ascribed to the C-O bond increases to a much higher value after boron doped in the carbon layer. The reason of the increase of C-O bond could be explained combined with the O1s spectra (Fig. S7†). In O1s spectrum of NVP-C (Fig. S7a†), the peak at around 532.0 eV
corresponds to the C=O bond. After boron doped in the carbon layer, the area of this peak obviously increases because of the appearance of new B-O bond. Therefore, based on the appearance of new B-O bond, a large number of O enter into the interior carbon layer, resulting into the increase of C-O bond in Fig. 5b-d. These results, once again, certify that the boron have been successfully doped into interior carbon layer on the NVP-C-B surface. Due to the boron-doping within a certain doping ratio can efficiently increase the electronic conductivity of the carbon coated layer on the electrode material, it is easy to understand that the electrochemical performance of different NVP-C-B samples are much better than that of the bare NVP-C.

Now, in order to clarify why NVP-C-B0.38% exhibits the optimal performance in all doped samples, boron-doping species and accurate contents of boron presented in various NVP-C-B were proved by XPS as depicted in Fig. 6. The XPS results of B1s for various NVP-C-B are carefully analyzed and compared with each other. As is shown in Fig. 6a, c and e, the B1s spectra of various NVP-C-B samples are all divided into four main contributions: the peak at the lowest binding energy ~187.9 eV belongs to B4C type bond, the peak at ~190.1 eV is assigned to BC3 type bond and the peaks at ~191.1 eV and ~192.2 eV are correspond to the BC2O and BCO2 type bonds, respectively. It can be clearly seen that for all NVP-C-B samples, the distribution and contents of various B-C bond types are different. Therefore, according to the above analysis of the XPS, the idealized schematic structures for the surface carbon layer of B-doping are depicted in Fig. 7a. As shown in Fig. 6b, d and f, compared with other
three B types (BC$_3$, BC$_2$O and BCO$_2$), the peak intensity of the B$_4$C doped type in various NVP-C-B samples are all relatively low and this B$_4$C type bond is accompanied by defects inside the carbon layer.$^{36}$ Therefore, taking into account the low content of B$_4$C doped type (below 4%), this doped type makes relatively little impact on the improvement of electrochemical performance of various NVP-C-B samples. Another peak is graphite-like BC$_3$, the formation of BC$_3$ is substituting a carbon atom by B atom on edges or inside without damaging of the carbon skeletons. Therefore, this BC$_3$ doped type only improves the electronic conductivity of various NVP-C-B samples without accelerating the Na$^+$ diffusion across the carbon coated layer. As for the BC$_2$O and BCO$_2$, although the introduction of heteroatom O atom is not beneficial to increase the electronic conductivity of the carbon layer, this two doped types could remarkably create numerous extrinsic defects and active sites, which could allow rapid surface Na$^+$ absorption and ultrafast Na$^+$ diffusion in the carbon coated layer. Therefore, in various NVP-C-B samples, the NVP-C-B0.38% with the largest total amount of BC$_2$O + BCO$_2$ (66.6% for NVP-C-B0.24%, 79.8% for NVP-C-B0.38% and 65.2% for NVP-C-B0.51%), shows the best electrochemical performance, followed by NVP-C-B0.24% and NVP-C-B0.51%, and this also shows a high degree of consistency with the I$_D$/I$_G$ ratio of Raman spectra (Fig. S4†).

However, it must be point out that the mechanism of B-doped carbon coating for the improvement of the electrochemical performance in SIBs and LIBs are different. In LIBs, due to the ionic radius of Li$^+$ is much smaller than Na$^+$, the Li$^+$ could freely
pass through the graphite-like amorphous carbon coated layer. But for SIBs, the graphite-like carbon coated layer has a strong resistance for Na\(^+\) insertion/extraction.\(^{37}\) Therefore, in LIBs, B-doped carbon coated electrode material with the largest amount of BC\(_3\) or the minimize total content of BC\(_2\)O + BCO\(_2\) exhibits the best electrochemical performance.\(^9\) However, in SIBs, the NVP-C-B with the largest total amount of BC\(_2\)O + BCO\(_2\) exhibits the best electrochemical performance. In other word, the extrinsic defects caused by B-doping in the carbon coated layer could accelerate Na\(^+\) diffusion, and as a result, the electrochemical performance is improved obviously. Fig. 7b shows a visual schematic illustration of Na\(^+\) diffuse across the B-doped carbon coated layer in NVP-C-B sample. Based on the above analysis, the NVP-C-B0.38% with the largest diffusion velocity of Na\(^+\) shows the best electrochemical performance in all NVP-C-B samples.

To explore the effects of B-doped carbon coating on electronic conductivity, the electronic conductivity measurement was carried out using a RTS-4 linear four-point probe measurement system. The values of NVP-C, NVP-C-B0.24%, NVP-C-B0.38% and NVP-C-B0.51% powders are 2× 10\(^{-4}\), 1.32× 10\(^{-2}\), 5.29× 10\(^{-3}\) and 2.06× 10\(^{-3}\). Obviously, after B-doped into the carbon layer, the electronic conductivity of all NVP-C-B samples are higher than that of NVP-C, indicating B-doped carbon coating is conducive to increasing the electronic conductivity of Na\(_3\)V\(_2\)(PO\(_4\))\(_3\) composites.

Furthermore, to investigate the positive effect of boron doped carbon coating on kinetics of the electrode process, electrochemical impedance spectroscopy (EIS)
measurements of NVP-C and various NVP-C-B samples are performed. Fig. 8a shows the Nyquist plots and equivalent circuit of the various samples, which are collected in a 10 mV AC potential signal in the frequency range of 1 MHz to 10 mHz at full charge state (4.0 V) after four charge/discharge cycles. All curves include a semicircle in the high-frequency and a straight-line in the low frequency, indicating that the electrochemical process is controlled by both charge transfer and diffusion of sodium ion. To further analyze impedance spectra, the EIS spectra are fitted with the equivalent circuit model, as shown in the inset of Fig. 8a. The $R_s$ and CPE represent the electrolyte resistance, double layer capacitance and capacity of the surface layer, respectively. $R_{ct}$ is the charge transfer resistance. The Warburg impedance ($W_o$) represents the diffusion behavior at low frequency. The simulated data from the equivalent circuit model well fit the impedance data for both NVP-C and NVP-C-B samples. The EIS parameters of NVP-C and various NVP-C-B electrodes obtained from fitting are listed in Table 1. As it can be seen in Table 1, $R_s$ of NVP-C is similar with various NVP-C-B samples; however, $R_{ct}$ of NVP-C are much higher than those of NVP-C-B electrodes. Moreover, the NVP-C-B0.38% exhibits the lowest $R_{ct}$ in three NVP-C-B samples. These results confirm that the B-doped carbon coating could effectively increase the electron conductivity of Na$_3$V$_2$(PO$_4$)$_3$ composites. Furthermore, the diffusion coefficient ($D_{Na^+}$) of sodium ions can be calculated from the plots in the low frequency region, and the equation can be expressed as

$$D = \frac{R^2 T^2}{2 A^2 n^2 F^2 C^2 \sigma^2}$$

(1)
\[ Z_{\text{re}} = R_e + R_{\text{ct}} + \sigma \omega^{1/2} \]  

(2)

where \( R \) is the gas constant, \( T \) is the absolute temperature, \( A \) is the surface area of the cathode, \( n \) is the number of electrons per molecule during oxidization, \( F \) is the Faraday constant, and \( C \) is the concentration of sodium ions \( (3.47 \times 10^{-3}) \text{ mol cm}^{-3} \), which can be calculated from the density and the molecular weight. \( \sigma \) is the Warburg factor which is related to \( Z_{\text{re}} \) (shown in equation (2)) and \( \rho \) and \( M \) are the density and the molecular weight of the materials, respectively. Fig. 8b displays the relationship between \( Z_{\text{re}} \) and the reciprocal square root of frequency \( (\omega^{-1/2}) \) in the low frequency region and the value of \( \sigma \) for NVP-C and various NVP-C-B are exhibited in Table 1.

The calculated diffusion coefficients of the sodium ions \( (D_{\text{Na}^+}) \) of NVP-C and various NVP-C-B are shown in Table 2. Notably, the \( D_{\text{Na}^+} \) of various NVP-C-B are higher than that of NVP-C, indicating after B-doping in the carbon coated layer, numerous extrinsic defects and active sites are created, which could allow rapid surface \( \text{Na}^+ \) absorption and ultrafast \( \text{Na}^+ \) diffusion in the carbon coated layer. But more importantly, the NVP-C-B0.38% exhibits the largest \( D_{\text{Na}^+} \) in all three NVP-C-B samples, suggesting that the most extrinsic defects are existed in NVP-C-B0.38%, and this also exhibits a high consistency with the I_D/I_G ratio of Raman spectra and XPS spectra of B1s.

**Conclusions**

In conclusion, we initially utilized a facile sol-gel method to prepare a B-doped carbon-coated \( \text{Na}_3\text{V}_2(\text{PO}_4)_3 \) cathode material for SIBs, and found that, after
modification by boron doping, four common B-doping species: $B_4C$, $BC_3$, $BC_2O$ and $BCO_2$ are normally obtained in the carbon layer. The mechanism of B-doped carbon coating for the improvement of the electrochemical performance in SIBs and LIBs are different. In SIBs, the more amount of $BC_2O + BCO_2$ existed, the better of electrochemical performance obtained, in other word, the most of extrinsic defects are existed in NVP-C-B, this NVP-C-B displays superior rate capacity and excellent cycle stability when they are used as cathode material for sodium storage. The suitable B-doped carbon coating not only increase the electronic conductivity of electrode materials, but also create numerous extrinsic defects and active sites which allow rapid surface $Na^+$ absorption and ultrafast $Na^+$ diffusion in the carbon layer. Therefore, this work tell us, through the creation of a large number of defect sites on the carbon coating layer can improve the electrochemical propeties of electrode materials of SIBs, especially the rate performance.

Acknowledgements

This work was financially supported by the National Nature Science Foundation of China (No. 51102010, 21336003, 21371021), the Program for New Century Excellent Talents in University of China (NCET-12-0758) and Science and Technology Commission of Shanghai Municipality (No: 14DZ2261000).

Notes and references

Scheme 1. Crystal structure of NASICON-type $\text{Na}_3\text{V}_2(\text{PO}_4)_3$, 3D framework of a) ~ b) Na1 site and c) ~ d) Na2 site.
Fig. 1 SEM images of a) NVP-C and b) NVP-C-B0.38% samples, and the EDX mapping images of the NVP-C-B0.38% sample.
Fig. 2 HRTEM images of a) and b) NVP-C, c) and d) NVP-C-B0.38% samples.
**Fig. 3** The electrochemical performances of as-fabricated NVP-C and various NVP-C-B electrode materials, a) cyclic voltammograms (CV) curves at various scan rates, b) the discharge capacities obtained at various C-rates, c) comparison of the rate capability, d) the potential profiles of NVP-C-B0.38% at various C-rates. All the tests were performed in the potential window of 2.7~4.0 V (vs. Na⁺/Na).
Fig. 4 The electrochemical performances of as-fabricated NVP-C and various NVP-C-B electrode materials, cycle performances at a) 0.2 C, b) 1C and c) 5 C, d) coulombic efficiency and cycle performance at 10 C.
Fig. 5 a-d) High-resolution XPS spectra of C1s for the NVP-C and various NVP-C-B samples.
**Fig. 6** High-resolution XPS spectra of B1s for the a) NVP-C-B0.24%, c) NVP-C-B0.38%, e) NVP-C-B0.51% and b), d), f) corresponding the histogram for ratio of different B species in various NVP-C-B samples.
Fig. 7 a) Schematic structure of the bonding conditions of B in a carbon lattice, B1:B₄C, B2:BC₃, B3:BC₂O and B4:BCO₂; b) a schematic illustration of sodium ion storage mechanism in the NVP-C-B composite electrode.
Fig. 8 a) Nyquist plots of NVP-C sample and various NVP-C-B samples at a stage of charge (4.0 V), b) the relationship between Zre and $\omega^{1/2}$ in the low frequency region.
Table 1. EIS parameters for NVP-C and various NVP-C-B samples obtained from equivalent circuit of EIS results.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Entry</th>
<th>NVP-C</th>
<th>NVP-C-B0.24%</th>
<th>NVP-C-B0.38%</th>
<th>NVP-C-B0.51%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Rs/ohm</td>
<td>9.275</td>
<td>5.951</td>
<td>6.662</td>
<td>6.248</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rct/ohm</td>
<td>2554</td>
<td>1095</td>
<td>784</td>
<td>1504</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CPE/F</td>
<td>2.141E-5</td>
<td>1.628E-5</td>
<td>2.11E-5</td>
<td>1.302E-5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>W/\omega S^{-0.5}</td>
<td>0.003002</td>
<td>0.005409</td>
<td>0.01155</td>
<td>0.008226</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>\sigma/ohm cm^{2} S^{-0.5}</td>
<td>106.3</td>
<td>82.7</td>
<td>42.7</td>
<td>96.5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

a) The EIS measurements of all samples are all carried out in the frequency range of 1MHz to 10mHz at the charge state (4.0V).

b) \sigma, the slope of the Zre versus \omega^{-1/2} plot.
Table 2. The calculated diffusion coefficients of the sodium ions ($D_{Na^+}$) of NVP-C and various NVP-C-B samples.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Samples</th>
<th>NVP-C</th>
<th>NVP-C-B0.24%</th>
<th>NVP-C-B0.38%</th>
<th>NVP-C-B0.51%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>$D_{Na^+}$ (cm$^2$/s)</td>
<td>$4.0 \times 10^{-14}$</td>
<td>$6.63 \times 10^{-14}$</td>
<td>$2.48 \times 10^{-13}$</td>
<td>$4.92 \times 10^{-14}$</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Boron-doped carbon coated Na$_3$V$_2$(PO$_4$)$_3$ is prepared, and different impacts of various carbon-boron species on the improvement of electrochemical performance for sodium and lithium ion batteries are analyzed and discussed in this work.